

## Is the narration (HASAN MUTHNA) in justifying the refutation of hadith Ghadeer authentic?

### Explanation of question:

One of the drawbacks that are put forward to hadith ghadeer is the hadith that will be mentioned here in. This drawback which is from a narration related to a son of Imam Hassan al Mujtaba (as) called (Hassan al Muthna) in the refutation of the caliphate of (the commander of the faithful imam Ali ibn Abitalib (as) was sketched for the first time by Dehlewi (sheikh abdul aziz ibn waliyyullah ibn abdul Rahim hanafi died in the year 1239 lunar calendar) in the book (**attuhfah al ithna ashariah**), and Mir Sayed Hamed Hussain Naqavi (died in the year 1306 lunar calendar) for the first time answered to this error in his book (**Abaqat ul Anwar**).

In this day and age which is the time of the attack of the Wahhabis to the religion of islam; this doubt or misgiving is being repeated by some of the Wahhabi scholars like Dr. Qaffari in his book (**usul madhhab al shia**).

This narration according to the narration of the owner of (Abaqat) from Dehlewi in the book (attuhfa al ithna ashariah) and the new wahhabis is the following:

أخرج أبو نعيم عن الحسن المثنى ابن الحسن السبط رضي الله عنهما أنه سئل: هل حديث من كنت مولاه نص على خلافة علي رضي الله عنه؟ فقال: لو قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يعني بذلك الخلافة لأفصح لهم بذلك، فإن رسول الله (ص) كان أفصح الناس، ولقال لهم: يا أيها الناس هذا والي أمركم والقائم عليكم بعدي فاسمعوا له وأطيعوا. ولو كان الأمر أن الله جل وعلا ورسوله صلى الله عليه وسلم اختار عليا لهذا الأمر وللقيام على الناس بعده فإن عليا أعظم الناس خطيئة وجرا إذ ترك أمر رسول الله (ص) أن يقوم فيه كما أمره ويعذر إلى الناس. ف قيل له: ألم يقل النبي (ص) لعلي من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه؟ فقال: أما والله لو يعني رسول الله (ص) بذلك الأمر والسلطان لأفصح به كما أفصح بالصلاة والزكاة ولقال: يا أيها الناس إن عليا والي أمركم من بعدي والقائم في الناس.

خلاصة عيقات الأنوار، سيد حامد نقوي، ج 9، ص 240، ر.ك. الاعتقاد، بيهقي، ص355، به تحقيق: أحمد عصام الكاتب، ناشر، دار الآفاق الجديدة، بيروت، ط1، 1401هـ.

Abu nuaim from Hassan Muthna son of imam Hassan Mujtaba (as) grandson of the messenger of allah (pbuh&f) has narrated that he was asked about the hadith (man kunto mawla) that does this sentence or phrase take in to account the justification of the caliphate of imam Ali (as)?

Hassan Muthna replied: if the messenger of allah (pbuh&f) had an intention, he should have addressed people with clarity and should have shed more light; because the prophet of islam (pbuh&f) is the most eloquent and clear in speech and if he had an intention with his sentence then he should have said it in this manner: (يا أيها الناس هذا والي أمركم):

O people! After me, this person is responsible for the guardianship of your affairs after me so you should obey him. And if the matter was such that Allah (swt) has chosen Ali (as) for this post after the time of the prophet of Islam (pbuh&f) then Ali (as) has to be the most sinful person amongst people since he has left the command of the prophet of Islam and he has left the order of the prophet of Islam regarding caliphate and he should apologize to people because of not doing his job.

Hassan Muthna was told: did the messenger of Allah not say this sentence ( من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه ) justly to Ali (as)? He replied by saying: yes indeed: but I swear to God if the prophet of Islam meant caliphate and emirate then he should have addressed this matter with clarity in the same way that he addressed salat and zakat. He should have said :

(إن عليا والي أمركم من بعدي) : o people! this Ali is your guardian and governor after me.

