

## **Why Bani Hashem and the supporters (Ansar) did not defend Lady Fatima (sa)?**

### **Sketch of the misgiving:**

The people of Medina had a relationship with the prophet of islam since the prophets mother was from there, and Abdulmutallib's mother was from the powerful tribe of Khazraj and that is why the people of Medina specially the Khazraj tribe would consider themselves as the uncles of the prophet.

In addition to all of this, the prophet (pbuh&f) was able to educate thousands of men who were ready to sacrifice their lives in the way of god and in defending the prophet and his family. If we were to accept the lie that the enemies of Islam have made, what happened that Bani Hashem stayed and watched the daughter of the prophet getting slapped and her house put on fire and the death of her six month old Mohsen, but said nothing and did not object?

All of those true and pure Muslims who were ready to sacrifice their lives for islam specially the people of Medina who were relatives of prophet, what happened that all of them kept quite at once and did not object?

### **Review and studying:**

This is a kind of improbability not a proof; because there are narrations in sunni books (not Shia books) with authentic chain of narrators that proves the attack that happened on the house of Lady Fatima (sa) and Imam Ali (as). Therefore, these words are nothing more but to play with people's emotions and it is not a rational argument.

### **The role of Aslam tribe in stabilization of Abu-Bakr's government:**

Quraysh and on top of them Abu-Bakr and Omar were the ones who usurped the right of Imam Ali (as) while the imam was busy burying the prophet, and by luring

others like Abu sofyan, they were able to gather most of Quraysh to be with them. And it is obvious that the rest of the tribes were not able to confront the Quraysh.

Abubakr and Omar also gathered other tribes in Medina who were desert dwellers and who became muslims by sword and this attracted many other new muslims; because Imam Ali (as) fought in wars and islam was victorious there were many people who hated the Imam and the hypocrites used this hatred. Then they were able to blockade the house of Imam Ali (as) by using all of these groups and the tribes who lived around Medina and they wanted to put Ali's house on fire.

Tabari in his Tareekh, Mawordi shafe'ei in Al haawiy ul Kabeer and Abdul Wahhab Nuwairi in Nehayat ul Arb, writes the following:

وأقبلت أسلم بجماعتها حتى تضايقت بهم السكك فبايعوه، فكان عمر يقول: ما هو إلا أن رأيت أسلم فأيقنت بالنصر.

الطبري، أبي جعفر محمد بن جرير (متوفاي310)، تاريخ الطبري، ج 2، ص 244، ناشر: دار الكتب العلمية - بيروت؛

الماوردي البصري الشافعي، علي بن محمد بن حبيب (متوفاي450هـ)، الحاوي الكبير في فقه مذهب الإمام الشافعي وهو شرح مختصر المزني، ج 14، ص 99، تحقيق الشيخ علي محمد معوض - الشيخ عادل أحمد عبد الموجود، ناشر: دار الكتب العلمية - بيروت - لبنان، الطبعة: الأولى، 1419 هـ - 1999 م؛

النويري، شهاب الدين أحمد بن عبد الوهاب (متوفاي733هـ)، نهاية الأرب في فنون الأدب، ج 19، ص 21، تحقيق مفيد قمحية وجماعة، ناشر: دار الكتب العلمية - بيروت، الطبعة: الأولى، 1424هـ - 2004م.

All of the Aslam tribe gathered in Medina to give their allegiance to Abu-Bakr, there were so many people that even the bazaar did not have the capacity to place them. Omar said: when I saw the Aslam tribe I was sure about the victory.

Attabari, Abi Ja'far Muhammad ibn Jareer (died on 310), Tareekh Tabari, volume 2, page 244, nasher ;Darul kutub elmiyyah-Beirut;

Al Mawordi al Basri al Shafe'ei, Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Habib (died on 450 hijri), Al Hawiy ul Kabeer fi Madhhab al imam al Shafe'ei wa howa sharh Mukhtasar ul muzni, volume 14. Page99, tahqiq, al sheikh ali Muhammad mu'wiz- al sheikh aadel ahmad abdul mawjood, nasher:darul kutub al elmiyyah- Beirut- Lebanon, attaba'tul awla, 1419 -1999;

Al Nuwairi, Shahabud din Ahmad ibn Abdul Wahhab ( died on 733 hijra), Nehayat ul Arb fi Funoon al Adab, volume 19, page 21, tahqeeq mufeed Qamhiyyah wa jama'ah, nasher; darul kutub al elmiyyah- Beirut, Attaba'tul Awla, 1424 hijra – 2004.

