

Yasini:

Everyday Wahabis spread the rumour that the martyrdom of Lady Fatima (as) is a myth and that she passed away by natural death. Please refute this matter from the sources of Ahl Sunna for our viewers.

Ghazvini:

This matter which you have mentioned started from the day that the Iranian Consultation agreed that the day of Lady Fatima's (as) martyrdom must be a day off for the nation and the Wahabis realized that every year, the gatherings for this is greater than the previous year. This was not acceptable for the Wahabais or the extremists of Ahl Sunna. Therefore they started their rumour inside and outside of [the country](#), on websites, television programs, and Friday prayer sermons that the martyrdom of Lady Fatima (as) is nothing more than a myth. Even one of the famous Sunni Imams in Iran started to swear by the names of God and that the relationship which the Shias narrate between Imam Ali (as) and the caliphs is a lie.

If you have the ability in this regard, refute and debate it, and if you have any proof of the natural death of Lady Fatima (as), provide it. You swear that Lady Fatima (as) has died a natural death, and on the other hand the Shias swear that she (as) was martyred. What does this mean? Two contradicting oaths. [So the matter still stays the same.](#)

For three days last year, by the order of one of the Marjas, I participated in a debate on the Al-Mustaghla television program which belongs to the Wahabis and is funded by the Saudi government. By providing authentic and strong evidence by the will of Allah SWT, I proved that the attack on the house of Lady Fatima (as), her martyrdom, her ribs being broken, and the martyrdom of Muhsin (as) is the truth and it has been narrated many times in the books of Ahl Sunna with different chains and sources. Among those sources are Tabarani and the Islamic History of Dahabi. Respected brothers and sisters of Ahl Sunna, know very well that Dahabi is amongst the most reliable and important scholars of Ahl Sunna. He does not narrate anything which is against the beliefs of Ahl Sunna, especially if it is against the caliphs. If he narrates them, he quickly refutes them. Even if he does not provide logical proof to deny the rank of the Holy Ahlul-bait (as), or the matters related to the caliphs, he only says:

يشهد القلب أنه باطل.

My heart testifies this is false.

Meaning one of the ways that Mr Dahabi refuses things is his heart. If his heart testifies that a narration is false, then it is false, even if it is narrated by the most trustworthy of the trustworthies and has an authentic chain. By having in mind that this is the personality of Mr Dahabi, he narrates this hadith from the first caliph in his "*History of Islam*, Volume 3, page 117" ([3جلد اسلام، تاریخ](#)، [Taareekh Al Islam \(The History of Islam\), volume 3, page 117](#)) regarding the martyrdom of Lady Fatima (as) and the attack on her house, without having any disagreements with it. Tabarani also records this in his ([1جلد كبير، معجم](#)) ([Al Muujam Al Kabeer, volume 1, page 62](#)). The text of the hadith is long. Abu Bakr during the last minutes of his life, in a gathering of his companions says:

There are few things which I did not do but I wish I had done them and there are few things which I did do, but I wish I had not done them.

Among the deeds which Abu Bakr said he regrets is the attack on the house of Lady Fatima (as). He says:

ثلاث و فعلتهن أني وددت أفعلن لم ثلاث و أفعلن لم أني وددت فعلتهن، ثلاث على إلا شئ على آسي لا أني أني فوددت :أفعلن لم أني وددت اللاتي الثلاث فأما عنهن، سلم و عليه الله صلى الله رسول سألت أني وددت ... الحرب علي أغلق أن و تركته و فاطمة بيت كشفت أكن لم

There are 3 things which I regret doing and which I regret not doing. ...I wish I had not ordered the attack on the house of Fatima (as). I wish I had left this battle aside.

5ج الهندي، للمتقي العمال كنز - 46ص، 2ج الحديد، أبي لابن البلاغة نهج شرح - 202ص، 5ج للهيشمي، الزوائد مجمع 619ص، 2ج الطبري، تاريخ - 418ص، 30ج عساكر، لابن دمشق مدينة تاريخ - 631ص

Majmaa Al Zawaa'id (Collection of Provisions), Al Haythami, volume 5, page 202;
Sharh Nahj Al Balaagha (Interpretation of Nahj Al Balaagha (Peak of Eloquence)), Ibn Bi Al Hadeed, volume 4, page 46;
Kanz Al 'Ummaal (Treasure of the Doers of Good Deeds), AL Muttaqi Al Hindi, volume 5, page 631;
Taareekh Madeenat Dimashq (The History of Damascus), Ibn Asaakir, volume 30, page 418;
Taareekh Al Tabari (History of Al Tabari), Al TRabari, volume 2, page 619.

