

Was 5:54 revealed for Abu Bakr?

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا مَنْ يَرْتَدَّ مِنْكُمْ عَنْ دِينِهِ فَسَوْفَ يَأْتِي اللَّهَ بِقَوْمٍ يُحِبُّهُمْ وَيُحِبُّونَهُ أَذِلَّةٌ عَلَى الْمُؤْمِنِينَ أَعِزَّةٌ عَلَى الْكَافِرِينَ يُجَاهِدُونَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ وَلَا يَخَافُونَ لَوْمَةَ لَائِمٍ ذَلِكَ فَضْلُ اللَّهِ يُؤْتِيهِ مَنْ يَشَاءُ وَاللَّهُ وَاسِعٌ عَلِيمٌ . المائدة / 54 .

*O you who believe! whoever from among you turns back from his religion, then Allah will bring a people, He shall love them and they shall love Him, lowly before the believers, mighty against the unbelievers, they shall strive hard in Allah's way and shall not fear the censure of any censurer; this is Allah's Face, He gives it to whom He pleases, and Allah is Ample-giving, Knowing.*

**5:54**

**Explaining the question:**

**Ahl Sunna claim that this Holy Verse is revealed for Abu Bakr about his battles against those who left Islam, what is your answer?**

**Answer:**

1. In this Holy Verse, Allah (SWT) has mentioned 3 of the personalities that this group promised group will have, and it is clear that none of these personalities are found in Abu Bakr, but in fact every one of these personalities are completely seen in Amirul Mu'menin, Imam Ali (as) and it did not exist in any of the 3 Khalifs.

a) بِقَوْمٍ يُحِبُّهُمْ وَيُحِبُّونَهُ (bring a people whom He loveth and who love Him)

The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) gave this personality to Imam Ali (as) in the day of Khaybar. In the very same battle that previously Abu Bakr and Umar were sent, but they were not successful and preferred to flee. The next day the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) said He (s) will give the stand/flag to the person whom Allah (SWT) and the Prophet (PBUH&HF) love him and he loves Allah (SWT) and the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) and that he will not flee or return as long as he hasn't won over the enemies.

All the companions present there, including Abu Bakr and Umar were hoping this honour would be given to them, but only one person deserved this special title of "who loves Allah and His Apostle and is loved by Allah and His Apostle" and others did not deserve such title. So the next day the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) gave the flag to the powerful hands of Haidar, Imam Ali (as)!

**Bukhari in his Sahih collection has narrated the story as:**

أَخْبَرَنِي سَهْلٌ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ يَعْنِي ابْنَ سَعْدٍ قَالَ قَالَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَوْمَ خَيْبَرَ لَأُعْطِينَ الرَّايَةَ غَدًا رَجُلًا يُفْتَحُ عَلَى يَدَيْهِ يُحِبُّ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ وَيُحِبُّهُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ فَبَاتَ النَّاسُ لَيْلَتَهُمْ أَيُّهُمْ يُعْطَى فَعَدُّوا كُلُّهُمْ بِرَجْوَةٍ فَقَالَ أَيْنَ عَلِيٌّ فَقِيلَ يَسْتَكِي عَيْنَيْهِ فَبَصَقَ فِي عَيْنَيْهِ وَدَعَا لَهُ فَبَرَأَ كَأَن لَمْ يَكُنْ بِهِ وَجَعٌ فَأَعْطَاهُ فَقَالَ أَفَاتِلُهُمْ حَتَّى يَكُونُوا مِثْلَنَا فَقَالَ انْفُذْ عَلَى رِسْلِكَ حَتَّى تَنْزِلَ بِسَاحَتِهِمْ ثُمَّ ادْعُهُمْ إِلَى الْإِسْلَامِ وَأَخْبِرْهُمْ بِمَا يَجِبُ عَلَيْهِمْ فَوَاللَّهِ لَأَنْ يَهْدِيَ اللَّهُ بِكَ رَجُلًا خَيْرٌ لَكَ مِنْ أَنْ يَكُونَ لَكَ حُمْرُ النَّعَمِ .  
صحيح البخاري ، ج 4 ، ص 20 و صحيح مسلم ، ج 7 ، ص 121 ، 122 .

