

Why do Shias Say his eminence Ali (A.S.) Left the Dead Body of Othman unburied for three days?

Answer:

Some individuals try to prove that the leader of the believers Ali (A.S.) and Imam Hussein (A.S.) had good relations with Othman; when however, in reality history and traditions of the Ahl Sunna show the case to be of the contrary.

According to existing credible sources of Sunni traditions which state that after Othman ibn Afan was murdered his body was left in an area where garbage was collected; furthermore, no one took any steps to have his body buried properly, not even the leader of the believers Ali (A.S.).

Now the question is this, if the relationship between Othman and the Leader of the Believers was so good then why did Ali (A.S.) refrain from having Othman's body buried?

Without doubt, burying the dead body of a fellow Muslim is incumbent on every Muslim. Although it may be sufficient to know that it's obligatory, however, not burying the dead body of a Muslim and the like of it being left in a garbage dump is according to Islamic jurisprudence unlawful. So, the question arises as to why the dead body of Othman was left in a garbage dump for three days? Moreover, why did the Leader of the Believers Ali (A.S.) not take steps to have Othman's body properly buried?

Our fellow Sunni Muslims have no choice they either have to accept God forbid that the Leader of the Believers (A.S.) had committed an offense or that Othman was not considered a Muslim.

. Before entering into the main discussion which will not be futile if the story from the mouth of Ali ibn Yunus Amalli is related and this will make our discussion clearer.

ابن جوزي و سلوني

إِنَّ ابْنَ الْجَوَازِيَّ قَالَ يَوْمًا عَلَى مِنْبَرِهِ سَلُونِي قَبْلَ أَنْ تَفْقِدُونِي، فَسَأَلَتْهُ امْرَأَةٌ عَمَّا رُوِيَ أَنَّ عَلِيًّا عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ سَارَ فِي لَيْلَةٍ إِلَى سَلَمَانَ فَجَهَّزَهُ وَرَجَعَ فَقَالَ رُوِيَ ذَلِكَ، قَالَتْ فَعُثِمَانُ ثُمَّ ثَلَاثَةَ أَيَّامٍ مَنُوبُذًا فِي الْمَزَابِلِ وَ عَلِيٌّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ حَاضِرٌ. قَالَ نَعَمْ. قَالَتْ فَقَدْ لَزِمَ الْخَطَأَ لِأَحَدِهِمَا. فَقَالَ إِنْ كُنْتُ خَرَجْتُ مِنْ بَيْتِكَ بِغَيْرِ إِذْنِ زَوْجِكَ فَعَلَيْكَ لَعْنَةُ اللَّهِ، وَإِلَّا فَعَلَيْهِ. فَقَالَتْ خَرَجْتُ عَائِشَةَ إِلَى حَرْبِ عَلِيٍّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ بِإِذْنِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ أَوْ لَا فَانْقَطَعَ وَ لَمْ يُجِرْ جَوَابًا.

Ibn Jozi and Salooni relate the following: One day as Ibn Jozi sat upon the pulpit he exclaimed, "Whatever you want to ask me about ask me now before you lose me." A woman then stood up and asked him about a tradition concerning Imam Ali (A.S.); in which Ali (A.S.) went at night from (Medina to Mada'in) to perform the burial ceremony for Salamon and then returned. Ibn Jozi then replied, "Yes, this tradition has been related." The woman then asked, "Why then did Othman remain in the garbage dump unburied; when Ali (A.S.) was present at the time?" Ibn Jozi replied, "Yes." The woman then said, "Then it is necessary to say that Ali (A.S.) made a mistake in relation to one of the two cases." Ibn Jozi replied, "If you went out without your husband's permission then you are accursed, and if not, then the curse is upon your husband." The woman then retorted, "Excuse me, did Ayesha have the Messenger of God's (S.A.) permission to go out of her home and fight against Ali (A.S.), or did she go out without his eminence permission?" At this point Ibn Jozi remained silent and gave no further reply.

العاملي النباطي، الشيخ زين الدين أبي محمد علي بن يونس (متوفى 877هـ) الصراط المستقيم إلى مستحقّي التقديم، ج 1، ص 218، تحقيق: محمد الباقر البهبودي، ناشر: المكتبة المرتضوية لإحياء الآثار الجعفرية، الطبعة الأولى، 1384هـ المجلسي، محمد باقر (متوفى 1111هـ)، بحار الأنوار الجامعة لدرر أخبار الأئمة الأطهار، ج 29، ص 647 - 648، تحقيق: محمد الباقر البهبودي، ناشر: مؤسسة الوفاء - بيروت - لبنان، الطبعة: الثانية المصححة، 1403هـ - 1983م.

Al Amali Al Nabati, Al Shiekh Zani aldeen Abi Muhammad Ali ibn Yunus (Mutawafee 877H) Al Seratal Mustagheem ily Musthaggi al Taghdeem Vol. 1, page 218, Tahgheegh: Muhammad al Baqir al Behboudee, Nashair: Al Maknabeh al Murtadawee al Hiyah al Tharal Jafarieh al Taba'a al Wali, 1384H Al Majlessi, Muhammad Baqir (Mutwafee1111H), Bahar al Anwar al Jama'a Ladarr Akhbar al lameh al Tahar, Vol 29, pages 647-648, Tahgeeg: Muhammad Baqir al Behboudee, Nashr: Mosseseh al Wafa-Lebanon, Al Tabaa: Al Thanya al Masahahat, 1403H- 1983M.

Burying a Muslim is Obligatory:

In all of the Islamic schools of thought in the event of death the burial procedure is a necessary obligation on every Muslim. Meaning that if anyone is found who can perform the burial then the responsibility will not fall on the shoulders of others. However, if this is not the case, then it becomes obligatory upon all Muslim to take steps in performing the burial.

Muhammad Ibrahim Neshbouri writes in his book Al Jam'a,

ما أجمع عليه فقهاء الأمصار...