This means that the matter was in a way that the first caliph had viewed the attack on the house of Lady Fatima (as) as war. This is a matter which the most reliable scholars of Ahl Sunna have mentioned. Mr Zia' aldin Muqaddasy, who is among the most important scholars of Ahl Sunna, belonging to the Hanbali school of thought, and whom Dahabi praises as an "Imam" and a knower of the science of Rijal (see 4ج للذهبي، الحفاظ تذكرة 1405ص)، when he reaches this narration he says: 1405ص، 4ج للذهبي، الحفاظ تذكرة

Tathkirat Al Haafith (The Memory of the Memorizer), volume 4, page 1405.

This narration about Abu Bakr admitting, is Sahih (Authentic)
90-88ص، 10ج المختارة، الأحاديث

Al Ahaadeeth Al Mukhtaara (The Chosen Hadiths (Sayings)), volume 10, pages 88-90.

Also Soyuti has a book by the name of "Musnad Fatima" (فاطمة مسند) and in page 34 classifies this hadith as authentic.

Hasan Ibn Farhan Malaki who is amongst the great Ahl Sunna scholars of Saudi says:

إن هي ثابتة بأسانيد صحيحة، بل هي ذكرى مؤلمة.

The hadith about the attack on the house of Fatima (as), has been narrated by authentic chains, and this matter is a sad and painful event.

52ص العقائد، كتب في قراءة

Qiraa'a fi Kutub Al Aqaa'id (A Reading in the Books of Doctrines), page 52.

Even Ibn Tayymia Harani cannot ignore the many narrations about the attack on the house of Lady Fatima (as) and he says:

يقسمه الذي الله مال من شئ فيه هل لينظر البيت، كيس إنه :يقال ما غاية

Abu Bakr and Umar broke into the house of Lady Fatima (as) to see if there is anything in her house from the Muslim's money (Beytul Maal) so they could give it to the needy.

Where did Ibn Tayymia obtain such a conclusion? Did Umar himself say that he attacked the house of Lady Fatima (as) to see if there was any money from Bayul Maal to distribute it amongst the Muslims? Or have the narrators and scholars of Ahl sunna testified such thing? How can Ibn Taymmia in the 8th century come up with such a thing that it was the intention of the second caliph?

Even though we have many narrations by Ibn Aby Shuba, Tabari, and Buladzery who have recorded the occasion in which Umar came behind the door of the house of Lady Fatima (as) and said: "I swear by Allah (SWT)! If you do not come out to give oath of allegiance, I will burn down the house with everyone inside!"

His intentions and well as his words are this!

Interestingly, Juyuni, the teacher of Dahabi, whom Dahabi praises as Imam (see ج 4، للذهبي، الحفاظ تذكرة، (Tathkirat Al Haafith (The Memory of the Memorizer), volume 4, page 1505), man narrates a hadith from the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) in (2، جلد السمطين، فرائد) (Faraa'id Al Simtayn, volume 2 page 34):

After me, they will break Fatima's XXXXX, her Muhsin will be XXXXX, and Fatima will then join me:

مقتولة مغصوبة مغمومة.

They have martyred her while she is angry and her right has been taken away from her.

This is a clear testimony on the Martyrdom of Lady Fatima (as).

Shahrestani himself in (النحل و الملل) (Al Milal wa Al Nahl) narrates from Naddam, who is amongst the prominent scholars of Ahl Sunna, that

دارها احرقوا يصيح كان و بطنها من الجنين القت حتي البيعة يوم السلام عليها فاطمه بطن ضرب عمر إن الحسين و الحسن و فاطمة و على غير الدار في كان ما و فيها بمن.

The second caliph struck the stomach of Fatima (as) in a way that it caused her to lose her unborn child. Umar cried: "Burn the house with all of them inside!" There was no one in the house except Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Hussain.

بيروت المعرفة دار چاپ، 57، ص 1، ج للشهرستاني، النحل و الملل

Al Milal wa Al Nahl, Shahrastaani, volume 1, page 57, Daar Al Maarifa, Beirut.

Are these narrations by Shias? Shahrestani died in year 548 hijri. These matters have been for the past and the martyrdom of Lady Fatima (as) and losing her unborn child and breaking her XXXX, have been mentioned by both Shias and Sunnis. Therefore, we can not say such matters are myths.

Yes, we also wish it was a myth, and that such attack on the house of Lady Fatima (as) would not happen. We also wish such thing had not happened and the heart of the daughter of The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) would not be broken only a few days after the death of her holy father. We also wish that Amirul Mu'menin (as) had not gone through such troubles, and that the heart of the Holy Imams (as) would not be hurt so in every opportunity and time they would not mention it and weep. Yes, we also wish such thing had never happened but it did happen and faced Islam with a bitter situation after the death of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) as it left a black mark in the history of Islam.