**Volume 4, Book 52, Number 253:**

**Narrated Sahl:**

*On the day (of the battle) of Khaibar the Prophet said, "Tomorrow I will give the flag to somebody who will be given victory (by Allah) and who loves Allah and His Apostle and is loved by Allah and His Apostle." So, the people wondered all that night as to who would receive the flag and in the morning everyone hoped that he would be that person. Allah's Apostle asked, "Where is 'Ali?" He was told that 'Ali was suffering from eye-trouble, so he applied saliva to his eyes and invoked Allah to cure him. He at once got cured as if he had no ailment. The Prophet gave him the flag. 'Ali said, "Should I fight them till they become like us (i.e. Muslim)?" The Prophet said, "Go to them patiently and calmly till you enter the land. Then, invite them to Islam, and inform them what is enjoined upon them, for, by Allah, if Allah gives guidance to somebody through you, it is better for you than possessing red camels."*

*And ofcourse this is not the only time that the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) mentions this beautiful line for Imam Ali (as), in fact He (s) repeated this mean times in many different situations. One of the occasions that this was mentioned by the Holy Prophet (s) was when He (s) sent Imam Ali (as) to fight the disbelievers of Yaman, and before dividing the booty He (as) took a slave for Himself and others such as Khalif bin Waleed could not bear such thing, so they, because of their jealousy, thought if they complain to the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) about this, then the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) would dislike Imam Ali (as) (as), but the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) by seeing the letter of Khalid bin Waleed got very angry and said with anger:*

مَا تَرَى فِي رَجُلٍ يُحِبُّ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ وَيُحِبُّهُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ ؟

*What do you say about a man who loves Allah (SWT) and the Prophet (PBUH&HF) and Allah (SWT) and the Prophet (PBUH&HF) also love him?*

سنن الترمذي ، ج 3 ، ص 123 – 124 و ج 5 ، ص 302 – 303 و ...

**Sunan Altirmithiy (Sunnahs of (by) Altirmithy), part 3, page 123-124; part 5, page 302-303..**

*Such reply from the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) caused them to be ashamed of their action and not repeat such thing again.*

*And “فَسَوْفَ يَأْتِي اللَّهُ بِقَوْمٍ يُحِبُّهُمْ وَيُحِبُّونَهُ” which is mentioned in the Holy Quran is what the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) had used for Imam Ali (as), while all the companions, including Abu Bakr ad Umar were present in the gathering and hoped this line would have been used for them.*

*Interestingly many scholars of Ahl Sunna have recorded Umar saying how much he wished to be the person.*

*Muslim in his Sahih collection has written:*

عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ يَوْمَ خَيْبَرَ لَأُعْطِينَ هَذِهِ الرَّايَةَ رَجُلًا يُحِبُّ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ يَفْتُحُ اللَّهُ عَلَى يَدَيْهِ قَالَ عُمَرُ بْنُ الْخَطَّابِ مَا أَحْبَبْتُ الْإِمَارَةَ إِلَّا يَوْمَئِذٍ قَالَ فَتَسَاوَرْتُ لَهَا رَجَاءً أَنْ أُدْعَى لَهَا قَالَ فَدَعَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ عَلِيَّ بْنَ أَبِي طَالِبٍ فَأَعْطَاهُ إِيَّاهَا.

صحيح مسلم ، ج 7 ، ص 121 و مسند احمد ، ج 2 ، ص 384 .