وأجمعوا على أن دفن الميت لازم واجب على الناس لا يسعهم تركه عند الإمكان ومن قام به منهم سقط فرض ذلك على سائر المسلمين.

The things that the Islamic scholars in all cities have a consensus on:

“All Islamic scholars have the consensus that the burial procedure is a compulsory obligation upon all individuals in the society, unless a life or death situation occurs making it impossible to perform that action; until that time, no one has any justification for not performing this obligation. However, if one Muslim performs this obligation then the responsibility no longer lies on the shoulders of the rest of the Muslim community.”

النيسابوري، أبو بكر محمد بن إبراهيم بن المنذر (متوفى 318هـ)، الإجماع، ج 1، ص 42، تحقيق: د. فؤاد عبد المنعم أحمد، ناشر: دار الدعوة - الإسكندرية، الطبعة: الثالثة، 1402هـ.

Al Nayshabouri, Abu Bakr Muhammad ibn Ibrahim bin al Manzar (Mutawafae 318H), Al Jam'a Vol. 1 page 42, Tahgeeg: D. Fawad Abd Al Man'am Ahmad, Nashar: Daral Da'wat-al Askandareyeh, Al Taba'at : Al Thalthalleh 1402H

Ibn Hezm Andolusee who is counted as one of the grand scholars of the Zahairy school of thought even affirms that the burial of non-believers is also obligatory:

قال عليّ وأما جلد الإنسان فقد صحّ نهى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم عن المثلّة والسّلخ أعظم المثلّة فلا يحلّ التّمثيل بكافر ولا مؤمن وصحّ أمره عليه السلام بالقاء قتلى كفار بدر في القليب فوجب دفن كل ميت كافر ومؤمن وبالله تعالى التّوفيق.

Ali (Ibn Hezm) says, “Concerning the skin of human beings, the accuracy of the tradition being related is correct that the Messenger of God (S.A.) forbade the mutilation of the human body in way. Furthermore, the tearing of the skin is the worst form of mutilation, it is not lawful to perform any type of mutilation whether it is done to an unbeliever or a Muslim it is not permissible. The same order was given by the prophet (S) concerning the unbelievers who were killed and thrown into a hole in the battle of Badr, this tradition was also narrated with a correct chain of transmission. Therefore, it is clear that any dead body should be buried whether they are an unbeliever or a Muslim.”

Ibn Hezm al Andalusie al Zahairy, Abu Muhammad Ali ibn Ahmad ibn Sa'eed (died 456H) Al Mahaly Vol. 1 page 124, research: Al Janneh Ahiya al Tarath al Araby Published: Darol Afagha al Jadeedeh-Beirut.

Novie is one of the great Shafie Scholars of jurisprudence he writes the following regarding the above subject:

Mosnaf says, "The burial of the dead is an obligatory necessity, because leaving the dead corpus upon the earth unburied is a violation to the reverence of the dead person; moreover, the smell of the deteriorating corpus will annoy others."

However, In the opinion of the Ahkam there are several problems: One of these is that burying the dead is a obligatory necessity on the scholars of consensus, and if it is known by them that it is an obligatory necessity and they do not perform it, then all those individuals who knew and did not perform their duty they have committed a sin, not others."

AlNovie Al Shafa'ie, Mahyaie aldeen Abu Zakareyeh Yayah ibn Sharf ibn mar ibn Juma'a ibn Hazam (died 676H), Al Majmu'a Vol. 5 page 238 Published: Darol Fakhar al Taba'eh and Tozieh Publications, Al Takmaleh al Thaneeyah.

The great Hanabali scholar Behhootie Hanabali says the following in regards to this matter:

"The Chapter regarding the burial of the dead, Burial of the dead is an obligatory necessity, because God had said, 'After he has perished he lies hidden in his grave.' Also concerning this matter Ibn Abbas says, God has honored his servants by proscribing the performance of the burial rites. Again God says, 'did we not make the earth a center for the gathering of all human beings in life as well as death?!' This means that the earth has gathered the living upon its surface and the dead it has gathered within itself in their graves. This is the issue which bestows respect upon the dead, because if the corpus is left unburied its smell will annoy people."

Al Behhootie al Hanabali, Mansour ibn Yunus ibn Idresie (died 1051H), Shar Monta'hee al Iradat al Masmee Dafa'ig Owlie al Nahee Lashray al Munta'hie, Vol. 1 page 370 Published Allem al Ketab- Beirut, Al Taba'a: Al Thaneeyeh, 1996M.

Ibn Abideen Hanafee writes in his book Hashee'a Rad al Mokhtar:

"The question regarding the burial of the dead is a discussion in which the writer (digging the grave for the dead) begins by referring to the question of the

burial rites and the burying of the dead, which is considered as an obligatory duty by the scholars of consensus, if the performance of the duty is possible.”

Ibn Abideen al Hanafee, Muhammad Ameen Amar (died 1252H), Hashee'a Rad al Mokhtar Ali al Rad al Mokhtar Sheikh Tanveer al Absar Fiqh Abu Haneefeh, Vol. 2 page 233, Published: Darol Fakar al Taba'at al Nashr – Beirut. 1421H-2000M.

Khalil al Khorshi Maliki in his explanation of the above matter writes: “***Referring to the burial of the dead; meaning performing the burial and shrouding the dead body is an obligatory necessity and there is no difference of opinion concerning it.***

However, Ibn Yunus says something contrary. He says, ‘***It is only “recommended” to shroud the dead body.***’”

الخرشي، محمد بن عبد الله (متوفى 1101هـ)، شرح مختصر خليل، ج 2، ص 113، ناشر: دار الفكر للطباعة – بيروت.

Al Khorshy, Muhammad Ibn Abdillah (died 1101H) Sheikh Mokhtasar Khalial, Vol. 2 page 113, Publisher: Darol al Fakar al Taba'at- Beirut.

Consequently, all of Islamic schools of thought are of the belief that shrouding and burying the dead is an obligatory necessity and this is the consensus on this subject.