Yasini:

Wahabis put the claim forward that by having in mind the bravery of Amirul Mu'menin (as), why did he allow such people to attack and hurt Lady Fatima (as) and why did he not defend her?

Ghazvini:

First point:

Yes, we also believe that the bravery of Amirul Mu'menin was well known. Even the second caliph use to say:

لو لا سيف علي لما قام عمود الإسلام.

If it was not for the sword of Ali, the basis of Islam would never stand tall.

Dear viewers should also pay attention to this; especially the third part where they attacked the house of Lady Fatima (as) and also (lets also go to this view too) the story that Lady Fatima (as) was sitting beside the door and Amirul Mu'menin (as) and Zubair and few of Bani Hashim were inside, and were talking, and how they informed Abu Bakr how they were plotting against him. Abu Bakr orders the second caliph to bring Hazrat Ali (as) by any means, and drag him to the Mosque for allegiance. When they reached the door of the house of Lady Fatima (as), and when Lady Fatima (as) saw them coming, she closed the door and Umar said:

الباب افتحي! فاطمة يا

O Fatima! Open the door!

Hazrat Fatima (as) refused to open the door.

It did not even take them one minute to kick down the door trapping Lady Fatima (as) behind the door. All these have been recorded in reliable sources.

When Amirul Mu'menin (as) came out and saw Lady Fatima (as) has fallen down next to the door and her holy XXXX has broken and she was beaten:

الله صلى الله رسول قول فذكر بقتله، هم و رقبتة و أنفه وجأ و فصرعه نتره ثم بتلابيبه، أخذ و علي فوثب به أوصاه ما و آله و عليه

Ali grabbed Umar's belt and threw him on the floor and punched his neck and nose. In this time Ali remembered the will of Allah's Messenger who had told him: "If you want Islam to stay firm and my name alive, you must not use your sword to fight them."

There for Amirul Mu'menin (as) said to Umar:

و الذي كرم محمدا بالنبوة! يا بن صهاك! لولا كتاب من الله سبق و عهد عهده إلي رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله لعلمت إنك لا تدخل بيتي.

I swear by the God who appointed Mohammad as Prophet! Oh son of Sahak! If it was not for the divine order and the will of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF), you would have known you do not have the power to enter my house!.

150 ص الأنصاري، باقر محمد تحقيق قيس، بن سليم كتاب

Kitaab Saleem Bin Qays (Saleem Bin Qays's Book), page 150, investigated by Muhammad Baaqir Al Ansaari.

Mr Aloosi, who is amongst the great scholars of Ahl Sunna, narrates the same event in his commentary and says:

السوط رفع و المبارك جنبها به فوجاً غمده في هو و السيف عمر فرقع الله، رسول يا و أبتاه يا صاح و رقبتة و أنفه وجأ و هزه و عمر بتلابيب علي فأخذ أبتاه، يا فصاحت ضرعها به فضررب

She cried: O Father! O Messenger of Allah! Umar hit Fatima's (as) XXX with the sword which was in its scabbard, and he raised his whip and hit Fatima with it, so she cried: O Father! Ali grabbed Umar from his belt and threw him on the floor and punched his neck and nose.

124 ص، ج3، الآلوسي، تفسير

Tafseer Al Aaloosi (Al Aaloosi's Interpretation), volume 3, page 124.

Aloosi records this and he has no disagreements with it and does not deny it.

As for those people who ask why Hazrat Ali (as) did not defend his wife, they must look to these narrations.

For the three years which I have been in the company of the viewers of Salaam TV, we do not cite these narrations, but when we see that Wahabis, or those who have been led astray by Wahabis publish such information and make fun of it, and Nauzubillah, accuse Amirul Mu'menin (as) of being a coward, we see no other option but to show these truths and defend Amirul Mu'menin (as) and Lady Fatima (as) as well as we can.

Second Point:

Amirul Mu'menin (as) said:

The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) had ordered that I must not kill anyone in this regard.

Third Point:

If Amirul Mu'menin (as) had used his sword and had fought against them, they would have tried to defend themselves and a fight would start in the house of Amirul Mu'menin (as) and surely Lady Fatima (as), Imam Hasan (as) and Imam Hussain (as) would have been killed in between. Then would not these people say that the killer of Lady Fatima (as) and Imam Hasan (as) and Imam Hussain (as) is Imam Ali (as)? If Imam Ali (as) had given allegiance would they not have been killed?

Please note that the Holy Prophet said regarding Ammar –

“Ammar will be killed by a rebellious aggressive group. Ammar will invite them to [obey] Allah and they will invite him to the [Hell] fire.”