*Suhail reported on the authority of Abu Huraira that Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) said on the Day of Khaibar: I shall certainly give this standard in the hand of one who loves Allah and his Messenger and Allah will grant victory at his hand. Umar b. Khattab said: Never did I cherish for leadership but on that day. I came before him with the hope that I may be called for this, but Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) called 'Ali b. Abu Talib and he conferred (this honour) upon him...*

*Sahih Muslim Book 031, Number 5917*

*Now by having this in mind, is it right to take this honour from the one who was granted it by the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF), and instead give it to someone whom the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) refused to give this honour to?*

## **B) أَذَلَّةٌ عَلَى الْمُؤْمِنِينَ (humble toward believers)**

*We can see many occasions of Abu Bakr's life where he never had this personality, but in fact he had the opposite personality and he was "humble with disbelievers and stern towards the believers". We shall only point to a few examples:*

### **1. Murdering Malik Bin Nuwayrah**

*One of the crimes which occurred during the time of Abu Bakr and in these days Ahl Sunna are proud of, is the killing of Malik bin Nuwayrah by Khalid bin Waleed by the direct order of Abu Bakr. Malik Bin Nuwayrah was a strong individual, poet and the leader of one of the groups of the Bani Tamim clan. He was a companion of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) and was a great help to the Holy Prophet (s) and in occasions he was very well known for his help towards the orphans and widow women, and by the authority he had from the Holy Prophet, he would distribute the gathered Zakat amongst the needy people.*

*Khalid bin Waleed by the order of Abu Bakr moved towards the clan of Malik and when he reached Batah, he ordered Darar bin Azwar (ضرار بن أزور) and some of his men to go to the clan of Malik and bring them to him. when Abu Qatade reached the clan of Malik they attacked them. Later on when he was asked about it, he said: we told them drop your weapons if you're truthful about being a Muslim, they accepted this offer, dropped their weapons and started to pray.*

*Tabari, the famous historian of Ahl Sunna has written about this:*

وكان ممن شهد لمالك بالاسلام أبو قتادة الحارث بن ربيع أخو بني سلمة وقد كان عاهد الله أن لا يشهد مع خالد بن الوليد حربا أبدا بعدها وكان يحدث أنهم لما غشوا القوم راعوهم تحت الليل فأخذ القوم السلاح قال فقلنا إنا المسلمون فقالوا ونحن المسلمون قلنا فما بال السلاح معكم قالوا لنا فما بال السلاح معكم قلنا فان كنتم كما تقولون فضعوا السلاح قال فوضعوها ثم صلينا وصلوا .

تاريخ الطبري ، الطبري ، ج 2 ، ص 503  
*The History of Altabari, Altabari, part 2, page 503.*

*Amongst those who testified Malik bin Nuwayrah was a Muslim is Abu Qutaada, the brother of Bani Sulme. He made an oath with Allah (SWT) that after this event, he will never participate in any battles along side Khalid bin Waleed and he would say when we were near them, we moved towards them the same night. They had weapons in hand and said we are Muslims, we also said we are Muslims too. We said: so why do you have weapons in hand? They replied because of us (because of fear we had of you) and they said: why do you have weapons in hand? We said: if it is as you say (that you are Muslims) then drop your weapons; they dropped their weapons and we all prayed.*

*And Ibn Hajjar 'Asghalani writes:*

فكان أبو قتادة ممن شهد انهم أذنوا وأقاموا الصلاة وصلوا فحبس بهم خالد في ليلة باردة ثم أمر مناديا فنادى أذفئوا أساركم وهي في لغة كناية عن القتل فقتلوهم وتزوج خالد بعد ذلك امرأة مالك .  
الإصابة ، ابن حجر ، ج 5 ، ص 560 – 561 .