Othman's Corpus Not Buried After Three Days:

There are traditions that exist in the Ahl Sunnat sources which verify the subject concerning Othman's body remaining unburied in a garbage dump for three days and the Leader of the Believers Ali (A.S.) not taking steps to bury his body.

The first tradition:

26 - حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو مُحَمَّدٍ بْنُ حَيَّانَ، حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ سُلَيْمَانَ، حَدَّثَنَا الْمَسْرُوقِيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا عُبَيْدُ بْنُ الصَّبَّاحِ، حَدَّثَنَا حَفْصُ بْنُ غِيَاثٍ، عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ عُرْوَةَ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، قَالَ: " مَكَتَ عُثْمَانُ فِي حَشٍّ كَوَكَبٍ مَطْرُوحًا ثَلَاثًا، لَا يُصَلَّى عَلَيْهِ حَتَّى هَتَفَ بِهِمْ هَاتِفٌ: اذْفِنُوهُ، وَلَا تُصَلُّوا عَلَيْهِ فَإِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ قَدْ صَلَّى عَلَيْهِ.

Abu Na'iem Isfahani writes in his book Ma'rafat al Sahebeh, ***“Hasham ibn Arwah narrates from his father that Othman was thrown into Hash Kokab and left there for three days. No one performed the prayer for him, until Hatafie Cried out, ‘Do not bury him; moreover, do not say the for him, why? because God has said the prayer for him.’”***

الأصبهاني، أبو نعيم أحمد بن عبد الله (متوفى 430هـ)، معرفة الصحابة، ج 1، ص 68، طبق برنامجه الجامع الكبير؛
الأنصاري الشافعي، سراج الدين أبي حفص عمر بن علي بن أحمد المعروف بابن الملقن (متوفى 804هـ)، البدر المنير
في تخريج الأحاديث والآثار الواقعة في الشرح الكبير، ج 5، ص 382، تحقيق: مصطفى أبو الغيط و عبد الله بن سليمان وياسر بن
كمال، ناشر: دار الهجرة للنشر والتوزيع - الرياض-السعودية، الطبعة: الأولى، 1425هـ-2004م.

Al Isfahani, Abu Na'iem Ahmad Ibn Abdillah (died 430H), Ma'rafat al Sahabeh, Vol. 1 page 68, tebgh barnameh al Jam'eh al Kabeer; Al Ansary al shafa'ie, saraj Aldeen Abi Hafes Amar Ibn Ali Ibn Ahmad al Ma'ruf Baben al Malgan (died 804H), Al Badr al Moneer fe Takhrej al Hadeeth wal Athar al Wageh Fe al Sharh al Kabeer, Vol. 5 page 382, research: Mustafa Abu al Ghai't and Abdillah ibn Suliman Wayasar ibn Kamal, Publisher: Darol Hajarat al nashr Wal Tawzeh- al Re'yaz- al Saudi: Al Wali, 1425H-2004M.

The above tradition had no problem concerning the chain of transmission. We did an investigation into this single exsiting tradition:

Investigation of the Chain of Transmission of this Tradition:

Abu Muhammad, Abdillah ibn Muhammad ibn Ja'far Ibn Hiyan: Zahabi says concerning him,

أبو الشيخ. الامام الحافظ الصادق محدث اصبهان أبو محمد عبد الله بن محمد بن جعفر بن حيان
المعروف بأبي الشيخ صاحب التصانيف.

قال ابن مردويه ثقة مأمون صنف التفسير والكتب الكثيرة في الاحكام وغير ذلك. وقال أبو بكر
الخطيب كان أبو الشيخ حافظا ثبنا متقنا. وقال أبو القاسم السوذرجاني هو أحد عباد الله الصالحين ثقة
مأمون.

“Abu Sheikh, Imam, Hafez=(A person who had memorized on hundred thousand traditions) he was truthful and born in Isfahan. Ibn Mardavieh says concerning him that he was a trustworthy and capable confidant. He

wrote a commentary and numerous books on Islamic Jurisprudence and other sciences. Abu Bakr Khateeb says of Abu Sheikh Hafez that he was a capable confidant and a warranted officer. Abul Qaseem al Sozarajanie says of sheikh Hafez, he was one of God's servants who performed righteous deeds, trustworthy, and a capable confidant."

الذهبي الشافعي، شمس الدين ابو عبد الله محمد بن أحمد بن عثمان (متوفى 748 هـ)، سير أعلام النبلاء، ج 16، ص 276 - 278، تحقيق: شعيب الأرنؤوط، محمد نعيم العرقسوسي، ناشر: مؤسسة الرسالة - بيروت، الطبعة: التاسعة، 1413هـ.

Al Zahabie Al Shafa'ie Shams aldeen Abu Abdillah Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Othman (died 748H) Seer A'allam al Nabala'a Vol. 16, page 276-278, Research: Sa'eeb al Nawa'wat, Muhammad Na'iem Al Ra Fasoosee, Publisher: Mosasah al Rasalaeh-Beirut, al Ta'ba'at: Al Tawaat, 1413H.

Abu Al Abbas, Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Suliman:

أبو العباس محمد بن أحمد بن سليمان الهروي فقيه محدث كبير صنف الكتب الكثيرة أحد العلماء كتب عنه عامة محدثينا.

Abu Muhammad Ansary in his book "Tabieगत al Muhaditheen" writes, **"Abu al Abbas ibn Ahmad Harwie was a great jurist and narrator of traditions. He wrote many books and he was one of scholars that our traditionalists take and write traditions from."**

الأنصاري، ابومحمد عبدالله بن محمد بن جعفر بن حيان (متوفى 369 هـ)، طبقات المحدثين بأصبهان والواردين عليها، ج 3، ص 429، رقم: 439، تحقيق: عبدالغفور عبدالحق حسين البلوشي، ناشر: مؤسسة الرسالة - بيروت، الطبعة: الثانية، 1412هـ - 1992م.