Meaning even if the people of Medina wanted to confront with Abu-Bakr and Omar they were not able to do so at such a situation.

Lack of defense from Bani Hashem and the Supporters (Ansar) from the view point of Imam Ali (as):

Imam Ali (as) has mentioned the lack of defense of the companions especially from Bani Hashem and other companions and the supporters (the ansar) towards the Ahlulbayt (as) and the reason behind it in some of his sermons which we will mention herein:

A. The supplication of the imam to Allah (swt):

اللَّهُمَّ إِنِّي أَسْتَعْدِيكَ عَلَى فُرَيْشٍ وَمَنْ أَعَانَهُمْ فَإِنَّهُمْ قَدْ قَطَعُوا رَجَمِي وَأَكْفَتُوا إِنَائِي وَأَجْمَعُوا عَلَى مُنَازَعَتِي حَقًّا كُنْتُ أَوْلَى بِهِ مِنْ غَيْرِي وَقَالُوا أَلَا إِنَّ فِي الْحَقِّ أَنْ تَأْخُذَهُ وَفِي الْحَقِّ أَنْ تُمْنَعَهُ فَاصْبِرْ مَغْمُومًا أَوْ مَتَّ مُتَأَسِّفًا فَتَنْظَرْتُ فَإِذَا لَيْسَ لِي رَافِدٌ وَلَا ذَابٌّ وَلَا مُسَاعِدٌ إِلَّا أَهْلُ بَيْتِي فَضَنْنْتُ بِهِمْ عَنِ الْمَنِيَّةِ ....

نهج البلاغه، محمد عبده، ج2، ص 202 خطبه 217 و الإمامة والسياسة، ابن قتيبة، ج 1 ص 134، و مجمع الأمثال، أحمد بن محمد الميداني النيسابوري ( متوفي 528)، ج2، ص282 و شرح نهج البلاغه ابن ابي الحديد، ج 6، ص 95 و ج 11، ص109

Nahjulbalagha, Muhammad Abdah, volume2, page 202 sermon 217

Al imamah wa siyasah, ibn Qutaybah. Volume1. Page 134.

Majma'ul Amthaal, Ahmad ibn Muhammad al Maidani al Naysaboori (died on 528), volume 2, page 282

Sharh Nahjulbalagha ibn Abel Hadid, volume6, page 95 and volume 11 page 109.

Oh Allah, I seek help from you to make me victorious against the Quraysh and their allies who cut their relation with me, and who changed my duty and who gathered in a battle against me to take a right that only I deserve and they said:

Take right if you are able to or you will be deprived of your right, wait with grief or die with regret. I looked around me; I saw that I have no supporters and no one to defend me, only my household that I was not willing to put their lives at risk.

Nahjulbalagha, sermon 217.

### B. Petition and Grievance for justice of Imam Ali (as):

روى كثير من المحدثين انه عقيب يوم السقيفة تالم وتظلم واستنجد واستصرخ حيث ساموه الحضور والبيعة وانه قال وهو يشير الى القبر (يا بن ام إن القوم استضعفوني وكادوا يقتلونني)، وانه قال وا جعفر ولا جعفر لى اليوم واحمزتاه ولا حمزة لى اليوم.

إبن أبي الحديد المدائني المعتزلي، أبو حامد عز الدين بن هبة الله بن محمد بن محمد (متوفاي 655 هـ)، شرح نهج البلاغة، ج 11، ص 65، تحقيق محمد عبد الكريم النمري، ناشر: دار الكتب العلمية - بيروت / لبنان، الطبعة: الأولى، 1418 هـ - 1998 م.

Most of the narrators have narrated that after (Thaqifa), Imam Ali (as) expressed his unhappiness and he asked for his right and asked for help and he shouted; because they did not come to pledge allegiance with him. And he faced to the grave of the prophet (pbuh&f) and said: “oh my mother’s son, this nation, found me weak and they nearly killed me” and he said: oh Ja’far I don’t have Ja’far today; oh Hamzah; I don’t have Hamzah today!!!

Ibn Abel Hadid al Madaeni al Mo’tazeli, Abu Hamed Ez ud din ibn hebbatullah ibn Muhammad ibn Muhammad (died on 655 hijri), Sharh Nahjulbalagha, volume 11, page 65, tahqiq, Muhammad Abdulkareem al nemri, nasher: Darul kutub al Elmiyyah- Beirut, Lebanon; At taba’atul awla, 1418 hijri- 1998.