*Abu Qutaada is amongst those who testified they recited Adhan and prayed, but Khalid took them as captives in a cold night and he ordered someone to cry (ادفئوا), warm up your prisoners. But based on some translations means to kill. So they killed them and then Khalid married the wife of Malik!*

*Al'isaaba, Ibn Hhijr, part 5, page 560-561*

*Almuttaqi Alhindi writes(متقي هندي):*

عن أبي عون وغيره أن خالد بن الوليد ادعى أن مالك بن نويرة ارتد بكلام بلغه عنه ، فأنكر مالك ذلك ، وقال : أنا على الاسلام ما غيرت ولا بدلت وشهد له بذلك أبو قتادة وعبد الله بن عمر فقدمه خالد وأمر ضرار بن الأزور الأسدي فضرب عنقه ، وقبض خالد امرأته ، فقال لأبي بكر : إنه قد زنى فارجمه ، فقال أبو بكر : ما كنت لأرجمه تأول فأخطأ ، قال : فإنه قد قتل مسلما فاقتله قال : ما كنت لأقتله تأول فأخطأ ، قال : فاعزله ، قال : ما كنت لاشيم سيفاً سله الله عليهم أبدا . ( ابن سعد ) .

كنز العمال ، المتقي الهندي ، ج 5 ، ص 619 .

*Kanz Al'ummaal (The Treasure of Workers), Almuttaqi Alhindi, part 5, page 619.*

*It has been narrated by Abi 'Aoun and others that Khalid bin Waleed claimed that Malik has told him something and he has turned apostate, but he had said: I am a follower of Islam, and I have not changed it; and Abu Qutaada and AbduAllah bin Umar has also testified to this; But Khalid brought him forward and ordered Daraar bin Al'Azwar to behead him. Khalid also took his (Mali's) wife. So Umar said to Abu Bakr: he has committed Zina! Stone him to death! Abu Bakr answered: I will not stone him to death! He has practiced Ijtihad and made a wrong judgment. He (Umar) said: then kill him as he has killed a Muslim. He (Abu Bakr) answered: I will not kill him, as he has practiced Ijtihad and has committed an error!  
He (Umar) said: so take his authority (you have given him), He (Abu Bakr) replied, I will not take away the sword that Allah (SWT) has given him.*

**And Bukhari writes in his Sahih collection:**

فَقَامَ رَجُلٌ غَائِرُ الْعَيْنَيْنِ مُشْرِفُ الْوَجْنَتَيْنِ نَاشِزُ الْجَبْهَةِ كَثُ اللَّحْيَةِ مَحْلُوقُ الرَّأْسِ مُشَمَّرُ الْإِزَارِ فَقَالَ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ اتَّقِ اللَّهَ قَالَ وَيْلَكَ أَوْلَسْتُ أَحَقَّ أَهْلِ الْأَرْضِ أَنْ يَتَّقِيَ اللَّهَ قَالَ نُمُّ وَلِيَ الرَّجُلُ قَالَ خَالِدُ بْنُ الْوَلِيدِ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ أَلَا أُضْرِبُ عُنُقَهُ قَالَ لَا لَعَلَّهُ أَنْ يَكُونَ يُصَلِّي فَقَالَ خَالِدٌ وَكَمْ مِنْ مُصَلٍّ يَقُولُ بِلِسَانِهِ مَا لَيْسَ فِي قَلْبِهِ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ إِنِّي لَمْ أَوْمَرَ أَنْ أَنْقُبَ عَنْ قُلُوبِ النَّاسِ وَلَا أَشَقَّ بُطُونَهُمْ  
صحيح البخاري ، البخاري ، ج 5 ، ص 110 – 111

**Volume 5, Book 59, Number 638:**

*There got up a man with sunken eyes, raised cheek bones, raised forehead, a thick beard, a shaven head and a waist sheet that was tucked up and he said, "O Allah's Apostle! Be afraid of Allah." The Prophet said, "Woe to you! Am I not of all the people of the earth the most entitled to fear Allah?" Then that man went away. Khalid bin Al-Wahd said, "O Allah's Apostle! Shall I chop his neck off?" The Prophet said, "No, for he may offer prayers." Khalid said, "Numerous are those who offer prayers and say by their tongues (i.e. mouths) what is not in their hearts." Allah's Apostle said, "I have not been ordered (by Allah) to search the hearts of the people or cut open their bellies."*