Al Ansary, Abu Muhammad Abdillah ibn Jaf'ar in Hiyan (Died 369H), Tabagat al Hadetheen Basabehan Walwaradeen Alheeha, Vol. 3 page 429, ragam: 439, research: Abd al Ghafour Abd al Haqq Husain al Balushee, Publisher: Mosasah al Rasaleh-Beirut, Al taba'at: Al thaneeyeh, 1412H- 1992M.

Zahabie in his book Al Abar says:

وفيه محمد بن أحمد بن سليمان الإمام أبو العباس الهروي فقيه محدث صاحب تصانيف رحل إلى الشام والعراق وحدث عن أبي حفص الفلاس وطبقته

“In that year Imam Muhammad ibn Ahmad Suliman and Abu al Abbas Harwie died. He was a traditionalist and the owner of many books; he traveled in the direction of Syria and Iraq. He related traditions from Abi Hofs and other individuals from the same class.”

الذهبي الشافعي، شمس الدين ابوعبد الله محمد بن أحمد بن عثمان (متوفى 748 هـ)، العبر في خبر من غير، ج 2، ص 100، تحقيق: د. صلاح الدين المنجد، ناشر: مطبعة حكومة الكويت - الكويت، الطبعة: الثاني، 1984.

Al Zahabie Al Shafa'ie, Shams aldeen Abu Abdillah Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Othman (died 748H), al Abar Fee Khabar min ghabr, Vol.2 page 100, Research: D, Saleh aldeen al Manjad, Publisher: Mataba'at Hukumat al Kuwait- al Kuwait, al taba'at: Al Thane, 1984.

Abu Isa, Musa ibn Abal Rahman ibn Sa'eed:

موسى بن عبد الرحمن بن سعيد بن مسروق الكندي المسروقي أبو عيسى الكوفي ثقة من كبار الحادية عشرة مات سنة ثمان وخمسين ت س ق

“Musa ibn Abal Rahman Kandi was trustworthy and from among the famous 11th class.”

العسقلاني الشافعي، أحمد بن علي بن حجر ابوالفضل (متوفى 852 هـ)، تقريب التهذيب، ج 1 ص 552، رقم: 6987، تحقيق: محمد عوامة، ناشر: دار الرشيد - سوريا، الطبعة: الأولى، 1406 - 1986

Al Asagalani al Shafa'ie, Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Hajar Abul Fazal (died 852H), Tagareeb al Tahazeeb, Vol. 1 page 552, ragam: 6987, Research: Muhammad Awamat, Publisher: Darol Rasheed- Syria, Al Taba'at: al Wali, 1406-1986.

Furthermore Zahabie writes in Kashef:

موسى بن عبد الرحمن الكندي المسروقي عن القطان والجعفي وعنه الترمذي والنسائي وابن ماجة وأبو عروبة وابن أبي حاتم ثقة توفي 258 ت س ق.

“Musa ibn Abd al Rahman Kandi who is Tamarzie, Nasaie, Ibn Majah, Ibn Arubeh, and Ibn Abi Hatem all of these individuals took traditions from him and he was a trustworthy source.”

الكاشف ج 2 ص 305، رقم: 5713

Al Kashef Vol. 2 page 305, Ragam: 5713

Abu Muhammad, Abeed ibn Al Sabah ibn Sabeeh:

عبيد بن الصباح الكوفي يروى عن الكوفيين وكان راوياً لكامل أبي العلاء روى عنه أهل بلده

المسروقي وغيره.

Ibn Haban mentions his name in his book "Al Thagat". He says, ***"Abeed Ibn al Sabah al Kufi took and wrote his traditions from the people of Kufa, and he is a competent narrator of Abial A'la'eh....."***

التميمي البستي، ابوحاتم محمد بن حبان بن أحمد (متوفى 354 هـ)، الثقات، ج 8 ص 429، رقم: 14248، تحقيق السيد شرف الدين أحمد، ناشر: دار الفكر، الطبعة: الأولى، 1395 هـ - 1975 م

Al Tameyame Al Bastee, Abu Hatem ibn Haban ibn Ahmad (died 354H), al Thagat, Vol. 8 page 429, ragam: 14248, Research Al Sa'eed Sharaf Aldeen Ahmad, Publisher: Darol al Fakar, al Taba'at: al Wali, 1395H-1975M.

Zahabie writes in his book "The History of Islam":

عبيد بن الصباح بن صبيح

أبو محمد الكوفي المقرئ أخو عمرو بن الصباح. أخذ القراءة عرضاً عن حفص، وهو من أجل أصحابه وأضبّطهم. روى عنه القراءة عرضاً أحمد بن سهل الأشناني. قال : وكان ما علمت من الورعين المتقين. مات سنة خمس وثلاثين ومائتين.

"Abu Muhammad al Kufie recited directly what he heard from Hafsh, he was one of Hafseh ibn Gheeyath's best companions and the most retentive among them.' Ahmad ib Sahel Ashanaie in a direct way wrote down what he recited and he said, 'moreover what I know of him was that h was a pious and virtuous person.'"

الذهبي الشافعي، شمس الدين ابو عبد الله محمد بن أحمد بن عثمان (متوفى 748 هـ)، تاريخ الإسلام ووفيات المشاهير والأعلام، ج 17، ص 267، تحقيق د. عمر عبد السلام تدمري، ناشر: دار الكتاب العربي - لبنان/ بيروت، الطبعة: الأولى، 1407 هـ - 1987 م

Al Zahabie al Shafa'ie, Shams aldeen Abu Abdillah Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Othman (died 748H), Tareekh al Islam Wawafeeyat al Mashahair Wal A'alam, Vol. 17, page 267, Research D Amar Abd al Islam Tadmari, Publisher: Darol Ketab al Arabie-Lebanon/Beirut, Al taba'at: al Wali, 1407H-1987M.

Abu Ibn Omar and Hafseh ibn Geeyath:

حفص بن غياث بمعجزة مكسورة وياء ومثلثة بن طلق بن معاوية النخعي أبو عمر الكوفي القاضي ثقة فقيه تغير حفظه قليل في الآخر من الثامنة مات سنة أربع أو خمس وتسعين وقد قارب الثمانين ع.

