بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

http://www.valiasr-aj.com/fa/page.php?bank=question&id=6047

# Was Lady Fatimah (as) satisfied with Umar and Abu-Bakr when she passed away?

## *The argument usually put forward:*

Even if we accept that Fatima (ra) was angry with the Sheikhain (Abu-Bakr and Umar) for a period of time, it is clear that they visited her a few days before her death and made her pleased with themselves. Al-Bayhaqi and others have narrated from al-Sha'bi:

> **"When Fatima (as) became ill, Abu Bakr visited her and asked for permission to see her. Ali (as) said to Fatima (as): 'Abu-Bakr is asking for permission to visit you.' Fatima (as) said: 'Would you like me to give him permission?" Ali (as) said: 'Yes', so Fatima (as) granted him permission and Abu-Bakr entered with the intention of pleasing her (as). He said: 'By Allah (SWT), I did not leave my house, wealth, family and relatives, but to please Allah (SWT), His Messenger and you Ahl al-Bayt.' Then he requested that she be pleased with him, and so she became pleased with him."** [1]
>
> Al-Bayhaqi, *Dala'il al-Nubuwwa*, vol. 7, p. 281
> Al-Bayhaqi, *al-I'itiqad Wal-Hidaya*, vol. 1, p. 354

## *Answer:*

The anger of Lady Fatima (as) at the Sheikhain (Abu Bakr and Umar) questions the pillars of the legitimacy of their caliphate as it proves that the relic of the Prophet (PBUH&HF), the Lady of both worlds, and the Mistress of women in paradise was against the leadership of Abu-Bakr and Umar and was dissatisfied and angry with them. Based on authentic Sunni sources, her satisfaction is the satisfaction of Allah's Messenger (PBUH&HF), and her anger is his anger.

Therefore Sunni scholars decided to fabricate a story to show that after Abu-Bakr and Umar enraged the daughter of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF), they visited her during the last days of her life to ask her to be pleased with them, and so she became pleased with them.

This story can be easily disproved:

**First:** The narration is *Mursal* (has people missing in the chain of narrators). Al-Sha'bi is amongst the *Tabe'in* (those who were born after the Prophet (PBUH&HF) passed away) and he himself was not a witness to the event and he does not mention from who he transmits this narration. Therefore this narration has the same problem that Sunnis attribute to the narrations of al-Baladhuri and al-Tabari.

**Second:** Even if we suppose that the chain of narrators is not flawed, we still cannot accept the narrations of al-Sha'bi, as he was amongst the enemies of Amir al-Mu'minin (as) and was a *Nasebi* (those who swear to the Ahl al-Bayt and Imams). Al-Baladhuri and al-Ghazali narrate from al-Sha'bi that he himself has said:

> **"In Basra we went to see al-Hajjaj (ibn Yusof) and a group of Medina's reciters from the children of the Muhajirin and Ansar whom Abu-Salma ibn Abdul-Rahman ibn 'Ouf -may Allah be satisfied with him- was also among, came to see him too… Al-Hajjaj was talking to them and discussing things with them and then Ali ibn Abi Talib (as) was mentioned. And he (Abu-Salma) insulted Him (Ali) and we also insulted him (Ali) to please him (al-Hajjaj) and be safe from his wickedness…" [2]**
> Al-Baladhuri, Ansab al-Ashraf, vol. 4, p. 315
> Al-Ghazali, Ihyaa' Uloom al-din, vol. 2, p. 346

Can the narration of a *Nasebi* be proof for us?

## *The anger of Lady Fatima (as) at Abu-Bakr from the most authentic Sunni book:*

**Third:** The anger of Lady Fatima (as) at Abu Bakr is evident and undeniable. Bukhari, talks about the continued anger of Lady Fatima (as) at Abu-Bakr in the most reliable Sunni book:

> **"Fatima, the daughter of Allah's apostle became angry at Abu-Bakr and broke all connections with him and continued that attitude until she died." [3]**
> Al-Bukhari, *Sahih al-Bukhari*, vol. 3, p. 1126, no. 2926
> English translation of Sahih Bukhari, Volume 4, Book 53, Number 325, Available Online (Note: In the online translation the word 'Hajara' has been translated to 'not speaking with someone', the correct translation is 'breaking all connections with someone')