These subjects have also been mentioned in Shia books:

### C. Imposed allegiance with a remembrance of relatives:

فَنَظَرْتُ فَإِذَا لَيْسَ لِي رَافِدٌ وَلَا مَعِيَ مُسَاعِدٌ إِلَّا أَهْلُ بَيْتِي فَضَنَنْتُ بِهِمْ عَنِ الْهَلَاكِ؛ وَلَوْ كَانَ لِي بَعْدَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ عَمِّي حَمَزَةٌ وَأَخِي جَعْفَرٌ لَمْ أَبَايَعْ كَرْهًا وَلَكِنِّي بُلَيْتُ بِرَجُلَيْنِ حَدِيثِي عَهْدٍ بِالإِسْلَامِ الْعَبَّاسِ وَعَقِيلٍ، فَضَنَنْتُ بِأَهْلِ بَيْتِي عَنِ الْهَلَاكِ، فَأَغْضَيْتُ عَيْنِي عَلَى الْقَدَى، وَتَجَرَّعْتُ رِيقِي عَلَى الشَّجَى وَصَبَرْتُ عَلَى أَمْرٍ مِنَ الْعُلَقَمِ، وَالْمَ لِلْقَلْبِ مِنْ حَزِّ الشَّقَارِ.

الحسني الحسيني، رضي الدين أبي القاسم علي بن موسى بن جعفر بن محمد بن طاووس (متوفى 664هـ)، كشف المحجة لثمره المهجة، ص 249، ناشر: بوستان كتاب - قم، الطبعة الثانية، 1375ش؛

المجلسي، محمد باقر (متوفى 1111هـ)، بحار الأنوار، ج 30 ص 15، تحقيق: محمد الباقر البهبودي، ناشر: مؤسسة الوفاء - بيروت - لبنان، الطبعة: الثانية المصححة، 1403 - 1983 م.

Imam Ali (as) said: I looked around and I saw no helper to assist me; then I wanted to save my family from getting destroyed; and if after the prophet (pbuh&f) I had my uncle Hamza and Ja'far then I would not have given allegiance by force; but I suffered from two new muslims; Abbas and Aqeel; then I wanted to save my family from getting destroyed; I closed my eyes despite having thorn in them and I swallowed my saliva despite having blade in them and I waited on something more bitter than Alqam (a bitter plant); and I waited on something more painful than a blade to heart.

Al Hassani al Hussaini, Raziuddin Abel Qasim Ali ibn Musa ibn Ja'far ibn Muhammad ibn Taoos (died on 664 hijri), Kashf ul Muhajjah Lesamaratul Muhjah, page 249, publish: Bostan Ketab- Qom Attaba'at ul thania, 1375 shamsi,

Al Majlesi, Muhammad Baqer (died on 1111 hijri), Behar ul Anwar, volume 30, page 15, research, Muhammad al Baqer al Behboodi publish: Muassisah al Wafa- Beirut- Lebanon, Attaba'at al thania al musahhiha, 1403-1983.

#### D. Imam Ali's (as) complaint due to lack of friends and supporters:

فَقَالَ الْأَشْعَثُ بْنُ قَيْسٍ [وَعَضِبَ مِنْ قَوْلِهِ] فَمَا يَمْنَعُكَ يَا ابْنَ أَبِي طَالِبٍ حِينَ بُوِيعَ أَخُو تَيْمٍ بِنِ مِرَّةَ وَأَخُو بَنِي عَدِيٍّ بِنِ كَعْبٍ وَأَخُو بَنِي أُمَيَّةَ بَعْدَهُمَا أَنْ تُقَاتِلَ وَتَضْرِبَ بِسَيْفِكَ وَأَنْتَ لَمْ تَخْطُبْنَا خُطْبَةً مُنْذُ كُنْتُ قَدِمْتُ الْعِرَاقَ إِلَّا وَقَدْ قُلْتُ فِيهَا قَبْلَ أَنْ تَنْزِلَ عَنْ مِنْبَرِكَ وَاللَّهِ إِنِّي لَأَوَّلَى النَّاسِ بِالنَّاسِ وَمَا زِلْتُ مَظْلُومًا مُنْذُ قَبِضَ اللَّهُ مُحَمَّدًا (صلي الله عليه وآله) فَمَا مَنَعَكَ أَنْ تَضْرِبَ بِسَيْفِكَ دُونَ مَظْلَمَتِكَ؟