Bukhari, Volume 4, Book 52, Number 67

Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, the leader of the Hanbali school, in his Musnad writes:

When Ammar was killed, some of the men from army of Muawia stopped fighting and said to Muawia: we will not fight anymore. Muawia asked why and they said: Because the Prophet said “Ammar will be killed by a rebellious aggressive group” and it has been proven we are the rebellious aggressive group. Amro Ibn AlSaid: Muawia! Some of the commanders have stopped fighting. Muawia said:

دحضت في بولك، أو نحن قتلناه؟ إنما قتله على و أصحابه جاؤوا به حتى ألقوه بين رماحنا أو بين سيوفنا.

Was it we who killed Ammar? The killers of Ammar are Ali and his companions who brought Ammar and placed him in front of our swords.

مدینه تاریخ - 420 ص، 1 ج للذهبي، النبلاء اعلام سير - 189 ص، 8 ج للبيهقي، الكبرى السنن - 199 ص، 4 ج احمد، مسند مجمع - 124 ص، 13 ج بعلي، ابو مسند - 240 ص، 11 ج صنعاني، الرزاق لعبد المصنف - 431 ص، 43 ج عساكر، لابن دمشق 155 ص، 2 ج النيشابوري، للحاكم الصحيحين المستدرک - 242 ص، 7 ج للهيثمی، الزوائد

Musnad Ahmad, volume 4, page 199;

Al Sunan Al Kubraa (The Great Sunnahs), Al Bayhaqi, volume 8, page 189;

Siyar Aalaam Al Nubalaa (Stories of the Knowledgeable Nobles), Al Thahabi, volume 1, page 420;

Taareekh Madinat Dimashq (The History of Damascus), Ibn Aasaakir, volume 43, page 431;

Al Munsif, Abdul Razzaaq Al Sanaani, volume 11, page 240;

Musnad Abu Baali, volume 13, page 134;

Majmaa Al Zawaa'id (Collection of Provisions), Al Haithami, volume 7, page 242;

Al Mustadrak Al Saheehayn, Al Haakim Al Neeshaaboori, volume 2, page 155.

I advice those whom in their speeches use the words “Hazrat” for Muawia and praise him to at least pay attention to this evidence and contemplate it.

Ahman Ibn Hanbal says that whatever tradition which is not in his book is not trustworthy, and that he has collected all narrations which he had considered to be authentic.

It is interesting to note that Manawi, one of the great Ulema of Ahl Sunna, says that the news reached Ali that Muawia says the killer of Ammar is Ali and the rebellious group is the army of Ali. Ali (as) replied:

أُخْرِجَهُ حِينَ حَمْزَةَ قَتَلَ إِذْنِ سَلَّمَ وَ عَلَيْهِ اللَّهُ صَلَّى اللَّهُ رَسُولُ بَأْنِ

So then the killer of Hamza is the Messenger of Allah as he brought him and placed him in front of the swords of the nonbelievers.

فيض القدير شرح الجامع الصغير للمناوي، ج6، ص474

Fayd Al Qadeer Sharih AL Jaamii AL Sagheer (The Emanation from The Capable, Interpretation of the Little Collection), AL Manaawi, volume 5, page 474.

So it is clear that if Amirul Mu'menin (as) had used his sword, it would have been bad for him, and he could not defend himself as the means of spreading the news was in control of the opponents.

Fourth Point:

You say Amirul Mu'menin (as) was the hero of battles and he was the fighter of the battles of Badr, Uhud, Khaybar ad Hunain, and how his sword was the nightmare of the enemies and even the second caliph would admit:

By Allah! If it was not for the sword of Ali, the basis of Islam would not stand tall.

82 ص، ج12 الحديد، أبي لإبن البلاغة نهج شرح

Sharh Nahj Al Balaagha (Interpretation of Nahj Al Balaagha (Peak of Eloquence)), Ibn Bi Al Hadeed, volume 12, page 82.

We ask the people of Ahl Sunna and Wahabis that during the 25 years of the leadership of Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman, what happened to the sword of Ali (as)? What happened to the bravery of Ali (as)? Why did he not participate in any battles? Had he (as) lost his bravery or was sword useless? Or was it that Amirul Mu'menin (as) did not view the leadership of the caliphs to be legitimate and did not view the conquering as Islamic? The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) did not order for conquering and in the time of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) he would never conquer any place.

Therefore, Amirul Mu'menin (as) chose silence and by proving the oppression that had befallen him and Lady Fatima (as) and by their behaviour, he put a red mark around the leadership of the caliphs.

Yasini:

They say that although Hazrat Ali (as) was in his house, why did Hazrat Fatima (as) open the door and why did Hazrat Ali (as) not open the door?

Ghazvini:

This propaganda which you have mentioned is being spread around by the Wahabis in different television programs that it is against the nature of a man to sit in his house while his wife opens the door for non-Mahrams.