Bukhari also narrates:

> **"So she (Fatima (as)) became angry with Abu Bakr and kept away from him, and did not speak to him till she died." [4]**
> Al-Bukhari, *Sahih al-Bukhari*, vol. 4, p. 1549, no. 3998
> English translation of Sahih Bukhari, Volume 5, Book 59, Number 546, Available Online

And also:

> **"Therefore Fatima left Abu-Bakr and did not speak to him till she died." [5]**
> Al-Bukhari, *Sahih al-Bukhari*, vol. 6, p. 2474, no. 6346
> English translation of Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 8, Book 80, No. 718, Available Online

Ibn Qutaybah narrates that when Abu-Bakr and Umar came to visit her, she did not give them permission to enter. They asked Ali (as) so when Imam Ali (as) asked Lady Fatima (as), she answered:

> **"This house is your house"**

As if saying: "O Ali! The house is your house; you can allow whoever you like to enter."

Amir al-Mu'minin (as), in order to make issues clear and to avoid Abu-Bakr and Umar from accusing him of not allowing them to visit and please Fatima (as), allowed them into his home.

When they apologized, Lady Fatima (as) didn't accept their apologies, rather she asked them:

> **"I ask you by Allah, didn't you hear the Prophet of Allah (PBUH&HF) say: 'The satisfaction of Fatima is of my satisfaction and her anger is of my anger, whoever loves Fatima, my daughter, has loved me and whoever pleases Fatima has pleased me and whoever makes her angry has made me angry '"**

They both admitted:

> **"Yes, we heard this from Allah's Messenger."**

Then Lady Fatima (as) said:

> **"<u>So I hold Allah (SWT) and the angels (as) witness that you two have enraged me and have not pleased me, and I will complain against you to the Prophet (PBUH&HF) when I meet him.</u>"**

However, she did not stop there and continued to say:

> **"By Allah (SWT) I will make prayer to Allah against you in every *Salat* (prayer) I make." [6]**
> Al-Dinawari, *al-Imama Wal-Siyasa,* vol. 1, p. 17

Therefore, how can we ever believe that Lady Fatima (as) was pleased with them? Is the narration of Bukhari more reliable or the one from al-Bayhaqi? Is a *mursal* narration from an enemy of Amir al-Mu'minin (as) whom himself was not a witness to the event acceptable, whilst many narrations in Bukhari contradict it?

**Fourth:** Another inquiry is this: If Lady Fatima (as) became pleased with them, why did she make a will to be buried at night and none of those who oppressed her be informed of her funeral?

Bukhari has narrated:

> **"She (Fatima) remained alive for six months after the death of the Prophet (PBUH&HF). When she died, her husband Ali, buried her at night without informing Abu-Bakr and he said the funeral prayer by himself." [7]**
> Al-Bukhari, *Sahih al-Bukhari*, vol. 4, p. 1549, no. 3998
> English translation of Sahih Bukhari, Volume 5, Book 59, Number 546, Available Online

Ibn Qutaybah writes:

> **"And Fatima (as) demanded Abu-Bakr for her inheritance from her father the prophet (PBUH&HF), and when he didn't give it to her, <u>she swore never to speak to him again, and made a will to be buried at night so he wouldn't participate (in her funeral). So she was buried at night.</u>" [8]**
> Al-Dinawari, *Ta'wil Mukhtalif al-Hadith*, vol. 1, p. 300

Abdul-Razzaq al-San'aani narrates from Hassan bin Muhammad:

> **"Fatima (as) the daughter of the Prophet (PBUH&HF) was buried at night. Ali (as) kept her away from Abu-Bakr so he couldn't perform the burial prayer for her, as there were problems between them." [9]**
> Al-San'aani, *al-Munsif*, vol. 3, p. 521, no. 6554

He then repeats the same narration from another narrator with the difference that:

> **"In this one it is narrated that Fatima (as) made her will (to Ali (as)) to be buried at night." [10]**
> Al-San'aani, *al-Munsif*, vol. 3, p. 521, no. 6555

Some may say Abu-Bakr regretted his actions later on and repented, but in return we say repentance is useful and worthy when it comes from the bottom of one's heart and on the other hand they should also mend the past. One who repents must make up and compensate for what he has done and must give back all that he has taken or withheld. So now we ask, did Abu Bakr return Fadak to Lady Fatima (as) or her inheritors to have his repentance accepted?