فَقَالَ لَهُ عَلِيٌّ (عليه السلام) يَا ابْنَ قَيْسٍ [قُلْتُ فَاسْمَعْ الْجَوَابَ] لَمْ يَمْنَعْنِي مِنْ ذَلِكَ الْجُبْنُ وَلَا كَرَاهِيَةُ لِلِقَاءِ رَبِّي وَأَنْ لَا أَكُونَ أَعْلَمُ أَنَّ مَا عِنْدَ اللَّهِ خَيْرٌ لِي مِنَ الدُّنْيَا وَالْبَقَاءِ فِيهَا وَلَكِنْ مَنَعْنِي مِنْ ذَلِكَ أَمْرُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صلي الله عليه وآله) وَعَهْدُهُ إِلَيَّ أَخْبَرَنِي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (صلي الله عليه وآله) بِمَا الْأُمَّةُ صَانِعَةٌ بِي بَعْدَهُ فَلَمْ أَكُ بِمَا صَنَعُوا حِينَ عَايَنْتُهُ بِأَعْلَمَ مِنِّي وَلَا أَشَدَّ يَقِينًا مِنِّي بِهِ قَبْلَ ذَلِكَ بَلْ أَنَا بِقَوْلِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صلي الله عليه وآله) أَشَدُّ يَقِينًا مِنِّي بِمَا عَايَنْتُ وَشَهِدْتُ فَقُلْتُ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ فَمَا تَعْهَدُ إِلَيَّ إِذَا كَانَ ذَلِكَ قَالَ: إِنَّ وَجَدْتَ أَعْوَانًا فَانْبِذْ إِلَيْهِمْ وَجَاهِدْهُمْ وَإِنْ لَمْ تَجِدْ أَعْوَانًا فَانْكُفْ يَدَكَ وَاحْقِنْ دَمَكَ حَتَّى تَجِدَ عَلَى إِقَامَةِ الدِّينِ وَكِتَابِ اللَّهِ وَسُنَّتِي أَعْوَانًا وَأَخْبَرَنِي (صلي الله عليه وآله) أَنَّ الْأُمَّةَ سَتَخَذُلْنِي وَتُبَايِعُ غَيْرِي وَتَتَّبِعُ غَيْرِي وَأَخْبَرَنِي (صلي الله عليه وآله) أَنِّي مِنْهُ بِمَنْزِلَةِ هَارُونَ مِنْ مُوسَى وَأَنَّ الْأُمَّةَ سَيَصِيرُونَ مِنْ بَعْدِهِ بِمَنْزِلَةِ هَارُونَ وَمَنْ تَبِعَهُ وَالْعَجَلِ وَمَنْ تَبِعَهُ