First:

In the reliable books of Shias like Tafsir A'yashi and Bihar Alanwar of Majlesi (ra) and alekhtesas of Shaikh Mofid (ra) we see that Hazrat Fatima (as) was sitting next to the door and it is narrated from Umar himself:

يدخل لا أن تشك لا هي و وجوههم في الباب أغلقت عليها الله صلوات فاطمة فرأتهم الباب إلى انتهينا فلما ... دخلوا ثم سعف، من كان و فكسره برجله الباب عمر فضرِبَ بأذنها، إلا عليها .

When we reached the house, Fatima (as) saw us and closed the door and Fatima (as) had no doubt that they would not enter without permission. Umar kicked the door with his leg, broke the door and entered.

تفسير - 186 ص المفيد، للشيخ الاختصاص - 67 ص، 2 ج العياشي، تفسير - 227 ص، 28 ج المجلسي، للعلامة الأنوار بحار، 93، 2 ج البرهان،

Bihaar Al Anwaar (Oceans of Pearls), Al Majlisi, volume 28, page 227;

Tafseer Al Aayyaashi (Al Aayyaashi's Interpretation), Al Aayyaashi, volume 2, page 67;

Al Ikhtisaas (Specialization), Al Sheikh Al Mufeed, page 186;

Tafseer Al Burhaan (Interpretation of the Evidence), Volume 2, page 93.

Second:

Amirul Mu'menin (as) and Hazrat Fatima (as) believed that they would not enter the house without their permission, as they had surely read this holy verse:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتًا غَيْرَ بُيُوتِكُمْ حَتَّى تَسْتَأْذِنُوا وَتُسَلِّمُوا عَلَى أَهْلِهَا ذَلِكَ خَيْرٌ لَكُمْ لَعَلَّكُمْ تَذَكَّرُونَ

O you who believe! Do not enter houses other than your own houses until you have asked permission and saluted their inmates; this is better for you, that you may be mindful.

24:27

فَإِنْ لَمْ تَجِدُوا فِيهَا أَحَدًا فَلَا تَدْخُلُوهَا حَتَّى يُؤْذَنَ لَكُمْ وَإِنْ قِيلَ لَكُمْ ارْجِعُوا فَارْجِعُوا هُوَ أَزْكَى لَكُمْ وَاللَّهُ بِمَا تَعْمَلُونَ عَلِيمٌ

But if you do not find any one therein, then do not enter them until permission is given to you; and if it is said to you: Go back, then go back; this is purer for you; and Allah is cognizant of what you do.

24:28

Amirul Mu'menin (as) and Hazrat Fatima (as) believed they would not enter the house, so the idea of Hazrat Fatima (as) opening the door was not even an option, rather they were inside. Amirul Mu'menin (as) was in the room and Hazrat Fatima (as) was sitting next to the door, and those people broke the door and entered. The rumor that Lady Fatima (as) opened the door is merely a lie.

Third:

Lady Fatima (as) and Amirul Mu'menin (as) believed that people would remember the saying of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) because after all, Allah (SWT) said:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتًا غَيْرَ بُيُوتِكُمْ حَتَّى تَسْتَأْذِنُوا وَتُسَلِّمُوا عَلَى أَهْلِهَا ذَلِكَ خَيْرٌ لَكُمْ لَعَلَّكُمْ تَذَكَّرُونَ

O you who believe! Do not enter houses other than your own houses until you have asked permission and saluted their inmates; this is better for you, that you may be mindful.

24:27

(this point is redundant)

And in the following Holy Verses said:

فِي بُيُوتٍ أُذِنَ لِلَّهِ أَنْ تُرْفَعَ وَ يُذَكَرَ فِيهَا اسْمُهُ يُسَبِّحُ لَهُ فِيهَا بِالْغُدُوِّ وَالْآصَالِ

In houses which Allah has permitted to be exalted and that his name may be remembered in them; there glorify Him therein in the mornings and the evenings,

24:36

Suyuti narrates that when the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) recited this Holy Verse

فقام اليه رجل، فقال: أي بيوت هذه يا رسول الله؟ قال: بيوت الأنبياء، فقام اليه أبوبكر، فقال: يا رسول الله! هذا البيت منها لبیت علي و فاطمة؟ قال: نعم، من أفاضلها

A man got up and said: O Messenger of Allah (SWT)! Which houses is this holy verse referring to? He (the Holy Prophet) said: The houses of Prophets. Abu Bakr got up and said: O Messenger of Allah (SWT)! Is the house of Ali (as) and Fatima (as) among them? He [the Holy Prophet] said: Yes, rather it is **among** the most exalted **ones**.