*There is no doubt that Maalik Bin Nuwayrah had not left Islam, as he himself cried out he is a Muslim and that he has not changed any of Allah (SWT)'s laws. Abu Qatade and AbuAllah bin Umar had also testified he was a Muslim; but reality is that Maalik Bin Nuwayrah was not murdered because of becoming apostate or not paying Zakat, rather the ill eyes of Khalid bin Waleed had witnessed the beautiful wife of Maalik, and this caused him to decide to kill Maalik and all the members of his clan.*

**Ibn Hhijr Alsghalani writes about this:**

أن خالدا رأى امرأة مالك وكانت فائقة في الجمال ، فقال مالك بعد ذلك لامرأته : قتلتييني يعني سأقتل من أهلك .  
الإصابة ، ابن حجر ، ج 5 ، ص 561 .

**Al'isaaba, Ibn Hhijr, part 5, page 561.**

*Khalid had seen the beauty of Maalik's wife, so Maalik said to his wife, you have killed me, meaning I will be killed because of you.*

**Also Abu Alfidaa' and Ibn Khalkan (ابو الفداء و ابن خلكان) have written in their History/Tarikh:**

وكان عبد الله بن عمر وأبو قتادة الانصاري حاضرين فكلمنا خالدا في أمره فكره كلامهما . فقال مالك : يا خالد : ابعتنا إلى أبي بكر فيكون هو الذي يحكم فينا فإنك بعثت إليه غيرنا ممن جرمه أكبر من جرمنا . فقال خالد : لا أقالني الله إن أفلتت . وتقدم إلى ضرار بن الأزور بضرب عنقه . فالتفت مالك إلى زوجته وقال لخالد : هذه التي قتلنتي . وكانت في غاية الجمال . فقال خالد : بل الله قتلتك برجوعك عن الاسلام . فقال مالك : أنا على الاسلام . فقال خالد : يا ضرار اضرب عنقه ، فضرب عنقه . تاريخ أبي الفداء ص 158 ، وفيات الاعيان 5 / 66 بترجمة وثيمة وقد ذكر ذلك ابن شحنة في تاريخه ص 114 من هامش الكامل ج 11 وفي فوات الوفيات 2 / 627 ، عن ردة ابن وثيمة وردة الواقدي .

*Taareekh Abi Alfidaa' (History of Abi Alfidaa'), page 158;  
Wafiyyaat Al'a'yaan 5/66 in a themed translation;  
Ibn Shihhna, Taareekh Ibn Shihhna (History of Ibn Shihhna), page 114 from Haamish Alkaamil part 11 and in Fawaat Alwafiyyaat 2/627, according to*

*AbduAllah bin Umar and Abu Qatade Ansari were present there and were talking to Khalid about Maalik, but Khalid did not accept their sayings, so Malik said: O Khalid! Send me to Abu Bakr so he would judge between us, as you have sent others who has a crime greater than us to him. Khalid replied: May Allah (SWT) not forgive me if I forgive you! Then he took him to Diraar bin Alazwar (ضرار بن الأزور) to behead him.*

*Also Ya'qobi writes in his history/tarikh:*

فأتاه مالك بن نويرة يناظره واتبعته امرأته فلما رآها أعجبته فقال : والله ما نلت ما في مثابتك حتى أقتلك .  
تاريخ اليعقوبي ، ج 2 ، ص 110.

*Taareekh Alya'qoobi (History of Alya'qoobi), part 2, page 110*

*Maalik Bin Nuwayrah came to him in order to talk, his wife also followed him. When Khalid saw his wife he was amazed and said: By Allah (SWT)! I will not have what you posses unless I kill you!*

*And Khalid bin Waleed, disgracefully slept with Mali's wife in the very same night. Yaqubi writes in his history:*

وتزوج خالد بامرأة مالك ، أم تميم بنت المنهل ، في تلك الليلة.  
تاريخ اليعقوبي ، ج 2 ، ص 110 .