إِذْ قَالَ لَهُ مُوسَىٰ يَا هَارُونُ مَا مَنَعَكَ إِذْ رَأَيْتَهُمْ ضَلُّوا. أَلَا تَتَّبِعَنِ أَ فَعَصَيْتَ أَمْرِي. قَالَ يَا بَنُ أُمَّ لَا تَأْخُذْ بِلِحْيَتِي وَلَا بِرَأْسِي إِنِّي خَشِيتُ أَنْ تَقُولَ فَرَّقْتَ بَيْنَ بَنِي إِسْرَءِيلَ وَلَمْ تَرْقُبْ قَوْلِي وَقَالَ ابْنُ أُمِّ إِنَّ الْقَوْمَ اسْتَضْعَفُونِي وَكَادُوا يَقْتُلُونَنِي وَإِنَّمَا [يَعْنِي] أَنْ مُوسَىٰ أَمَرَ هَارُونَ حِينَ اسْتَخْلَفَهُ عَلَيْهِمْ أَنْ ضَلُّوا فَوَجَدَ أَعْوَانًا أَنْ يُجَاهِدَهُمْ وَإِنْ لَمْ يَجِدْ أَعْوَانًا أَنْ يَكْفَ يَدَهُ وَيَحْفَ دَمَهُ وَلَا يُفَرِّقَ بَيْنَهُمْ] وَإِنِّي خَشِيتُ أَنْ يَقُولَ لِي ذَلِكَ أَخِي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص [لَمْ] فَرَّقْتَ بَيْنَ الْأُمَّةِ وَلَمْ تَرْقُبْ قَوْلِي وَقَدْ عَهَدْتُ إِلَيْكَ إِنْ لَمْ تَجِدْ أَعْوَانًا أَنْ تَكْفَ يَدَكَ وَتَحْفَ دَمَكَ وَدَمَ أَهْلِ بَيْتِكَ وَشِيعَتِكَ فَلَمَّا فُضِضَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (صلي الله عليه وآله) مَالَ النَّاسُ إِلَى أَبِي بَكْرٍ فَبَايَعُوهُ وَأَنَا مَشْغُولٌ بِرَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صلي الله عليه وآله) بِغُسْلِهِ وَدَفْنِهِ ثُمَّ شَعَلْتُ بِالْقُرْآنِ فَأَلَيْتُ عَلَى نَفْسِي أَنْ لَا أُرْتَدِيَ إِلَّا لِلصَّلَاةِ حَتَّى أَجْمَعَهُ [فِي كِتَابٍ] فَفَعَلْتُ ثُمَّ حَمَلْتُ فَاطِمَةَ وَأَخَذْتُ بِيَدِ ابْنِي الْحَسَنِ وَالْحُسَيْنِ فَلَمْ أَدْعُ أَحَدًا مِنْ أَهْلِ بَدْرٍ وَأَهْلِ السَّابِقَةِ مِنَ الْمُهَاجِرِينَ وَالْأَنْصَارِ إِلَّا نَاشَدْتُهُمْ اللَّهُ فِي حَقِّي وَدَعَوْتُهُمْ إِلَى نُصْرَتِي فَلَمْ يَسْتَجِبْ لِي مِنْ جَمِيعِ النَّاسِ إِلَّا أَرْبَعَةٌ رَهْطٌ سَلْمَانُ وَأَبُو ذَرٍّ وَالْمِقْدَادُ وَالزُّبَيْرُ وَلَمْ يَكُنْ مَعِيَ أَحَدٌ مِنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي أَصُولٌ بِهِ وَلَا أَقْوَى بِهِ أَمَّا حَمْرَةٌ فَفُتِلَ يَوْمَ أُحُدٍ وَأَمَّا جَعْفَرٌ فَفُتِلَ يَوْمَ مُوتِهِ وَبَقِيَ بَيْنَ جُلْفَيْنِ جَافِيَيْنِ ذَلِيلَيْنِ حَقِيرَيْنِ [عَاجِزَيْنِ] الْعَبَّاسُ وَعَقِيلٌ وَكَانَا قَرِيبَيْنِ الْعَهْدِ بِكُفْرٍ فَأَكْرَهُونِي وَقَهَرُونِي فَقُلْتُ كَمَا قَالَ هَارُونُ لِأَخِيهِ- ابْنِ أُمِّ إِنَّ الْقَوْمَ اسْتَضْعَفُونِي وَكَادُوا يَقْتُلُونَنِي فَلِي بِهِارُونَ أَسُوءُ حَسَنَةً وَلِي بِعَهْدِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صلي الله عليه وآله) حُجَّةٌ قَوِيَّةٌ.

الهاللي، سليم بن قيس (متوفاي 80هـ)، كتاب سليم بن قيس الهاللي، ص666، ناشر: انتشارات هادي - قم، الطبعة الأولى، 1405هـ.

المجلسي، محمد باقر (متوفاي 1111هـ)، بحار الأنوار، ج 29، ص 468، تحقيق: محمد الباقر البهبودي، ناشر: مؤسسة الوفاء - بيروت - لبنان، الطبعة: الثانية المصححة، 1403 - 1983 م.

Ash'ath ibn Qais became angry with the speech of Ali (as) said: oh son of Abu Talib! Why you did not fight when individuals from Taim ibn Murrah and Bani Adi ibn Ka'b and after them Banu Umayya's allegiance with Abu-bakr? and since you have come to Iraq in each sermon and speech that you give us it did not end your speech before saying that: I swear to god! I have more rights over people than they have on themselves, from the time the prophet (pbu&f) passed away there has always been injustice to me; then why you did not fight for your right?!

Ali (as) replied: oh son of Qais! You said what you had to say, now listen to the answer; this was not fear from death that held me back, I know it better than everyone that what Allah can give me is better for me than anything in this world and whatever that exists in this world; but what held me back from taking out my sword was the will of the prophet of Allah and his promise with me. The messenger of Allah (pbuh&f) had told me about what the nation will do to me after the demise of the prophet; therefore when I saw the actions of the ummah with me,

I saw that the action wasn't but what the prophet had told me, I said: oh messenger of Allah! When all of this takes place, what is your will and instruction to me?