**Khulasat Aqabat ul Anwar, sayed Hamed Naqavi, volume 9, p240, r,k Al e'teqad, Baihaqi, p 355, researched by Ahmad Esam al kateb, published by Dar ul aafaq al jadeedah, Beirut, 1401 هـ**

The same narration is mentioned in Qaffazi's book and some others as the following:

لذلك قال الحسن بن الحسن بن علي بن أبي طالب - كما يروي البيهقي - حينما قيل له: ألم يقل رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم لعلي: من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه؟ فقال: أما والله إن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إن كان يعني بذلك الإمرة والسلطان والقيام على الناس بعده لأفصح لهم بذلك، كما أفصح لهم بالصلاة والزكاة وصيام رمضان وحج البيت، ولقال لهم: إن هذا ولي أمركم من بعدي فاسمعوا له وأطيعوا، فما كان من وراء هذا شيء، فإن أنصح الناس للمسلمين رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم .

**أصول مذهب الشيعة، عبد الله القفاري، ج2، ص840 - 842 .**

That is why when Hasan ibn Hasan ibn Ali ibn Abitalib \_ the way that Baihaqi has narrated \_ was asked that did the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) not mention this sentence ( من كنت مولاه فعلي ) justly for Ali (as)? He replied by saying: yes indeed he said: but I swear to God that if the prophet of Allah had the intention of caliphate and emirate then he should have addressed this subject with clarity the same way that he addressed salat and zakat with clarity. Here also the prophet should have mentioned like this: o people, this Ali is your guardian and governor after me. **Usul madhhab ul shia, Abdullah al qaffazi, volume 2, p 840 to 842.**

**Answer:**

**Examining chain of narrators:**

**A:** if the way that some of the books such as Abaqat who narrates from Dehlewī which in the beginning of the chain of narrators (Abu Nuaim) has been mentioned, then we should first examine Abu Nuaim:

(ابو نُعَيْم): ibn taimiyyah says about abu Nuaim:

فإن أبا نعيم روي كثيرا من الأحاديث التي هي ضعيفة بل موضوعة باتفاق علماء الحديث وأهل السنة والشيعة .

منهاج السنة ، ج 7 ، ص 52 .

Abu nuaim has narrated most of the hadiths which are weak even hadiths which according to hadith scholars and all of sunni and shia scholars are fabricated.

Minhaj us sunnah, volume 7, page 52.

And in another place he says:

مجرد رواية صاحب الحلية ونحوه لا يفيد ولا يدل على الصحة فإن صاحب الحلية قد روى في فضائل أبي بكر وعمر وعثمان وعلي والأولياء وغيرهم أحاديث ضعيفة بل موضوعة باتفاق أهل العلم.

منهاج السنة ، ج 5 ، ص 79 .

Only the narration of the owner of al hilliyyah (ابو نعيم اصفهاني) abu nuaim esfahani and others like him cannot justify its authenticity; because the owner of hilliyyah has used weak narrations ; rather he has narrated narrations in virtues of Abubakr, Omar, Uthman, Ali and others which are fabricated according to the people of knowledge.

Minhaj us sunnah volume 5, page 79.

Ibn jowzi says about abu nuaim:

وجاء أبو نعيم الأصبهاني فصنف لهم ، أي للصوفية ، كتاب الحلية وذكر في حدود التصوف أشياء قبيحة ولم يستحي أن يذكر في الصوفية أبا بكر وعمر وعثمان وعلي بن أبي طالب وسادات الصحابة رضي الله عنهم فذكر عنهم فيه العجب .

تلبيس إبليس ، ج 1 ، ص 159 .

Abu Nuaim wrote the book al-hilliyyah for soofiyya and in this book he narrated very clumsy and bad descriptions from them about tasawwuf (Sufism) which is really amazing to human beings.

Talbis iblis, volume1, page 159

B.And if in the chain of narrators of this narration without mentioning the name of Abu Nuaim as Qaffari has mentioned in his book (the above mentioned) , then the chain of narrators would be as following and we will evaluate it as such:

عن يحيى بن إبراهيم بن محمد بن علي، عن أبي عبد الله محمد بن يعقوب، عن محمد بن عبد الوهاب، عن جعفر بن عون، عن فضيل بن مرزوق، قال: سمعت الحسن بن الحسن ...