From the narrations of Bukhari, Muslim, and the rest of six sound books of traditions: Hafseh ibn Geeyath and Abu Omar Kufie were judges, trustworthy, and scholars of jurisprudence. His memory did slightly change at the end of his life.

العسقلاني الشافعي، أحمد بن علي بن حجر ابوالفضل (متوفى 852هـ)، تقريب التهذيب، ج 1 ص 173، رقم: 1430، تحقيق: محمد عوامة، ناشر: دار الرشيد - سوريا، الطبعة: الأولى، 1406-

Al Asghalanie al Shafa'ie, Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Hajar Abol Fazl (died 852H), Tagreeb, Vol. 1 page 173, ragam: 1430, Research: Muhammad Awamee, Publisher: Darol Rasheed-Syria, Al taba'at: al Wali, 1406-1986

Abu al Manzar and Hasham ibn Oroot:

هشام بن عروة أبو المنذر وقيل أبو عبد الله القرشي أحد الأعلام سمع عمه بن الزبير وأباه وعنه شعبة ومالك والقطان توفي 146 قال أبو حاتم ثقة إمام في الحديث ع.

“From narrations of Bukhari, Muslim, and the rest of the six sound books of traditions: Hashem ibn Oroot was one of the famous personalities, Abu Hatem says concerning him, ‘he was trustworthy and held leadership in the science of hadith (traditions).’”

الذهبي الشافعي، شمس الدين ابوعبد الله محمد بن أحمد بن عثمان (متوفى 748 هـ)، الكاشف في معرفة من له رواية في الكتب الستة، ج 2 ص 337، رقم: 5972، تحقيق محمد عوامة، ناشر: دار القبة للثقافة الإسلامية، مؤسسة علو - جدة، الطبعة: الأولى، 1413هـ - 1992م.

Al Zahabie Shafa'ie, Shams aldeen Abu Abdillah Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Othman (died 748H), Al Kashef fee Ma'rafat min la Raviyat fe al Ketab al Sunnah, Vol. 2 page 337, Ragam: 5972, research Muhammad Awameh, Publisher: Darol al Gabletol la Thaghafa al Islamieyeh, Mosasah Alu-Jadeh al taba'at: al Wali, 1413H- 1992M.

Abu Abdillah and Oroot ibn Zabeer:

عروة بن الزبير أبو عبد الله عن أبيه وخالته وعلي وخلق وعنه بنوه عثمان وعبد الله وهشام ويحيى ومحمد والزهرى قال بن سعد كان فقيها عالما كثير الحديث ثبتا مأمونا قال هشام صام أبي الدهر ومات وهو صائم في موته أقوال منها 93 و 94 ع.

Oroot ibn Zabeer quotes Ibn Sa'd as saying, “***He was an Islamic jurist, a scholar of numerous traditions, a reliable person, and trustworthy.***’ Hashem has said of him, ***‘All the time he fasts and at the time of his death he was fasting’***”

الكاشف ج 2 ص 18، رقم: 3775 Al Kashef Vol. 2 page 18, ragam: 3775

Furthermore, the chain of transmission of this tradition is completely correct and no problems exist in its chain of transmission. The same story is also narrated in Ibn Jozi’s book “Talgeeh Fahom”.

ابن الجوزي الحنبلي، جمال الدين ابوالفرج عبد الرحمن بن علي بن محمد (متوفى 597 هـ)، تلقيح فهوم أهل الأثر في عيون التاريخ والسير، ج 1، ص 79، ناشر : شركة دار الأرقم بن أبي الأرقم - بيروت، الطبعة : الأولى، 1997م.

Ibn al Jozi al Hanabali, Jamal al Deen Abul Faraj Abd al Rahman ibn Ali ibn Muhammad (died 597H), Talgeeh Fahom Ahl al Athar fe Iyun al Taraeej Walseer, Vol. 1, page 79, Publisher: Sharekeh Darol al Ragm ibn Abi al Argam-Beruit, al taba’at: al Wali, 1997M

The Second Tradition:

حدثنا عَمْرُو بن أَبِي الطَّاهِرِ بن السَّرْحِ الْمِصْرِيُّ ثنا عبد الرحمن بن عبد الله بن عبد الحَكَمِ ثنا عبد المَلِكِ الْمَاجِشُونُ قال سمعت مَالِكًا يقول قُتِلَ عُثْمَانُ رضي الله عنه فَأَقَامَ مَطْرُوحًا على كُنَاسَةٍ بني فُلَانٍ ثَلَاثًا فَأَتَاهُ اثْنَا عَشَرَ رَجُلًا فِيهِمْ جَدِّي مَالِكُ بن أَبِي عَامِرٍ وَحُوَيْطُبُ بن عبد الْعُزَّى وَحَكِيمُ بن حِزَامٍ وَعَبْدُ اللَّهِ بن الزُّبَيْرِ وَعَائِشَةُ بنتُ عُثْمَانَ مَعَهُمْ مِصْبَاحٌ فِي حِقِّ فَحَمَلُوهُ على بَابٍ وَإِنَّ رَأْسَهُ يقول على الْبَابِ طَقَّ طَقَّ حتى أَتَوْا بِهِ الْبَقِيعَ فَاخْتَلَفُوا في الصَّلَاةِ عليه فَصَلَّى عليه حَكِيمُ بن حِزَامٍ أو حُوَيْطُبُ بن عبد الْعُزَّى شَكََّ عبد الرحمن ثُمَّ أَرَادُوا دَفْنَهُ فَقَامَ رَجُلٌ من بني مَارِئٍ فقال وَاللَّهِ لَئِنْ دَفَنْتُمُوهُ مع الْمُسْلِمِينَ لأُخَيِّرَنَّ الناسَ فَحَمَلُوهُ حتى أَتَوْا بِهِ إلى حَشٍّ كَوَكَبٍ فلما دَلُّوه في قَبْرِهِ صَاحَتْ عَائِشَةُ بنتُ عُثْمَانَ فقال لها بن الزُّبَيْرِ أَسْكِنِي فَوَاللَّهِ لَئِنْ عُدْتُ لِأَضْرِبَنَّ الذِّي فِيهِ عَيْتَاكَ فلما دَفَنْتُمُوهُ وَسَوَّوْا عليه الثَّرَابَ قال لها بن الزُّبَيْرِ صِيحِي مَا بَدَا لَكَ أَنْ تَصِيحِي قال مَالِكُ وكان عُثْمَانُ بن عَفَّانَ رضي الله عنه قبل ذلك يَمُرُّ بِحَشٍّ كَوَكَبٍ فيقول لَيَدْفَنَنَّ ها هنا رَجُلٌ صَالِحٌ.