He said: if you found supporters then fight them and if you did not find supporters then hold back and save your life until you find supporters who will help you in establishing the book and religion of god and my sunnah.

The prophet (pbuh&f) informed that the muslim nation will leave you very soon and they will give allegiance to someone other than me and will obey someone other than me. The prophet (pbuh&f) informed me that I am like Haroon to him as Haroon was to Musa, and that shortly after him the destiny of the nation will be like that of Haroon and his followers and calf and calf worshippers when Musa told Haroon: oh Haroon! Why you did not separate yourself from them when you saw them going astray, did you want to disobey me?! He said; oh my brother! This nation made me weak and they were about to kill me, and said: oh brother! Don't blame me, I was scared that you will say that you have separated the children of Israel and did not act according to my will! Meaning when Musa appointed Haroon on them he told Haroon that if they go astray and you could find supporters then stand up against them and if you couldn't find supporters then hold back and save your life and don't scatter them. And I was worried that my brother Rasulullah (pbuh&f) would tell me that: why did you scatter the nation (ummah) and did not follow my will, I told you that if you could not find supporters then hold back and save your life and your family's life?

After the demise of the prophet (pbuh&f) people went to Abubakr and paid their allegiance to him, whereas I was busy washing and burying the prophet. Then I went to the Qur'an and I promised myself that I won't take the cloak except for Namaaz (salat) and I won't step outside until I finish writing down the Qur'an in a book and I did so, then I took Fatima (sa) and my sons Hassan (as) and Hussain (as) and I went to the house of each and every of those who were in the battle of Badr and those who were the pioneers of islam from the Ansar and the Muhajireen and I swore them to god for my right and I asked them to support me; Hamza was killed in the battle of Uhud and Ja'far was killed in the battle of Moota, it was me and two ignorant, fierce, unfortunate and weak; Abbas and Aqeel who newly converted to islam, people made me weak and they left me, the way that Haroon told his brother, I said: oh brother! This nation made me weak and were about to

kill me, Haroon is a good model for me and he prophets (pbuh&f) will and promise to me is my greatest and most powerful proof and reason!.

Al Helali Salim ibn Qais (died on 80 hijri), kitab Salim ibn Qais al Helali, page 666, publish: entesharat Hadi\_Qom, t taba'at al awla, 1405 hijri.

Al Majlesi, Muhammad Baqer(died on 1111 hijri) Bihar al Anwar, volume 29, page 468, research: Muhammad al Baqer al behboodi, publish: Mu'assisa al Wafa-Beirut- Lebanon, At Taba'a: Al Thaniya al Musahhiha, 1403- 1983

And he said in another speech:

أَمَّا وَالَّذِي فَلَقَ الْحَبَّةَ وَبَرَأَ النَّسَمَةَ إِنِّي لَوْ وَجَدْتُ يَوْمَ بُوَيْعِ أَخُو تَيْمِ الَّذِي عَيَّرْتَنِي بِدُخُولِي فِي بَيْعَتِهِ أَرْبَعِينَ رَجُلًا كُلُّهُمْ عَلَى مِثْلِ بَصِيرَةِ الْأَرْبَعَةِ الَّذِينَ قَدْ وَجَدْتُ لَمَّا كَفَفْتُ يَدِي وَلَنَاهَضْتُ الْقَوْمَ وَلَكِنْ لَمْ أَجِدْ خَامِسًا [فَأَمْسَكْتُ] قَالَ الْأَشْعَثُ فَمَنْ الْأَرْبَعَةُ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ قَالَ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: سَلْمَانُ أَبُو ذَرٍّ وَالْمِقْدَادُ وَالزُّبَيْرُ بْنُ صَفِيَّةٍ قَبْلَ نَكْثِهِ بَيْعَتِي فَإِنَّهُ بَايَعَنِي مَرَّتَيْنِ أَمَّا بَيْعَتُهُ الْأُولَى الَّتِي وَفَى بِهَا فَإِنَّهُ لَمَّا بُوَيْعَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ أَتَانِي أَرْبَعُونَ رَجُلًا مِنَ الْمُهَاجِرِينَ وَالْأَنْصَارِ فَبَايَعُونِي [وَفِيهِمُ الزُّبَيْرُ] فَأَمَرْتُهُمْ أَنْ يُصْبِحُوا عِنْدَ أَبِي مُحَلِّقِينَ رُءُوسَهُمْ عَلَيْهِمُ السَّلَاحُ فَمَا وَفَى لِي وَلَا صَدَقَنِي مِنْهُمْ أَحَدٌ غَيْرُ أَرْبَعَةٍ سَلْمَانَ وَأَبُو [أَبِي] ذَرٍّ وَالْمِقْدَادُ وَالزُّبَيْرُ....