الدر المنثور للسيوطي، ج5، ص50 - شواهد التنزيل للحاكم الحسكاني، ج1، ص534 - تفسير الألوسي، ج18، ص174

Al Durr Al Manthoor (The Scattered Pearls), Al Sayuti, volume 5, page 50;

Shawaahid Al Tanzeel (Evidence of The Sending Down (of revelation))Al Haakim Al Haskaani, volume 1, page 534;

Tafseer Al Aaloosi (Al Aaloosi's Interpretation), Al Aaloosi, volume 18, page 174.

Having this in mind, Amirul Mu'menin (as) believed that these people view the house of Imam Ali (as) and Hazrat Fatima (as) among the houses of the Holy Prophets (PBUT). The houses of Holy Prophets (PBUT) require a special respect. Even if anyone wishes to enter the house of non-Prophets, they must still ask for permission.

Fourth:

And to answer those Wahabis which ask why did Lady Fatima (as) opened the door while Imam Ali (as) was in the house?

In your own books and history we read things like this narrated by Ibn Asakir that one day Ali (as) Ibn Abi Talib (as) came to the door of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF). The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) said to Umm Salma:

قومي فافتحي له.

Go open the door.

تاريخ مدينة دمشق لابن عساکر، ج42، ص471 - المناقب للخوارزمي، ص87

Taareekh Madinat Dimashq (The History of Damascus), Ibn Asaakir, volume 42, page 471;
Al Manaajib (Virtues), Al Khawarizmi, page 87.

So is it (NauzibiAllah) against the immoral acts for a man when the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) is in the house and asks Umm Salma to open the door? What is your answer to this?

Fifth:

One day Umar Ibn Khattab came to the house of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF):

قرع عمر بن الخطاب الباب و قال: افتحي يا خديجة.

Umar knocked on the door. The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) said: O Khadijah! Open the door.

جامع الأحاديث للسيوطي، ج36، ص345، حديث39496 - تاريخ مدينة دمشق لابن عساکر، ج44، ص35

Jaamii Al Ahaadeeth (Compiler of Sayings), Al Sayuti, volume 36, page 345, hadith no. 39496;
Taareekh Madinat Dimashq (The History of Damascus), Ibn Asaakir, volume 44, page 35.

What is your comment about this? Do you dare say that the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) did not have moral behaviour?

Sixth:

In some sources we read that once in Medina, Amirul Mu'menin (as) went to the house of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF), knocked on the door and Ayesha says:

من هذا؟ أنا علي.

Who is it? He (Ali (as)) said: I am Ali.

The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) heard Ali's (as) voice and said to Ayesha:

يا عايشة! افتحي له الباب.

Oh Ayesha! Open the door.

الإحتجاج للطبرسي، ج1، ص292 - بحار الأنوار للعلامة المجلسي، ج38، ص348

Al Ihtijaaj (Attestation), Al Tabrasi, volume 1, page 292;
Bihaar Al Anwaar (Oceans of Light), Al Majlisi, volume 38, page 348.

Do the Ahl Sunna followers also question this action of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) for ordering Ayesha to open the door?

Seventhly:

These people who say that a woman should not open the door for a non-mahram and that it is an immoral act, themselves have narrated such in their reliable books:

مرّ عمر برسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وهو عائشة و هما يأكلان حيسا، فدعاه فوضع يده، مع أيديهما، فأصابت يده عائشة، فقال: أوه، لو أطاع في هذه و صوابها ما رأتهن أعين.

Umar came to the house of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) and found the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) eating with Ayesha. Umar joined them and started to eat from the same plate and his hand touched Ayesha's hand. Umar said: If the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) would have listened to me and would keep his wife behind a screen, no one would see his wives.

المصنف لإبن أبي شيبة الكوفي، ج7، ص485 - مجمع الزوائد للهيثمي، ج7، ص93 - تفسير ابن أبي حاتم، ج10، ص48 - الأدب المفرد للبخاري، ج1، ص362

Al Munsif, Ibn Abi Shaiba Al Koofi, volume 7, page 485;

Majmaa Al Zawaa'id (Compilation of Provisions), Al Haithami, volume 7, page 93;

Tafseer Ibn Abi Haatem (Ibn Abi Haatem's Interpretation), Ibn Abi Haatem, volume 10, page 48;

Al Adab Al Mufrad, Al Bukhari, volume 1, page 362.

How is it that the presence of Lady Fatima (as) next to the door is an immoral act, while Umar touching the hand of Ayesha is not?

When these people mention such matters, we are left with no option but to speak more openly and clearly, and as Mr Hedaiaati says "present the hidden truth in a mannered way", and take off this screen on the truth which has being hidden for the past 15 centuries so that the youth of Ahl Sunna, Wahabis and Shias would know what has happened in history.

Whatever answer these people provide, we will also give the same answer for the matter relating Hazrat Fatima (as).

Yasini:

They claim that during those days, the houses of Midian did not have a door to hit Lady Fatima (as). Please provide your proof and evidence to reject this.