*Taareekh Alya'qoobi (History of Alya'qoobi), part 2, page 110*

*And Khalid married the wife of Maalik, Umm Tamim dugahter of Manhal, in the very same night.*

*But Abu Bakr, instead of punishing Khalid bin Waleed, supports him and accepts all of his actions and says he was a Mujtahid and committed an error in his judgment!*

*Tabari has narrated the story in this manner:*

وقال عمر لأبي بكر إن في سيف خالد رهقا فإن لم يكن هذا حقا حق عليه أن تقيده وأكثر عليه في ذلك وكان أبو بكر لا يقيد من عماله ولا وزعته فقال هيه يا عمر تأول فأخطأ فارفع لسانك عن خالد .  
تاريخ الطبري ، ج 2 ، ص 503 و الكامل في التاريخ ، ابن الأثير ، ج 2 ، ص 358 – 359 و وفيات الأعيان وأنباء أبناء الزمان ، ابن خلكان ، ج 6 ، ص 15 و تاريخ الإسلام ، الذهبي ، ج 3 ، ص 36 – 37 و إمتاع الأسماع ، المقرئ ، ج 14 ، ص 239 و كنز العمال ، المتقي الهندي ، ج 5 ، ص 619 و ... .



*And Umar said to Abu Bakr: Khalid's sword has shed much blood, if it was not out of justice, then it is just to punish him, and do it profusely, but Abu Bakr doesn't punish his workers nor his close ones, so he told Umar: Oh Umar, The guy (Khalid) judged but erred, so stop talking (wrongly) about Khalid.*

*History of Tabari, part 2, page 503; The complete in History, Ibn Al Atheer, part 2, pages 358-9; Wafiyyat Al A'yaan, Ibn Khalkaan, part 6, page 15; History of Islam, Althahabi, part 3, pages 36-7; Imtaa' Al Asmaa' (Entertainment of hearings), Al Muqreezi, part 14, page 239; Kanz Al Ummaal, Almuttaqi Alhindi, part 15 page 619... etc*

*The interesting point here is that there is a huge dispute between the first and second khalif. Umar bin Khattab views Khalid as a sinner who commits zina and murder; while Abu Bakr recognizes him as the sword of Allah (SWT) and a Mujtahid!*

فلما بلغ قتلهم عمر بن الخطاب تكلم فيه عند أبي بكر فأكثر وقال عدو الله عدا على امرئ مسلم فقتله ثم زنا على امرأته .

تاريخ الطبري ، ج 2 ، ص 504

*The History of Altabari, part 2, page 504*

*When the news of his murder reached Umar, he spoke with Abu Bakr about it and said: the enemy of Allah (SWT) has attacked a Muslim man and killed him, and then has slept with his wife!*

*Tabari has also written:*

وأقبل خالد بن الوليد قافلاً حتى دخل المسجد وعليه قباء له عليه صدأ الحديد معتجراً بعمامة له قد غرز في عمامته أسهما فلما أن دخل المسجد قام إليه عمر فانتزع الأسهم من رأسه فحطمها ثم قال أرئاء قتلت امرءاً مسلماً ثم زنوت على امرأته والله لأرجمنك بأحجارك .

تاريخ الطبري ، ج 2 ، ص 503 – 504 و الكامل في التاريخ ، ج 2 ، ص 359 و إمتاع الأسماع ، المقرئزي ، ج 14 ، ص 239 – 240 و ....