## 1. Yahya ibn Ibrahim ibn Muhammad ibn Ali

Such a name has not been mentioned in any of the books of Rijal and therefore he is (Muhmil) unknown.

## 2. Fuzail ibn Marzooq

Dhahabi says about him:

قال النسائي: ضعيف، وكذا ضعفه عثمان بن سعيد. قال أبو عبد الله الحاكم: فضيل بن مرزوق ليس من شرط الصحيح عيب على مسلم إخرجه في الصحيح. وقال ابن حبان: منكر الحديث جدا كان ممن يخطئ على الثقات ويروي عن عطية الموضوعات.

ميزان الاعتدال في نقد الرجال ، ج 3 ، ص 362 .

Dhahabi and Uthman ibn Saeed see him as weak. Abu Abdullah ibn Hakem say about him: Fuzail ibn Marzooq does not have the conditions of a sahih narrator and it is a defect for Muslim to have narrated narrations from such a person. And ibn Hibban counts him a ( munkir ul hadith) a denier of hadith and has said about him: he is the one who counts the authentic ones faulty and he has narrated fabricated narrations from Atiyyah.

Mizan ul I'tidal fi naqdil rijal, volume 3, page 362.

And also in ( al mughni fiz zu'afa) the following is written about Fuzail ibn Marzooq:

ضعفه النسائي وابن معين أيضا. قال الحاكم: عيب على مسلم إخرجه في الصحيح .

المغني في الضعفاء، ج 2، ص 515 .

Nisa'I and Abu Mu'een have counted him as weak and Hakem has also said about him: this is considered as a fault for Muslim to have narrated narrations in his sahih.

Al Mughni fiz zu'afa, volume 2, page 515.

And also Mizzi in his book Tahzeeb ul Kamal has said the following about him:

قال عبد الرحمان بن أبي حاتم : ... قلت: يحتج به ؟ قال : لا . وقال النسائي : ضعيف .

تهذيب الكمال ، ج 23 ، ص 308 ، تهذيب التهذيب، ج 8 ، ص 269 .

Abdul Rahman ibn Abi Hatam says:... I said; can one follow his hadiths? He said: no, can not. And Nisa'I has said about him: Fuzail ibn Marzoq is weak.

Tahzeeb ul Kamal, volume 23, page 308, Tahzeeb ul Tahzeed. Volume8, page 269.

#### Indicative drawbacks:

1. The above mentioned narration has only been mentioned from (ahl ul sunnat) and has not been mentioned through Shiite narrators. Therefore Dehlawi and his morals cannot reason through this narration and every other narration that has only been narrated through ahl ul nussat while debating with Shiite. The sunni scholars have denied the use of those narrations that have only been mentioned in shia books and have not been mentioned in their books while reasoning and debating and they have said the following:

لتفرده في روايه الشيعة بها لاتكون حجه في مقام الاستدلال وعدم حجيه روايات فرقه علي فرقه أخرى .

Therefore we say that this narration has only been mentioned in Sunni books (**mutafarridat**) and it does not have the capability to be used in reasoning.

2. Another rule among Sunni scholars is that: only those narrations are authentic that are mentioned in the books of sihah where as this narration is not mentioned in any of the books of sihah or any other authentic sunni narration books. Therefore we say: had this narration been authentic it should have been mentioned in one of the books of sihah.

This narration has not even been mentioned in Musnad Ahmad and this itself is the best reason in disproving this narration, because Ahmad ibn Hanbal himself says:

هذا الكتاب : جمعته وانتقيته من أكثر من سبع مئة ألف وخمسين ألفا ، فما اختلف المسلمون فيه من حديث رسول الله ، صلى الله عليه وسلم ، فارجعوا إليه . فإن وجدتموه فيه ، وإلا فليس بحجة .

سير أعلام النبلاء ، ذهبي ، ج 11 ، ص 329 .

Siyar A'lamun Nubala, Dhahabi. Volume 11, page 329.