I swear by him who split the seed and created the people, if on the day that allegiance was given to Abu-Bakr for which you are saying I had a deficiency, if I had forty people who had found the same insight as those four people that I found, then for sure i would have stood against these people, but I could not find a fifth for these four that I found, thus I stayed calm. Ash'ath said: who were these four people oh Commander of the faithful? He said: Salman and Audhar and Meqdad and Zubair ibn Safiyyah before breaking allegiance with me; thus he truly paid allegiance twice to me; the first time it was him who remained on his allegiance, when they paid allegiance to Abubakr, forty of the Muhajereen and Ansar came to me and they paid their allegiances to me and Zubair was amongst them, I ordered them to gather at my place tomorrow with shaved heads and weapons, none of them obeyed me except for four of them: Salman and Abudhar and Meqdad and Zubair...

لهلالي، سليم بن قيس (متوفاي 80هـ)، كتاب سليم بن قيس الهلالي، ص 669، ناشر: انتشارات هادي - قم، الطبعة الأولى، 1405هـ.



المجلسي، محمد باقر (متوفاي 1111هـ)، بحار الأنوار، ج 29، ص 471، تحقيق: محمد الباقر البهبودي، ناشر: مؤسسة الوفاء - بيروت - لبنان، الطبعة: الثانية المصححة، 1403 - 1983 م.

Al Helali, Saleem ibn Qais (died on 80 hijri), ketab Saleem ibn Qais al Helali, page 669, publisher: Entesharat Hadi-Qom, at-tab'a'atul Awla, 1405 hijri.

Al Majlesi, Muhammad Baqer (died on 1111 hijri), Behar ul Anwar olume 29, page 471, research, Muhammad Baqer al Behboodi, Publish: Mu'assisa tul Wafa-Beirut- Lebanon, at taba'ah: athaniya tul Musahhiha, year 1403-1983.

And he also said:

ثُمَّ أَخَذْتُ بِيَدِ فَاطِمَةَ وَابْنَيْ الْحَسَنِ وَالْحُسَيْنِ فَدُرْتُ عَلَى أَهْلِ بَدْرٍ وَأَهْلِ السَّابِقَةِ فَنَاشَدْتُهُمْ حَقِّي وَدَعَوْتُهُمْ إِلَى نُصْرَتِي فَمَا أَجَابَنِي مِنْهُمْ إِلَّا أَرْبَعَةٌ رَهْطٍ سَلْمَانُ وَعَمَّارٌ وَأَبُو ذَرٍّ وَالْمِقْدَادُ... لَوْ وَجَدْتُ يَوْمَ بُيْعِ أَخِي تَيْمَ أَرْبَعِينَ رَهْطًا لَجَاهَدْتُهُمْ فِي اللَّهِ إِلَى أَنْ أَتْلِيَ عُذْرِي...

الطبرسي، أبي منصور أحمد بن علي بن أبي طالب (متوفاي 548هـ)، الاحتجاج، ج 1 ص 98، تحقيق: التعليق وملاحظات: السيد محمد باقر الخرسان، ناشر: دار النعمان للطباعة والنشر - النجف الأشرف، 1386 - 1966 م.

I took my wife Fatima (sa) and my sons Hassan (as) and Hussain (as) to the people who were in battle of Badr and the Sabeqeen and I swore them by my right and asked them to support me; none of them responded to me except for four of them; Salman and Abudhar and Meqdad and Zubair; all of those from whom I expected support left... I swear by the one who sent Muhammad (pbuh&f) if on the day that allegiance was given to Abu-Bakr I had forty men then I would have fought in the way of Allah (swt) to do my duty.

Al Tabarsi, Abi Mansur Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Abitalib (died on 548 hijri), Al Ehtejaj, volume 1 page 98, research: Ta'leeq waMulahezaat: Al Sayed Muhammad Baqer Al Kharsan, publish: Dar ul Ne'amat Lel Tabe'at wa Nashr- Al Najaf Al Ashraf, 1386-1966.