Here Tabarani in Al Ma'jma al Kabir along with other Ahl Sunnat scholars narrates the same case with a correct chain of transmission from Malik ibn Ans the leader of the Maliki school of thought.

Abd al Malek ibn Majashoon says, **“He heard from Malek that he said, ‘Othman was murdered. Furthermore, his corpus for three days remained in someone’s garbage dump. Twelve individuals among them namely: Malek abi Amar, Hoyuteb ibn Abdal Azie, Hakeem ibn Hazam, Abdullah ibn Zabeer, and Ayesha the daughter of Othman were all present, and they came for his funeral. They brought lanterns with them. They brought his corpus through an entrance and as they did so his head hit the entrance way making a thud sound; they continued until they reach Baqee’ah. Then there arose a difference of opinion as to who would perform the prayer for him. Then Hakeem ibn Hazam or Hoyuteb ibn Abdal Azie performed the prayer. There is a doubt concerning Abd al Rahman—they then decided to bury him. A man from Bani Mazan then stood up and said, ‘If you bury him alongside the other Muslims I will notify the people’; hence they took Othman’s body until they arrived at Hash Kokab. When they placed Othman’s body in the grave Ayesha Othman’s daughter started screaming, Abdillah ibn Zabeer then said to her, ‘Be quite!, And if you scream one more time I will punch in the eye.’ After they performed the burial and covered the grave with dirt and smoothed out the soil Ibn Zabeer said to Ayesha, ‘Now you can cry and scream as much as you like.’ Malek said, ‘When Othman ibn Afan passed by Hash Kokab he remarked, ‘It is correct to say that in this place a righteous man will be buried.’”**

الطبراني، ابوالقاسم سليمان بن أحمد بن أيوب (متوفى 360هـ)، المعجم الكبير، ج 1، ص 78، ح 109، تحقيق: حمدي بن عبدالمجيد السلفي، ناشر: مكتبة الزهراء - الموصل، الطبعة: الثانية، 1404هـ - 1983م.

التميمي، أبو العرب محمد بن أحمد بن تميم بن تمام (متوفى 333هـ)، المحن، ج 1، ص 87، تحقيق: د عمر سليمان العقيلي، ناشر: دار العلوم - الرياض - السعودية، الطبعة: الأولى، 1404هـ - 1984م؛

الأصبهاني، أبو نعيم أحمد بن عبد الله (متوفى 430هـ)، معرفة الصحابة، ج 1، ص 68، طبق برنامجه الجامع الكبير.

ابن عبد البر النمري القرطبي المالكي، ابوعمر يوسف بن عبد الله بن عبد البر (متوفى 463هـ)، الاستيعاب في معرفة الأصحاب، ج 3، ص 1047، تحقيق: علي محمد البجاوي، ناشر: دار الجيل - بيروت، الطبعة: الأولى، 1412هـ؛

المزي، ابوالحجاج يوسف بن الزكي عبد الرحمن (متوفى 742هـ)، تهذيب الكمال، ج 19، ص 225، تحقيق: د. بشار عواد معروف، ناشر: مؤسسة الرسالة - بيروت، الطبعة: الأولى، 1400هـ - 1980م؛

العسقلاني الشافعي، أحمد بن علي بن حجر ابوالفضل (متوفى 852هـ)، تلخيص الحبير في أحاديث الرافعي الكبير، ج 2، ص 145، تحقيق السيد عبد الله هاشم اليماني المدني، ناشر: - المدينة المنورة - 1384هـ - 1964م

Al tameemee, Abu al Arab Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Tameem ibn Tamam (died 333H), Al Mahan, vol. 1 page 87, research: D Amar Suliman Al Aghalee, Publisher: Darol al Olum- al Reyaz- al Saudieh, al taba'at: al Wali 1404H-

1984M; Al Asbahani, Abu Na'eem Ahmad ibn Abdillahi (died 430H), Ma'rafat al Sahabah, Vol. 1, page 68 tabegh barnameh al Jam'a al Kabeer. Ibn abd al Bar al Namari al Gortabie al Maleky, Abu Amar Yusef ibn Abdillahi ibn abd al bar (died 463H), al Asateeb fe Ma'rafat al Ahsab, Vol. 3 page 1047, research: Ali Muhammad al Bajawee, Publisher: Darol Jeel-Beirut, al taba'at: al Wali, 1412H. Al Mazi, Abul Hajaja Yusef ibn al Zakie Abd al Rahman (died 742H), Tahzeeb al Kamal, vol. 19, page 225, research: D. Bashir Awad ma'roof, Publisher: Mosaseh al Rasaleh-Beirut, al taba'at: al Wali 1400H-1980M; Al Saqalanie, Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Hajar abol Fazl (died 852H), Talkhees al Habeer fe Ahadeeth al Raf'aie al Kabeer, Vol. 2, page 145, research Al Sa'eed Abullah Hashem al Yamani al Madanie, Publisher: Al Madina al Manwarh – 1384H – 1964M.