## *Conclusion:*

The anger of Lady Fatima (as) at the Sheikhain until the end of her life is an undeniable fact mentioned numerous times in Sahih Bukhari, the most authentic Sunni book after the Holy Quran. The narration of al-Bayhaqi is rejected because it is *mursal,* has a *Nasebi* in its chain of narrators, and contradicts the narrations of Bukhari.

## *References:*


**[1] Back**

- Al-Bayhaqi, Ahmad ibn al-Hussein (d. 458 H), Dala'il al-Nubuwwa (Evidences of Prophet-hood), vol. 7, p. 281
- Al-Bayhaqi, Ahmad Bin al-Hussein (d. 458 H), al-I'itiqad Wal-Hidaya Ila Sabil al-Rashad Ala Madhhab al-Salaf Wa As-hab al-Hadith (Belief and Guidance to the Way of Rationality on the Sect of the Salaf and People of the Hadith), vol. 1, p. 354, investigation/study: Ahmad Isam al-Katib, publisher: Dar al-Afaq al-Jadida – Beirut, 1st edition, 1401 H

- البيهقي، احمد بن الحسين (متوفاي 458هـ) دلائل النبوة، ج 7،ص 281
- البيهقي، احمد بن الحسين (متوفاي 458هـ) الاعتقاد والهداية إلى سبيل الرشاد على مذهب السلف وأصحاب الحديث، ج 1،ص 354، تحقيق: أحمد عصام الكاتب، ناشر: دار الآفاق الجديدة – بيروت، الطبعة: الأولى، 1401هـ.


**«عن الشعبي قال لما مرضت فاطمة أتاها أبو بكر الصديق فأستئذن عليها فقال علي يا فاطمة هذا أبو بكر يستئذن عليك فقالت أتحب أن أأذن؟ قال نعم فأذنت له فدخل عليها يترضاها وقال والله ما تركت الدار والمال والأهل والعشيرة إلا لإبتغاء مرضاة الله ومرضاة رسوله ومرضاتكم أهل البيت ثم ترضاها حتى رضيت»**

---


**[2] Back**

- Al-Baladhuri, Ahmad ibn Yahya ibn Jabir (d. 279 H), Ansab al-Ashraf, vol. 4, p. 315
- Al-Ghazali, Muhammad Bin Muhammad Abu-Haamid (d. 505 H), Ihyaa' Uloom al-din, vol. 2, p. 346, publisher: Dar al-Ma'rifah – Beirut.

- البلاذري، أحمد بن يحيى بن جابر (متوفاي279هـ) أنساب الأشراف، ج 4، ص 315؛
- الغزالي، محمد بن محمد أبو حامد (متوفاي505هـ)، إحياء علوم الدين، ج 2، ص 346، ناشر: دار المعرفة – بيروت .

**«عن مجالد عن الشعبي قال: قدمنا على الحجاج البصرة، وقدم عليه قراء من المدينة من أبناء المهاجرين والأنصار، فيهم أبو سلمة بن عبد الرحمن بن عوف رضي الله عنه... وجعل الحجاج يذاكرهم ويسألهم إذ ذكر علي بن أبي طالب فنال منه ونلنا مقاربة له وفرقاً منه ومن شره....»**

---

**[3]** **Back**

- Al-Bukhari al-Ju'fi, Abu-Abdullah Muhammad ibn Ismail (d. 256 H), *Sahih al-Bukhari*, vol. 3, p. 1126, no. 2926 Kitab al-Maghazi (Book of Meanings), on the topic of the prophet's (PBUH&HF) illness and death, investigation/study: Dr. Mustafa Dib al-Bagha, publisher: Dar ibn Kathir, al-Yamamah – Beirut, 3rd edition, 1407 H / 1987 AD
- ***English Translation of Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 4, Book 53 (***One-fifth of Booty to the Cause of Allah (Khumus)***), No. 325, translated by: M. Muhsin Khan***

- البخاري الجعفي، محمد بن إسماعيل أبو عبدالله (متوفاي256هـ)، صحيح البخاري، ج 3،ص 1126، ح2926، باب فَرْضِ الْخُمُسِ، تحقيق د. مصطفى ديب البغا، ناشر: دار ابن كثير، اليمامة – بيروت، الطبعة: الثالثة، 1407 - 1987 .