3. Even if we assume that Hasan Muthna has said such a sentence, since he is not a ma'sum (infallible), his speech has no authority to us.
4. This speech does not match the speech delivered by other infallibles who used hadith Ghadeer to prove the leadership (imamat) of imam Ali (as).
5. This hadith is completely contrary to hadith Ghadeer about imam Ali(as):

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ حَدَّثَنِي عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عُمَرَ الْقَوَارِيرِيُّ حَدَّثَنَا يُونُسُ بْنُ أَرْقَمٍ حَدَّثَنَا يَزِيدُ بْنُ أَبِي زِيَادٍ عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ أَبِي لَيْلَى قَالَ شَهِدْتُ عَلِيًّا فِي الرَّحْبَةِ يَنْشُدُ النَّاسَ أَنْشِدُوا اللَّهَ مَنْ سَمِعَ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، يَقُولُ يَوْمَ غَدِيرِ خُمٍّ « مَنْ كُنْتُ مَوْلَاهُ فَعَلِيَ مَوْلَاهُ ». لَمَّا قَامَ فَشَهِدَ. قَالَ عَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ فَقَامَ اثْنَا عَشَرَ بَدْرِيًّا كَاتِبِي أَنْظِرْ إِلَيَّ أَحَدَهُمْ فَقَالُوا تَشْهَدُ أَنَّا سَمِعْنَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، يَقُولُ يَوْمَ غَدِيرِ خُمٍّ « أَلَسْتُ أَوْلَى بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِنْ أَنْفُسِهِمْ وَأَزْوَاجِي أُمَّهَاتُهُمْ ». فَقُلْنَا بَلَى يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ. قَالَ « فَمَنْ كُنْتُ مَوْلَاهُ فَعَلِيَ مَوْلَاهُ اللَّهُمَّ وَالِ مَنْ وَالَاهُ وَعَادِ مَنْ عَادَاهُ ».

مسند احمد ، ج 1 ، ص 119 ، ح 973 .

We witnessed that Ali (as) swore people to Allah in Rahabah and said: anyone amongst you who witnessed the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) in Ghadeer saying ( to whoever I am his master Ali is his master) stand up and testify. Abdul Rahman said: at this moment twelve people from the companions of Badr that I was looking at one of them stood up and said: we witnessed that the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) said in the day of Ghadeer: do I not have more right over you than yourselves and aren't my wives like your mothers? And we all replied: yes oh messenger of Allah! Then the prophet said: to whoever I am his master Ali is his master. Oh Allah befriend those who befriend him and be enemy of those who are enemy with him!

Musnad Ahmad , volume1, page 119, hadith 973.

حَدَّثَنَا يُونُسُ بْنُ مُوسَى ، قَالَ : ثنا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُوسَى ، عَنْ فِطْرِ بْنِ خَلِيفَةَ ، عَنْ أَبِي إِسْحَاقَ ، عَنْ عَمْرِو ذِي مَرٍّ ، وَعَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ وَهَبٍ ، وَعَنْ زَيْدِ بْنِ يَنْبِيعٍ ، قَالُوا : سَمِعْنَا عَلِيًّا ، يَقُولُ : نَشَدْتُ اللَّهَ رَجُلًا سَمِعَ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ ، يَقُولُ يَوْمَ غَدِيرِ خُمٍّ لَمَّا قَامَ ، فَقَامَ إِلَيْهِ ثَلَاثَةُ عَشَرَ رَجُلًا ، فَشَهِدُوا أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ ، قَالَ : أَلَسْتُ أَوْلَى بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِنْ أَنْفُسِهِمْ ، قَالُوا : بَلَى يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ ، قَالَ : فَأَخَذَ بِيَدِ عَلِيٍّ ، فَقَالَ : مَنْ كُنْتُ مَوْلَاهُ فَهَذَا مَوْلَاهُ ، اللَّهُمَّ وَالِ مَنْ وَالَاهُ ، وَعَادِ مَنْ عَادَاهُ ، وَأَحِبَّ مَنْ أَحَبَّه ، وَأَبْغِضْ مَنْ أَبْغَضَهُ ، وَأَنْصُرْ مَنْ نَصَرَهُ ، وَاخْذُلْ مَنْ خَذَلَهُ .