Haythamie says after the narration of this tradition:

الهيثمى، ابوالحسن نور الدين علي بن أبي بكر (متوفى 807 هـ)، رواه الطبراني وقال الحش البستان ورجاله ثقات. مجمع الزوائد ومنبع الفوائد، ج 9، ص 95، ناشر: دار الريان للتراث/ دار الكتاب العربي - القاهرة، بيروت - 1407 هـ.

Al Haythamie, Abul Hasan Noor aldeen Ali ibn Abi Bakr (died 807H), Majma al Za wa'id Wamanab'a al Fawa'id, Vol. 9, page 95, Publisher: Darol Rabon al Latarath /Darol Ketab al Araby – Al Ghaharut, Beirut -1407H.

وقال : مراسيل مالك أصح من مراسيل سعيد بن المسيب ومن مراسيل الحسن ومالك اصح الناس مراسلاً وقال سفيان : إذا قال مالك بلغني فهو إسناد. وقال يحيى بن سعيد : مراسلات مالك صحاح. وقال يحيى كان أصحابنا يقولون مراسلات مالك إسناده. قال ابن وهب مالك والليث إسناد وإن لم يسند أو قال إبراهيم الحربي مالك لا يرسل إلا عن ثقة وسئل أحمد بن حنبل عن حديث جعفر بن محمد فقال ما أقول فيه وفيه وقد روى عنه مالك.

“It is possible that a person might say that this tradition has a flaw in its transmission, because Malek ibn Ans died in 179H and the tradition was not narrated before his death; therefore, it has no value.”

In answer to this question we say that Ahl Sunnat Scholars transmissions by Imam Malek say that the same tradition is accepted as a correct chain of transmission. Concerning this case Ghazie Iyaz writes the following, ***“Traditions transmitted by malek are more correct then those transmitted by Sa’eed ibn Maseeb and Hasan Basari. Furthermore Malek has far more correct transmissions.”*** Sufiyan Thory says, ***“When Malek says that this tradition has reached me for me(Sufiyan Thory) it is proof.”*** Yayah ibn Sa’eed says, ***“Malek’s transmissions are the most correct transmissions and are equal to his dignity.”*** Ibn Wahab says, ***“Malek said the Lion is proof even though you do not mention its proof of transmission.”*** Ibrahim Harbi says, ***“Malek narrated traditions by way of transmission as long as they were trusty.”*** Ahmad ibn Hanbal was asked about Ja’far ibn Muhammad’s traditons; he then said, ***“What should I say concerning him when Malek narrated traditions for him.”***

القاضي عياض، ابوالفضل عياض بن موسي بن عياض اليحصبي السبتي (متوفى 544هـ)، ترتيب المدارك وتقريب المسالك لمعرفة أعلام مذهب مالك، ج 1، ص 66، تحقيق : محمد سالم هاشم، ناشر : دار الكتب العلمية - بيروت، الطبعة : الاولى، 1418هـ - 1998م.

Al Ghazie Ayaz, Abul Fozal Ayaz ibn Musa ibn Ayaz al Yahsee Al Sabatie (died 544H), Tarteef al Madarak Wataghareeb al Mesalak al Ma'rafat A'alam Mazhab Malek Vol. 1, page 66, research: Muhammad Salam Hashem, Publisher: Darol al Ketab al Alameyeh- Beirut, al taba'at al Wali, 1418H-1998M.

Hence, this flaw is also rejected; it is correct to say that narrations are transmitted; however, because the transmitter is Malek that same tradition is proof and correct for the Ahl Sunnat, it serves as evidence for them.

The Third Tradition:

Tabari writes in his book on History:

ذكر الخبر عن الموضع الَّذِي دُفِنَ فِيهِ عُثْمَانُ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ وَمَنْ صَلَّى عَلَيْهِ وَوَلِيَ أَمْرَهُ بَعْدَ مَا قُتِلَ إِلَى أَنْ فَرَغَ مِنْ أَمْرِهِ وَدَفَنَهُ
حَدَّثَنِي جَعْفَرُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْمُحَمَّدِيُّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عَمْرُو بْنُ حَمَادٍ، وَعَلِي بْنُ حُسَيْنٍ، قَالَا: حَدَّثَنَا حُسَيْنُ بْنُ عِيْسَى، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ أَبِي مَيْمُونَةَ، عَنْ أَبِي بَشِيرٍ الْعَابِدِيِّ، قَالَ: نَبَذَ عُثْمَانُ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ ثَلَاثَةَ أَيَّامٍ لَا يَدْفَنُ، ثُمَّ إِنَّ حَكِيمَ بْنَ حَزَامٍ الْقُرَشِيَّ، ثُمَّ أَحَدَ بَنِي أَسَدَ بْنَ عَبْدِ الْعَزَى، وَجَبْرِ بْنَ مَطْعَمَ بْنَ عَدِي بْنِ نَوْفَلٍ بَنَ عَبْدِ مَنَافٍ كَلِمًا عَلِيًّا فِي دَفْنِهِ، وَطَلَبَا إِلَيْهِ أَنْ يَأْذَنَ لِأَهْلِهِ فِي ذَلِكَ فَعَفَلَ، وَأَذَنَ لَهُمَا عَلِيٌّ، فَلَمَّا سَمِعَ بِذَلِكَ قَعَدُوا لَهُ فِي الطَّرِيقِ بِالْحَجَارَةِ، وَخَرَجَ بِهِ نَاسٌ يَسِيرُ مِنْ أَهْلِهِ، وَهُمْ يَرِيدُونَ بِهِ حَائِطًا بِالْمَدِينَةِ، يُقَالُ لَهُ حَشْ كُوكَبٍ، كَانَتْ الْيَهُودُ تَدْفِنُ فِيهِ مَوْتَاهُمْ، فَلَمَّا خَرَجَ بِهِ عَلَى النَّاسِ رَجَمُوا سَرِيرَهُ، وَهَمُّوا بِطَرَحِهِ.