Ghazvini:

The people who claim the houses of Midian did not have a door, must also accept that the house of Imam Ali (as) was also without a door. Meaning they are probably clueless about history and have not even read their own narrations.

Abu Dawood in his Sunan, Volume 2 Page 527 narrates that a companion came to the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) and asked for something. The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) said to Umar: Take this key and go to my house, and give something to this man.

فأخذ المفتاح من حجزته ففتح.

Umar took the key and opened the lock on the house of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF).

So if houses did not have doors and they had curtains and wooden blinds instead, then did they put locks on curtains? Does a blind need to be opened?! These are things which these people are unaware of in history.

In Sahih Muslim, Volume 6, Page 105, Hadith 5136 it narrates:

و بالأبواب أن تغلق ليلا

In Medina, they ordered that people should lock the doors at night.

(These hadiths can be found in book 23 of the English translation of Sahih Muslim by Abdul Hamid Siddiqui)

Ibn Kathir Dameshghi in al-Bidayah wal-Nihayah narrates:

كانت حجره من شعر مربوطة بخشب من عرعر.

The house of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) was made out of cypress tree.

البداية و النهاية لابن كثير، ج3، ص268

Al Bidaaya wa Al Nihaaya (The Beginning and the End), Ibn Katheer, volume 3, page 268.

Even Bukhari narrates in his (**الأدب المفرد**) (Al Adab Al Mufrad) that one day Rawwi asks a companion about the location of Aeysha's house in the mosque, and the companion replies it was placed in the south of the mosque, and it's door would open to the north.

فقلت: مصراعا او مصراعين؟ قال: كان بمصراع واحد. قال: من أي شيء كان؟ قال: كان باب بيت عائشة من عرعر أو ساج.

I said: one or two shutters? he said: one shutter. I said: what is it made of? He said: Aisha's door was made of cypress or teak (wood).

(TO BE TRANSLATED BY SIS THANA^^^^) sorry pal, no can do.

الأدب المفرد للبخاري، ج1، ص272 - إمتاع الأسماع للمقريزي، ج10، ص93

Al Adab Al Mufrad, Al Bukhari, volume 1, page 272;

Imtaa Al Asmaa (Pleasing of Hearings), Al Maqreezi, volume 10, page 93.

We have many narrations in this regard that the houses of Medina had doors and the doors were usually made out of cypress and pine trees.

The house of Amirul Mu'menin (as) also had a door and it was from date palm. These matters are recorded in history and those people do not pay attention to them.

The questions of the viewers:

Question:

I am a Shia. Mr Ghazvini said that Hazrat Ali (as) did not use his sword against them and that he was not allowed to use his sword against them. Why does he not provide the true hadith in this regard?

Answer:

I testify that the respected brother is not a Shia because Shias do not talk this way. Everyone has their own way and manners. Let this brother come forward and say that he is Sunni and we will give more respect to answering the Sunni brothers.

At first Amirul Mu'menin (as) thought about this saying of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF):

ان وجدت ناصرا فقاتلهم و إلا فالصق كللكى علي الأرض.

If you had supporters then fight them. Otherwise, stay in your home.

شرح نهج البلاغة لابن أبي الحديد، ج20، ص326

Sharh Nahj Al Balaagha (Interpretation of the book Nahj Al Balaagha (Peak of Eloquence)), Ibn Abi Al Hadeed, volume 20, page 326.

In the same way that the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) during his 13 years in Mecca, did not use his sword against all the oppression, Amirul Mu'menin (as) following the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) did not use his sword as he did not have supporters. We have fully explained this in the previous meetings.

Question:

How did they name this 4-5 month unborn baby "Muhsen"? If he was born, how would his social rank stand? Would he be like Abu Bakr Ibn Ali (as) or Umar ibn Ali (as)?

Answer:

You can review the books of Ahl Sunna as we have found precisely 40 books of Ahl Sunna where they have proven that the fifth child of Lady Fatima (as) is Mohsen and the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) himself had given him that name. In addition, narrations state that we should chose a name for the baby when the sperm is placed in the mother's uterus. If the child dies before being born, it will complain against you to Allah (SWT) on the Day of Judgment. This is the order of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF).

Mas'udi Shafe'i in (إثبات الوصية، صفحہ 143) (Ithbaat Al Wasiyya (Proving the Will) page 143) narrates:

و ضغطوا سيدة النساء في الباب حتي أسقطت محسنا.

Fatima (as) was pressed so hard by the door that Her Muhsen died.