البحر الزخار (مسند البزار) ، أبو بكر البزار (متوفى 292 هـ) ج 3 ، ص 35 ، ح 786 ، ناشر : مؤسسة علوم القرآن ، مكتبة العلوم والحكم ، بيروت ، المدينة ، 1409 ، الطبعة : الأولى ، تحقيق : د. محفوظ الرحمن زين الله .

We heard Ali (as) saying: I swear you to Allah, which one of you heard this sentence of the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) in the day of Ghadeer while standing up? At this moment thirteen people stood up and testified: that the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) said: do I not have more authority over you than yourselves? The people replied by saying: yes oh messenger of Allah! In this moment the messenger took Ali's hand and said: to whoever I am his master Ali is his master. Oh Allah! Befriend those who befriend him and be enemy of those who are enemies with him! And love anyone who loves him, and hate anyone who hates him, and help anyone who helps him, and humiliate those who want to weaken him!

Albahrul Zakhar (Musnad al bazzar), Abu bakr al Bazzar ( died on 292 hijrah) volume3, page 35, hadith 786, publisher: mu'assisah ulum ul qur'an, maktabat ul ulum wal hakam. Beirut, al madeenah. 1409, attaba'atul awla, research by, D. mahfoozul rahman zain ullah.

Hathami says the following after narrating the narration:

رواه البزار ورجاله رجال الصحيح غير فطر بن خليفة وهو ثقة

مجمع الزوائد ، ج 9 ، ص 105 .

This narration has been narrated by Bazzar and all of its narrators are from the narrators of sahih Bukhari. Except for Fatar ibn khalifah who is also thiqah (trustworthy).

Majma'uz zawa'id, volume9, page 105.

Albani who is called the Bukhari of the time by the Wahhabis says the following about the aforementioned narration:

أخرج عبد الله بن أحمد في زوائده على المسند ( 1 / 118 ) عن سعيد بن وهب و زيد بن يثيع قالاً : نشد علي الناس في الرحبة : من سمع رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول يوم غدیر ( خم ) إلا قام ، فقام من قبل سعيد ستة ، و من قبل زيد ستة ، فشهدوا ... الحديث .

و قد مضى في الحديث الرابع ، الطريق الثانية و الثالثة . و إسناده حسن ، و أخرجه البزار بنحوه و أتم منه .

و للحديث طرق أخرى كثيرة جمع طائفة كبيرة منها الهيتمي في المجمع ( 9 / 103 ، 108 ) و قد ذكرت و خرجت ما تيسر لي منها مما يقطع الواقف عليها بعد تحقيق الكلام على أسانيدھا بصحة الحديث يقيناً، و إلا فهي كثيرة جداً، و قد استوعبها ابن عقدة في كتاب مفرد، قال الحافظ ابن حجر: منها صحاح و منها حسان. و جملة القول أن حديث الترجمة حديث صحيح بشطريه، بل الأول منه متواتر عنه صلى الله عليه وسلم كما ظهر لمن تتبع أسانيدھ و طرقھ، و ما ذكرت منها كفاية.

السلسلة الصحيحة ، ج 4 ، ص 249 ، طبق برنامھ المكتبة الشاملة .

Abdullah ibn Ahmad in his addition to Musnad Ahmad has brought the following from Sa'eed ibn Wahab and Zaid ibn Yathya': that these two people have said: Ali (as) swore people to allah in Rahabah that whoever witnessed the event should stand up. In this moment six people from Sa'eeds corner and six people from Zaid's corner stood up.

And in the fourth hadith two ways of second and third are mentioned for this narration and its chain of narrators are (sahih) authentic and Bazzar has brought this narration in this way and in a more complete way.