**«فَغَضِبَتْ فَاطِمَةُ بِنْتُ رسول اللَّهِ صلى الله عليه وسلم فَهَجَرَتْ أَبَا بَكْرٍ فلم تَزَلْ مُهَاجِرَتَهُ حتى تُوُفِّيَتْ»**

---

**[4]** **Back**

- Al-Bukhari al-Ju'fi, Abu-Abdullah Muhammad ibn Ismail (d. 256 H), *Sahih al-Bukhari*, vol. 4, p. 1549, no. 3998 Kitab al-Maghazi (Book of Meanings), on the topic of "the prophet's (PBUH&HF) illness and death", investigation/study: Dr. Mustafa Dib al-Bagha, publisher: Dar ibn Kathir, al-Yamamah – Beirut, 3rd edition, 1407 H / 1987 AD
- ***English Translation of Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 5, Book 59 (Military Expeditions led by the Prophet (pbuh) (Al-Maghaazi)), No. 546, translated by: M. Muhsin Khan***

- البخاري الجعفي، محمد بن إسماعيل أبو عبدالله (متوفاي256هـ)، صحيح البخاري، ج 4، ص 1549، ح3998، كتاب المغازي، باب غزوة خيبر، تحقيق د. مصطفى ديب البغا، ناشر: دار ابن كثير، اليمامة – بيروت، الطبعة: الثالثة، 1407 - 1987 .

**«فَوَجَدَتْ فَاطِمَةُ على أبي بَكْرٍ في ذلك فَهَجَرَتْهُ فلم تُكَلِّمْهُ حتى تُوُفِّيَتْ»**

---

**[5]** **Back**

- Al-Bukhari al-Ju'fi, Abu-Abdullah Muhammad ibn Ismail (d. 256 H), *Sahih al-Bukhari*, vol. 6, p. 2474, no. 6346, Kitab al-Faraa'id (Book of Obligatory Things), on the topic of "What we leave cannot be inherited and should be spent in charity", investigation/study: Dr. Mustafa Dib al-Bagha, publisher: Dar ibn Kathir, al-Yamamah – Beirut, 3rd edition, 1407 H / 1987 AD
- ***English Translation of Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 8, Book 80 (***Laws of Inheritance (Al-Faraa'id)***), No. 718, translated by: M. Muhsin Khan***

- البخاري الجعفي، محمد بن إسماعيل أبو عبدالله (متوفاي256هـ)، صحيح البخاري، ج 6، ص 2474، ح6346، كتاب الفرائض، بَاب قَوْلِ النبي (ص) لا نُورَثُ ما تَرَكْنَا صَدَقَةٌ، تحقيق د. مصطفى ديب البغا، ناشر: دار ابن كثير، اليمامة – بيروت، الطبعة: الثالثة، 1407 – 1987.

**« فَهَجَرَتْهُ فَاطِمَةُ فلم تُكَلِّمْهُ حتى مَاتَتْ»**

---

**[6]** **Back**

- Al-Dinawari, Abu Muhammad Abdullah ibn Muslim Bin Qutaybah (d. 276 H), *al-Imama Wal-Siyasa* (The Imamate/rule and politics), vol. 1, p. 17, on the topic of "How did the allegiance of Ali proceed", investigation/study: Khalil al-Mansoor, publisher: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyya, Beirut, 1418 H / 1997 AD

● الدينوري، أبو محمد عبد الله بن مسلم ابن قتيبة (متوفاي276هـ)، الإمامة والسياسة، ج 1،ص 17، باب كيف كانت بيعة علي رضي الله عنه، تحقيق: خليل المنصور، ناشر: دار الكتب العلمية – بيروت – 1418هـ - 1997م.