الطبقات الشافعية للسبكي، ج3، ص456 - سير اعلام النبلاء للذهبي، ج15، ص578 الوافي بالوفيات للصفدي، ج5، ص347 - الملل و النحل للشهرستاني

Al Tabaqaat Al Shaafi'iyya, Al Sabki, volume 3, page 456;

Siyar A'laam Al Nubalaa' (Stories of the Knowledgeable Nobles), Al Thahabi, volume 15, page 578;

Al Waafi Bilwafiyyaat (The Deliverer), Al Safadi, volume 5, page 347;

Al Mulal wa Al Nahl, Al Shahrastaani.

Question:

Why is it that after the martyrdom of Lady Fatima (as), when Umar became caliph, Hazrat Ali (as) had a good relationship with him?

Answer:

In the previous nights we mentioned that Hazrat Amirul Mu'menin (as) as the Imam had duties and among those duties was **attaining the Islamic matters**, protecting the Shariah, and assigning right judgment. If the leader was a Jew and Amirul Mu'menin (as) was also present, and if he realises that there is an unjust order and an innocent person is being stoned to death, Amirul Mu'menin (as) as the Imam has a divine order to go there, but not as a supporter to the leader. All the co-operations of Hazrat Ali (as) were solely his Islamic duties.

Question:

During the reign of the first two caliphs when they would conquer other civilizations, which companions accompanied them in those battles? If they had viewed Hazrat Ali (as) as the rightful caliph, why were they cooperating with the caliphs?

Answer:

These were with the order of Amirul Mu'menin (as). Some of the Marjas also say that they realized if they don't cooperate in some matters, their life would be in danger and it would even prepare the scenario for their murder. Some of the companions of Amirul Mu'menin (as) cooperated out of fear. Saying Imam Hasan (as) would accompany them in some battles is an absolute lie and we do not have any authentic or weak narrations in this regard. Whoever, either a Shia or Sunni, says Imam Hasan (as) participated in the battles, will be viewed as a liar.

Question:

Why did Hazrat Ali (as) give His daughter to Umar ibn Khatab?

Answer:

We have answered this in full detail.

First:

Many claim that this matter is a lie. Amirul Mu'menin (as) did not have a daughter by the name of "Umm Kulthum".

Second:

Some say Umme Kulthum was the step-daughter of Hazrat Ali (as), meaning she was the daughter of Abu Bakr from Asma' Bint Umais and she was raised in the house of Amirul Mu'menin (as) just like Mohammad Ibn Abu Bakr.

Third:

Some say she was the daughter of Hazrat Fatima (as) and they took her by force. Just like in books like Kaafi, (**مجمع الزوائد هيتمي**) (**Al Haithami's Majmaa Al Zawaa'id (Compilation of Provisions)**), and Mu'jam Tabarani (**معجم طبراني**) we read this matter was by force and Amirul Mu'menin (as) did not chose to fight these people.

Question:

Please tell us for how many years Imam Mahdi (as) will live?

Answer:

Whenever you tell us how long Hazrat Khidhr (PBUH) and Hazrat Idrees (PBUH) and Hazrat Isa (PBUH) will live, we will then tell you how long Imam Mahdi (as) will live.

But asking how old he (as) is right now, it is clear as the date of his birthday. The God which has the power to keep Hazrat Isa (PBUH) alive for about 2010 years, and Hazrat Khidr (PBUH) for more than three thousand years also has the power to keep Imam Mahdi (as) for one or two thousand years.

Question:

Having in mind that they have narrated two sources for the date that Lady Fatima (as) was martyred, one being 75 days and the other 95 days after the death of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF), which one do you consider more authentic?

Answer:

In my opinion, as a **Rajal** specialist, the source of 95 days is stronger than the one claiming 75 days.

Question:

Among the scholars of Ahl Sunna, which one has insisted in the superiority of Hazrat Fatima (as) over other daughters and all the Muslim women?

Answer:

This is very clear. In the Book of Sahih Bukhari we read:

فاطمة سيدة نساء أهل الجنة

Fatima is the leader of women in Jannah.

صحيح البخاري، ج4، ص209 - المستدرک الصحيحین للحاکم النیشابوری، ج3، ص151

Bukhari Volume 4, Book 56, Hadith 819

Al Haakim Al Neeshaaboori's Al Mustadrak Al Sahihayn, volume 3, page 151.

Ibn Athir says:

فاطمة سيدة نساء العالمين.

Fatima (as) is the leader of the women of the world.

أسد الغابة لابن الأثير، ج4، ص16

Ibn Atheer's Asad Al Ghaaba (Lion of the Jungle), volume 4, page 16.

Munawi, one of the well known personalities of Ahl Sunna, says:

إن فاطمة أفضل من الخلفاء الأربعة بالإتفاق.

Fatima (as) was higher than all 4 caliphs in the agreement of all scholars of Ahl Sunna.

« « « و السلام عليكم و رحمة الله و بركاته « « «