And for this narration there are many other channels and ways from which it is mentioned by Hathami in his Majma'uz Zawa'id and to the extent that I was able I researched its chain of narrators and the documents whcih there is a lot of them and also ibn Aqdah has also brought this in a different book. And hafez ibn Hajar has said about this hadith: some of its narrations are sahih and some of them are hasan. In short, this narration with both of its chains of narrators is sahih ( authentic), rather the first narration has been repetedly narrated from the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) and this subject is absolutely clear to researchers about its chain of narrators and the ways and channels through which it has been narrated and I have sufficiently mentioned about this subject.

Silsilat ul Sahihah, volume 4, page 249, according to al-maktabat ul shamilah.

6. This speech which is related to Hasan Muthna which has put difference between guardian and governor general and has said: if the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) had such an intention then he should have said: I announce Ali (as) as your governor general. This is contrary to the definition the lexicographers about the word (wali) and even them, they have counted one of the meanings of wali (guardian) as waali (governor general).

Because the lexicographers have interpreted the word (wali) which is one of the names of Allah (swt) as an assister or helper, they have also interpreted this word as the guardian or the caliph.

Zubaidi says:

الولي في أسماء الله تعالى: هو الناصر، وقيل: المتولي لأمر العالم القائم بها. وأيضاً الوالي: وهو مالك الأشياء جميعها المتصرف فيها.  
تاج العروس، زبيدي، ج 20، ص 315

Wali which is one of the names of Allah (swt) means assister, means the guardian of the affairs of world who works towards working out the affairs and it also means the owner of all the creatures of the universe and has the right of possession over them.

Tajul aroos, Zubaidi, volume220, page315.

And also Raaghib in (Al mufarradat) in the verse (وَمَا لَهُمْ مِّنْ دُونِهِ مِّنْ وَّالٍ)

Interprets the word Wali as the guardian: (والوالي الذي في قوله ( وما لهم من دونه من وال ) بمعنى الولي)

مفردات غريب القرآن ، الراغب الأصفهاني ، ص 533

The word wali here which is from Allah (swt) means the guardian.  
(Mufarradat ghareeb ul qur'an, al raghib al esfahani, page 533.

Ibn Manzoor also in ( Lisanul Arab) interprets the word wali as waali:

وفي الخبر : أن عبد الملك بن مروان خطب يوماً فقال : وليكم عمر بن الخطاب ، وكان فظاً غليظاً مضيقاً عليكم فسمعتهم له .

It has been reported that one day Abdul Malik ibn Marwan was giving a sermon and said: Omar ibn Khattab was your guardian and he was a very harsh and hot tempered person on us. Lisan ul Arab, ibn Manzoor, volume8, page 166.

Tha'labi has also interpreted the word wali as the guardian of the affairs in his tafseer and he says:

تفسير ثعلبي، ثعلبي، ج 5 ، ص 278

(وال: ولي أمرهم ما يدفع العذاب عنهم .)

The guardian is he one who is there wali and saves them from the the punishment.

Tafseer Tha'labi, Tha'labi volume 5, page 278.

7. Most important of all, in the words of Abubakr and Omarr and others the word wali has been used by the meaning of waali and imam:

In Sahih Bukhari the following is narrated from Omar ibn Khattab:

«... ثم توفي الله نبيه صلى الله عليه وسلم، فقال أبو بكر: أنا ولي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم... ثم توفي الله أبا بكر، فقلت: أنا ولي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وأبي بكر، فقبضتها سنتين أعمل فيها بما عمل رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم».

البخاري، صحيح البخاري: ج 6 ص 191 - 192، سنة الطبع: 1981، الناشر: دار الفكر.

After the demise of the messenger of Allah (pbuh), Abubakr said: I am the guardian of the messenger of Allah (pbuh), and when Abubakr passed away I said: I am the guardian of the messenger of Allah (pbuh) and for two years I acted according to the prophet.

Al Bukhari, Sahih al Bukhari, volume6, page 191\_192, year 1981, publisher; Darul fikr.

And again from Omar ibn Khattab who says:

لو كان سالم مولى أبي حذيفة حياً لوليت له الخلافة

تفسير البحر المحيط ، أبي حيان الأندلسي ، ج 4 ص 314 و نیز ر. ك. تفسير أبي حيان الأندلسي: ج 4 ص 314 و نیز تاریخ ابن خلدون، ج 1، ص 194 .