**«البيت بيتك»**

**«نشدتكما الله ألم تسمعا رسول الله يقول «رضا فاطمة من رضاي وسخط فاطمة من سخطي فمن أحب فاطمة ابنتي فقد أحبني ومن أ رضى فاطمة فقد أرضاني ومن أسخط فاطمة فقد أسخطني »**

**«نعم سمعناه من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم»**

**«فإني أشهد الله وملائكته أنكما أسخطتماني وما أرضيتماني ولئن لقيت النبي لأشكونكما إليه»**

**«والله لأدعون الله عليك في كل صلاة أصليها»**

---

**[7]** **Back**

- Al-Bukhari al-Ju'fi, Abu-Abdullah Muhammad ibn Ismail (d. 256 H), *Sahih al-Bukhari*, vol. 4, p. 1549, no. 3998 Kitab al-Maghazi (Book of Meanings), on the topic of "the prophet's (PBUH&HF) illness and death", investigation/study: Dr. Mustafa Dib al-Bagha, publisher: Dar ibn Kathir, al-Yamamah – Beirut, 3rd edition, 1407 H / 1987 AD
- ***English Translation of Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 5, Book 59 (Military Expeditions led by the Prophet (pbuh) (Al-Maghaazi)), No. 546, translated by: M. Muhsin Khan***

● البخاري الجعفي، محمد بن إسماعيل أبو عبدالله (متوفاي256هـ)، صحيح البخاري، ج 4، ص 1549، ح3998، كتاب المغازي، باب غزوة خيبر، تحقيق د. مصطفى ديب البغا، ناشر: دار ابن كثير، اليمامة – بيروت، الطبعة: الثالثة، 1407 - 1987.

**«وَعَاشَتْ بَعْدَ النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم سِتَّةَ أَشْهُرٍ فلما تُوُفِّيَتْ دَفَنَهَا زَوْجُهَا عَلِيٌّ لَيْلًا ولم يُؤْذِنْ بها أَبَا بَكْرٍ وَصَلَّى عليها»**

---

**[8]** **Back**

- Al-Dinawari, Abu Muhammad Abdullah ibn Muslim Bin Qutaybah (d. 276 H), *Ta'wil Mukhtalif al-Hadith* (The Interpretation of Conflicting Narrations), vol. 1, p. 300, Investigation/study: Muhammad Zahri al-Najjar, Publisher: Dar al-Jail, Beirut, 1418 H / 1997 AD

● الدينوري، أبو محمد عبد الله بن مسلم ابن قتيبة (متوفاي276هـ)، تأويل مختلف الحديث، ج 1، ص 300، تحقيق: محمد زهري النجار، ناشر: دار الجيل، بيروت، 1393، 1972.

**«وقد طالبت فاطمة رضي الله عنها أبا بكر رضي الله عنه بميراث أبيها رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فلما لم يعطها إياه حلفت لا تكلمه أبدا وأوصت أن تدفن ليلا لئلا يحضرها فدفنت ليلا»**

---

**[9]** **Back**

- Al-San'aani, Abu-Bakr Abdul-Razzaq ibn Hammam (d. 211 H), al-Munsif, vol. 3, p. 521, no. 6554, investigation/study: Habib al-Rahman al-A'zami, publisher: al-Maktab al-Islami (The Islamic Library) – Beirut, 2nd edition, 1403 H

● الصنعاني، أبو بكر عبد الرزاق بن همام (متوفاي211هـ)، المصنف، ج 3،ص 521، ح 6554، تحقيق حبيب الرحمن الأعظمي، ناشر: المكتب الإسلامي – بيروت، الطبعة: الثانية، 1403هـ .

**«عن بن جريج وعمرو بن دينار أن حسن بن محمد أخبره أن فاطمة بنت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم دفنت بالليل قال فر بها علي من أبي بكر أن يصلي عليها كان بينهما شيء»**

---

**[10]** **Back**

- Al-San’aani, Abu-Bakr Abdul-Razzaq ibn Hammam (d. 211 H), al-Munsif, vol. 3, p. 521, no. 6555, investigation/study: Habib al-Rahman al-A’zami, publisher: al-Maktab al-Islami (The Islamic Library) – Beirut, 2nd edition, 1403 H

- الصنعاني، أبو بكر عبد الرزاق بن همام (متوفاي211هـ)، المصنف، ج 3،ص 521، ح 6555، تحقيق حبيب الرحمن الأعظمي، ناشر: المكتب الإسلامي – بيروت، الطبعة: الثانية، 1403هـ .

**«عن بن عيينة عن عمرو بن دينار عن حسن بن محمد مثله الا أنه قال اوصته بذلك»**