فَبَلَغَ ذَلِكَ عَلِيًّا، فَأَرْسَلَ إِلَيْهِمْ يَعِزُّهُمْ عَلَيْهِمْ لِيَكْفَنَ عَنْهُ، فَفَعَلُوا، فَانْطَلَقَ حَتَّى دُفِنَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ فِي حَشْ كُوكَبٍ، فَلَمَّا ظَهَرَ مُعَاوِيَةُ بْنُ أَبِي سُفْيَانَ عَلَى النَّاسِ، أَمَرَ بِهَدْمِ ذَلِكَ الْحَائِطِ، حَتَّى أَفْضَى بِهِ إِلَى الْبَقِيعِ، فَأَمَرَ النَّاسَ أَنْ يَدْفِنُوا مَوْتَاهُمْ حَوْلَ قَبْرِهِ حَتَّى اتَّصَلَ ذَلِكَ بِمَقَابِرِ الْمُسْلِمِينَ.

“The story mentioned about the area where Othman was buried, who performed the prayer, who was employed to take responsibility for the shroud, and burying him after he was murdered.

It is narrated from Abi Bashir al Abadee that Othman was left unburied for three days; therefore, Hakim ibn Hazam Qurashi one of the Bani Asad ibn Abd al Azy and Jabeer ibn Mo'taem with Ali (A.S.) talked concerning his burial. They

requested that the family give them permission to bury him. His eminences gave them permission.

When they heard about the matter they were carrying the grave stone along with them while on route, they sat down; some people came to offer help to his family. They had the intention to bury Othman in Baq'ee Medina which they called Hashm Khokab, there the Jews too buried their dead. When they brought Othman's body out the people made Othman's tomb stone a target and they wanted to throw his body onto the ground.

When this news reached Ali (A.S.) he sent someone and gave the order to leave him (meaning Othman) and so they accepted his order. They (family members) then took Othman's body to the entrance of Hashm Kokab to bury him there. When Muawiyah took over the government of the people he gave the order to destroy the wall so that Baq'ee could be connected, he then ordered the people to bury their dead around Othman's grave site so that his grave could be connected with the graves of the Muslims."

الطبري، أبو جعفر محمد بن جرير بن يزيد بن كثير بن غالب (متوفى 310)، تاريخ الطبري، ج 2، ص 687، ناشر: دار الكتب

العلمية - بيروت؛

ابن الجوزي الحنبلي، جمال الدين ابوالفرج عبد الرحمن بن علي بن محمد (متوفى 597 هـ)، المنتظم في تاريخ الملوك والأمم، ج 5، ص 58، ناشر: دار

صادر - بيروت، الطبعة: الأولى، 1358.

Al Tabari, Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn Jarear ibn Yazeed ibn Kathir ibn Ghaleb (died 310H) Tarekh al Tabari, Vol.2, page 687. Publisher: Darol Ketab al Alameh-Beirut; Ibn al Jozi al Hanabali, Jamal aldeen Abu al Farj Abd al Rahman ibn Ali ibn Muhammad (died 597H), Al Muntazam fe Al Malouk Wal A'mam. Vol. 5 page 58, Publisher: Darol Sadar-Beirut, al Taba'at: al Wali, 1358H.

Muhammad ibn Yayah Andelusie writes this about Othman's murder:

وقد ذكر الجاحظ أن عمارا قام وسط مسجد المدينة فقال نحن قتلنا عثمان كافرا وكان يمنع أن يدفن في مقابر المسلمين وأن يصلي عليه في مصلاهم حتى ترك على مزبلة ثلاثة أيام لم يدفن فدفنه ابن الزبير في خفية في بئر في حش كوكب ومحمد بن أبي بكر في بني تميم يعاونون عمارا

"Jahez narrates that Omar stood up in the middle of the Masjid and said, 'we killed Othman while he while he was in a state of unbelief.' He prevent the burial of Othman in the Muslim grave yards and also when they wanted to perform prayers for him in the Muslim public pray places he prevented them from doing so. This went on until his body remained for three days in a garbage dump

unburied, and his son Zabeer then secretly buried his body in a hole in Hashr Kokab; Moreover, Muhammad ibn Abi Bakr along with Banim Tiya helped Omar in this action."

المالقي الأندلسي، محمد بن يحيى بن أبي بكر (متوفى 741هـ)، التمهيد والبيان في مقتل الشهيد عثمان، ج 1،

ص225، تحقيق : د. محمود يوسف زايد، ناشر : دار الثقافة - الدوحة - قطر، الطبعة : الأولى، 1405هـ.
Al Malaghee Al Andalusie, Muhammad ibn Yahya ibn Abi Bakr (died 741H), Al Tameheed Val Beyan fe Moghat al Shaheed Othman, Vol. 1, page 225, research: D. Muhammad Yusef Zayid, Publisher; Darol Al Thagagat- al Daweh- Qatar, al taba'at: al Wali, 1405H.

Ibn Khaldun writes in his introduction:

وكان قتله لثمان عشرة خلت من ذي الحجة وبقي في بيته ثلاثة أيام.

"Othman was murdered on the 18th of Zhial Hajjah and his body remained for three days in his home."

إبن خلدون الحضرمي، عبد الرحمن بن محمد (متوفى 808 هـ)، مقدمة ابن خلدون، ج 2، ص601، ناشر: دار القلم - بيروت - 1984، الطبعة: الخامسة.

Ibn Khaldun al Hozarmie, Abd al Rahman (died 808H), Meghdameh ibn Khaldun, vol. 2 page 601. Publisher: Darol al Ghalam- Beirut- 1984, Al taba'at: Al Khamesa.

Certainly just because his corpus remained in his home is not reason to disprove all of the narrations which were stated saying that his corpus was thrown in a garbage dump and for three days his body remained there.

In conclusion:

If there were good relations between Othman and the Ahla Bait (A.S.) then why did they refrain from performing Othman's burial and give permission to leave his body for three days in garbage site in Medina? Furthermore, why did not Amir al Mo'mineen (A.S.), Imam's Hasan and Husain (A.S.) take steps to have him buried?