And in another narration he said:

أَمَّا وَاللَّهِ لَوْ كَانَ لِي عِدَّةُ أَصْحَابِ طَالُوتَ أَوْ عِدَّةُ أَهْلِ بَدْرٍ وَهُمْ أَعْدَاؤُكُمْ لَضَرَبْتُكُمْ بِالسَّيْفِ حَتَّى تَتَوَلَّوْا إِلَيَّ  
الْحَقُّ وَتُنِيبُوا لِلصِّدْقِ فَكَانَ أَرْتَقَ لِلْفَتَنِ وَأَخَذَ بِالرَّفْقِ اللَّهُمَّ فَاحْكُم بَيْنَنَا بِالْحَقِّ وَأَنْتَ خَيْرُ الْحَاكِمِينَ.

الكليني الرازي، أبي جعفر محمد بن يعقوب بن إسحاق (متوفى 328 هـ)، الأصول من الكافي، ج 8 ص 32،  
ناشر: اسلاميه، تهران، الطبعة الثانية، 1362 ش.

I swear to god that if I had as many supporters as those of Taloot and the men in battle of Badr and if they were my supporters then I would have raised my sword against them and I would return them to their right; but it was better to keep silence.

Al Kulayni Al Razi, Abi Ja'afar Muhammad ibn Ya'qub ibn EShaaq (died on 328 hijri), Al usul Men al Kafi, volume 8, page 32, publish: Islamiyyah, Tehran, Al Taba'at ul Thaniyah, 1326.

### **Answer according to Ahl e sunnat: Bani Hashem and Ansar acted according the prophet's order.**

To prove the legitimacy of the caliphate of caliphs, the Ahl e sunat have narrated narratins in their books that according to them the prophet (pbuh&f) ordered the companions to obey the caliphs after him; eventhough they know, they are not really obeying the prophet (pbuh&f), they are usurping others properties and instead of guiding people to god they are misleading them.

Even though we believe that these narrations are fabricated; but because these narrations are mentioned in the most authentic books of Ahl e sunnat, but for the sake of argument, we tell them:

Bani Hashem and Ansar and the rest of the companions of the prophet (pbuh&f), even though they know that Abubakr and Omar and ... are the usurpers of caliphate, they are not following the sunnat of the prophet, they are usurping others properties (Fadak), and in this manner they have followed the prophet's order and for some affairs they did not rise against them.

Muslim Naisaboori narrates from Huzaifat ibn Yaman that the prophet (pbuh&f) said:

يَكُونُ بَعْدِي أئِمَّةٌ لَا يَهْتَدُونَ بِهَدَايَ وَلَا يَسْتَتُونَ بِسُنَّتِي وَسَيَقُومُ فِيهِمْ رِجَالٌ قُلُوبُهُمْ قُلُوبُ الشَّيَاطِينِ فِي جُثْمَانِ  
إِنْسٍ قَالَ قُلْتُ كَيْفَ أَصْنَعُ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ إِنْ أَدْرَكْتُ ذَلِكَ قَالَ تَسْمَعُ وَتُطِيعُ لِلْأَمِيرِ وَإِنْ ضَرَبَ ظَهْرَكَ وَأَخَذَ مَالَكَ  
فَاسْمَعْ وَأَطِعْ .

النيسابوري، مسلم بن الحجاج ابوالحسين القشيري (متوفاي 261هـ)، صحيح مسلم، ج 3، ص 1476،  
ح 1847، تحقيق: محمد فؤاد عبد الباقي، ناشر: دار إحياء التراث العربي - بيروت.

After me, there will be leaders who have not gained anything from me, and they will not act upon my sunnat, and in between them there are people whose hearts are that of evil and their bodies are of mankind, I said oh the prophet of god (pbuh&f)! what is our duty on that day? He said: listen to them and obey them, if they beat you up and they usurp your properties, your duty is to obey them!!!.

Al Naisaboori, Muslim ibn Hajjaj Abul Hassan Al Qasheeri (died on 261 hijri), Sahih Muslim, volume3, page 1476, hadith 1847. Research: Muhammad Fouad Abd ul Baqi, Publish: Dar Ehya at Turath Al Arabaie- Beirut.

Therefore, the lack of defense of Bani Hashem, Ansar and the rest of the companions from Lady Fatima (sa) and the usurped right of imam Ali (as) was because of the orders given by the prophet and because of regards of certain reasons that there importance was far more necessary than rising against Abu-Bakr.