*The History of Altabari, part 2, page 503-504;*

*Alkaamil fi Altaareekh (The Complete in History), part 2, page 359*

*'Imtaa'u Al'asmaa' (Pleasing of Hearings), Almuqreezee, part 14, page 239-240*

*etc...*

*Khalid bin walid entered the mosque without attention, he was wearing a cloak which had the marks of sword and there were arrows in it, so when he entered the mosque, Umar got up and took the arrows out of his cloak and broke them, he then said: are you fooling us? You have killed a Muslim man and have slept with his wife, by Allah (SWT) I will stone you with the stone which you have created yourself.*

*But Abu Bakr reacts very calmly to this and with kindness approves what Khalid had done and he relates his actions to Allah (SWT) and says:*

*I will never put away a sword which Allah (SWT) has brought out*

فقال : [ هيه ] يا عمر ! تأول فأخطأ فارفع لسانك عن خالد فإنني لا أشيم سيفاً سله الله على الكافرين .  
الكامل في التاريخ ، ابن الأثير ، ج 2 ، ص 358 – 359 .

**Alkaamil fi Altaareekh (The complete in History), Ibn Al'attheer, part 2, page 358-359**

**He said: Oh Umar! The guy (Khalid) judged and erred, so stop talking (wrongly) about Khalid, i never return a sword that has been drawn against the unbelievers to its sheath.**

**Had Allah (SWT) allowed Abu Bakr to kill a Muslim in such manner only because he was distributing the Zakat between his clan and use his head as fuel of fire and sleep with his wife while her Ida was not yet over?**

**And couldn't the same excuse of "error in judgment" be applied for Malik? If Khalid is to be considered a Mujtahid, then Malik should also be considered as a Mujtahid. Was Khalid the only one who could practice Ijtihad and Malik was not allowed to? What difference is there between not giving Zakat to Abu Bakr and committing Zina? Is the crime of not giving Zakat to Abu Bakr higher than killing innocent and committing Zina?**

**Malik never said he will not pay Zakat and paying Zakat is not obligatory, rather he did not accept the leadership of Abu Bakr and didn't want to pay zakat to him and he continued to distribute the Zakat just like he used to do during the life of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF)**

**Ibn Hhijir AlAsghalani writes:**

وكان النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم استعمله على صدقات قومه فلما بلغته وفاة النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم أمسك الصدقة وفرقها في قومه وقال في ذلك .

**الأصلية ، ابن حجر ، ج 5 ، ص 560 .**

**Al'isaaba, Ibn Hhijr, part 5, page 560.**

**The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) had made him responsible for collecting Zakat from his clan, when the news of Allah (SWT)'s Messenger's (PBUH&HF) death reached him, he kept the Zakat, distributed it amongst his clan and left this (assignment).**

**Even if he had refused to pay Zakat, then by which authority was he killed? If anyone refused to pay Zakat, should he and all the members of his clan be killed, and their women should be taken as slaves?**

**Isn't such behaviour in contradiction which the Islamic teachings? Had such murder took place during the life of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF)?**

**Worse case is that, just like Khalid and other companions, he has practiced Ijtihad and was wrong in his judgment, did he deserve to be murdered in such horrible way, and have his head used as the fuel of fire?**

**Tabari writes:**



كان مالك بن نويرة من أكثر الناس شعرا وإن أهل العسكر أنفوا برؤوسهم القدور فما منهم رأس إلا وصلت النار إلى بشرته ما خلا مالكا فان القدر نضجت وما نضج رأسه من كثرة شعره  
تاريخ الطبري ، الطبري ، ج 2 ، ص 503 .

**The History of Altabari, Altabari, part 2 , page 503.**

*Malik Bin Nuwayrah was of those men with a lot of hair on his head, the soldiers used the (cut off) heads as stands for their cooking pot, and fire reached the skin of all the heads, except the head of Malik as the food in the pot was cooked before fire reached the skin of Malik (as he had a lot of hair).*

**Abu Na'im Isfahani also writes:**

عن ابن شهاب : أن مالك بن نويرة كان من أكثر الناس شعرا ، وأن خالد لما قتله أمر برأسه فجعل أثفية يقدر فنضج فيها قبل أن تبلغ النار إلى شواته .  
الأغاني ، ج 15 ، ص 239 .