If Salem, Abu Huzafa's slave were alive then I would have chosen him as caliph.

Tafseer ul Bahr ul Muheet, Abi Hayyan al Undolosi, volume 4 page314 and also Tafseer Abi Hayyan al Undolosi; volume4 page 314 and also Taeekh ibn Khaldoon, volume1, page 194.

8. Another difficulty that can be seen in this speech which is related to Hasan Muthna is that he says: why did the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) not clarify the guardianship of Ali (as)? Meaning: the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) never mentioned the guardianship and the caliphate of imam Ali (as) with clarity because had the prophet of islam such an intention he should have certainly talked about it.

Now lets see, is it really so?!

To answer the above mentioned question, we will mention some of the texts about the statements that the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) made to clarify the guardianship and the caliphate and imamate and the emirate of Imam Ali (as):

- A. Sherawiyyah Dailami died it the year 509 of lunar calendar. He is one of the great memorizers and of the very famous ulama of ahl sunnat. In his book (Ferdous ul

Akhbar) which is also a very famous book amongst ahl sunnat and the ahl sunnat narrate traditions from his book and they trust it, that he has narrated ten thousand hadiths with the name of their narrators in alphabetical order. (R.K. Kashfuz zunoon An Asaami al kutub wal funoon, volume 2, page 1254). He has narrated the following tradition in his book:

«عن حذيفة بن اليمان، قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم: لو يعلم الناس متى سمي علي أمير المؤمنين ما أنكروا فضله: سمي أمير المؤمنين وآدم بين الروح والجسد ، قال تعالى: (وإذ أخذ ربك من بني آدم من ظهورهم ذريتهم وأشهدهم على أنفسهم ألست بربكم قالوا بلى شهدنا أن تقولوا) قالت الملائكة: بلى. فقال تبارك وتعالى: أنا ربكم ومحمد نبيكم وعلي أميركم»  
ر. ك. فردوس الأخبار، شيرويه ديلمي (509 هـ)، ج 3، ص 399 - ينابيع المودة، قندوزي، ج 2 ، ص 248 .

(Huzaifa ibn Yaman narrates from the messenger of Allah (pbh&f) that he said: if the people knew when was Ali (as) called by the title of the commander of the faithful, they would have never refused his excellence. He was named by this title while prophe Adam (as) was in between soul and body and Allah said: and remember the time that your lord took allegiance and promise from Bani Adam and he testified them by this promise that am I not your lord? They said: yes! And the angels also said: yes! And Allah (swt) said: I am your lord and Muhammad is your messenger and Ali is your emir and guardian).

R.K, Ferdous ul Akhbar, sherawiyyah dailami (509 lunar calendar), volume3, page 399\_ Yanabaiul Mawaddah, Qundozi, volume 2, page 248.

B. Sayed Ali Hamadani died on 786 lunar calendar. He was one of the greatest sunni scholars and he is from popular gnostic or learned person of the sunnis, and some of sunni scholars have praised him; also: Abdul Rahman ibn Ahmad Jami in the book (Nafahat ul Ens men Hazarat ul Quds) and Mahmood ibn Sulaiman Kafwi in the book (Kitab ul A'laamu ul Akhyar men Fuqaha' Madhhab ul nu'man ul Mukhtar) and Noorud din Ja'far Badakhshaniin the book (Khulasat ul Manaqib)and Sheikh Ahmad Qashashi in the book (Al Mustul Majeed fi Silaasil Ahlet Tawheed) and Shah Wali Dehlawi in the book (Al Entebah fi Silaasil Awliyaa'ulllah).

Kafwi praises him in his book as following:

«لسان العصر، سيد الوقت، المنسلخ عن الهياكل الناسوتية والمتوصل إلى السبحات اللاهوتية، الشيخ العارف الرباني والعالم الصمداني، أمير سيد علي بن شهاب بن محمد بن محمد الهمداني قدس الله تعالى سره. كان جامعاً بين العلوم الظاهرة والباطنة، وله مصنفات كثيرة في علم التصوف».

The owner of the book (Nazhatul Khawater) praises him in his book as following:

«الشيخ علي بن شهاب الهمداني، الشيخ العالم الكبير الرحاله. ولد في 12 رجب ، وأدرك المشايخ الكبار واستفاد منهم ، بلغ عددهم إلى أربعمائة وألف من رجال العلم والمعرفة . فقدم كشمير فأسلم على يده غالب أهلها . وله مصنفات كثيرة ممتعة. وكانت وفاته في سنة 786»

(ر.ك.نزهة الخواطر، ج 2، ص 84 ، با اندكي تلخيص)

He has brought the following tradition in his book:

«عن حذيفة رضي الله عنه قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم : لو علم الناس متى سمي علي أمير المؤمنين ما أنكروا فضله ، سمي أمير المؤمنين وآدم بين الروح والجسد»

ينابيع المودة لنوي القري، قندوزي، ج 2، ص 248 .

Khudhaifah narrates from the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) that he said: if the people knew when was Ali (as) called by the title commander of the faithful then they would have never refused his greatness. He was entitled the commander of the faithful when Adam was in between soul and body.

Yanabai ul Mawaddah le zawel qurba, Qundozi, volume2. Page 248.

C.The following text which is found in many sunni books;

«عن أبي ذر عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم قال: من أطاعني فقد أطاع الله، ومن عصاني فقد عصى الله، ومن أطاع علياً فقد أطاعني، ومن عصى علياً فقد عصاني»

المستدرک علی الصحیحین، ج 3، ص 121 ، كنز العمال، ج 11، ص 614 - تاريخ مدينة دمشق، ج 42، ص 270 و 307 - ذخائر العقبى، ص 66 - ينابيع المودة، ج 2، ص 313 و ...

(Abudhar narrates from Rasulallah (pbuh&f): whoever obeys me has obeyed Allah and whoever disobeys me has disobeyed Allah, and whoever obeys Ali has obeyed me and whoever disobeys Ali has disobeyed me).

Almustadrak Alas Sahihayn, volume 3, page121, Kanzulummal, volume11, page 614

Tareekh Madeenah Dameshq, volume42, page 270 and 307,

Dhakha'erul Uqba, page66, Yanabaiul Mawaddah. Volume 2, page 313...

Hakem says the following after narrating this tradition:

«هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ولم يخرجاه».

D.The narration of Tabari in his Tareekh which uses the words (فاسمعوا له وأطيعوا) the messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) in hadeeth (يوم الانذار)(يوم الدار) selected Ali (as) as his successor and caliph. And he has clearly used these words (فاسمعوا له وأطيعوا).

(R.K To the Commentary of Qur'an under the verse (و انذر عشيرتك الاقربين) Surah Al Ashu'ara verse 214.

(«...إن هذا أخي ووصيي وخليفتي فيكم فاسمعوا له وأطيعوا...»)

تاريخ طبري، ج 2، ص 63 .

(... this person (Ali) is my brother and successor and guardian amongst you. Listen to him and obey him..)

Tareekh Tabari, volume 2, page 63.

From the narrators of this tradition are ibn Eshaaq and Tabari, and ibn Abi Hatam, and ibn Mardawiyah, and Abu Na'eem, and Bayhaqi, and Bghavi, and Suyuti, and Muttaqi Hindi and others.

Kanzulummal, volume 13, page 129 and 131 and 149 and 174.

But we still see that the proplem is unsolved, the advocates that opposes the false narration related to Hassan Muthna which uses the word (فاسمعوا وأطيعوا) clearly, we still see that there are people who deny because of obstinacy and stubbornness, they always deny the reality with their false pretexts and hey try to run away from the truth. These are the people to whom Qur'an says the following:

لهم قلوب لا يفقهون بها ولهم أعين لا يبصرون بها ولهم آذان لا يسمعون بها أولئك كالأنعام بل هم أضل أولئك هم الغافلون .

(Al Aaraaf, verse179).