**Al'aghaani (The Songs), part 15, page 239**

*It has been narrated from Ibn Shahab that Malik Bin Nuwayrah was amongst those men who had a lot of hair (on his head), and when Khaleed killed him, he ordered his head to be used as the stand for the cooking pot, and the food in the pot got ready before fire reached his skin.*

**Can a person who kills the great Sahabi of the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) in such horrible way only because he was wrong in his Ijtihad (based on the belief of Ahl Sunna that all Companions are Mujtahids) and takes Muslim women as slaves be considered among the (أَذِلَّةٌ عَلَى الْمُؤْمِنِينَ) "lowly with the Believers" (5:54) Nauzubillah!**

**Is it possible that Allah (SWT) would give glad tidings for the arrival of such group?**

## **2) Burning of Faja'e (فجائه)**

**One of the actions of the first Khalif which happened during the last years of his life, which he highly regretted was killing the Iyaas bin AbduAllah (إياس بن عبد الله), known as "Faja'e", who was burnt alive.**

**It is true that it's been written Faja'e, instead of fighting against the apostates became a thief, and this itself has its own arguments; but he was not an apostate or a kaffir, and the fact that the Abu Bakr feels guilty for what he has done shows what he did was wrong. Abu Bakr had a duty to analyse his crimes and judge him based on the laws of Sharia, rather he chose to burn him alive without questioning him.**

**So our question to Ahl Sunna is that is it possible to believe Allah (SWT) would give glad tidings for the arrival of such man who kills Muslims in such horrible ways?**

**Can such person be considered as (أَذِلَّةٌ عَلَى الْمُؤْمِنِينَ) "lowly with the Believers" (5:54)?**

## **3) Planning the assassination of Imam Ali (as)**

**Sam'ani (سمعاني), one of the great scholars of Ahl Sunna writes:**

وروى عنه (يعقوب الرواجني شيخ البخاري) حديث أبي بكر رضي الله عنه : أنّه قال : «لا يفعل خالد ما أمر به». سألت الشريف عمر ابن إبراهيم الحسيني بالكوفة عن معنى هذا الأثر فقال : كان أمر خالد بن الوليد أن يقتل عليّاً ، ثم ندم بعد ذلك ، فنهى عن ذلك.

الأنساب ، ج 3 ، ص 95 ، ط دار الجنان ، بيروت و ج 6 ، ج 170 ، نشر محمد أمين دمج ، بيروت ، 1400 هـ .

*Al'ansaab (The Relations), part 3, page 95, publisher: Daar Aljinaan, Beirut; and part 6, page 170, publisher: Muhammad Ameen Damaj, Beirut, 1400 H.*

*It has been narrated from him (Ya'qoob Rawajni [يعقوب رواجني] the teacher of Bukhari) the words of Abu Bakr as he said "Khalid, do not do what you've been ordered to do". I asked Umar bin Ibrahim Hussaini in Kufa about the meaning of this. He replied "He had ordered Khalid to kill Ali (as), but he regretted this so he ordered him (Khalid) not to do it."*

*What is interesting is that Sam'ani after narrating the hadith remains silent, and this shows he considered the hadith to be authentic, otherwise he would had narrated it and then refuted it. Can someone who plans the assassination of Amirul Mu'menin Ali (as) in the house of God and during prayer, be considered as (أَذَلَّةٌ عَلَى الْمُؤْمِنِينَ) "lowly with the Believers" (5:54)? Nauzubillah Is it possible that Allah (SWT) would give glad tidings for the arrival of such man to the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) and the Belivers?*

#### **4. The regrets during the last days of his life:**

*We would like to ask the brothers of Ahl Sunna, that if this Holy Verse was truly sent for Abu Bakr and he himself was aware of this, then why did he regret his actions during his last days? In other words, he was someone who loved Allah (SWT) and the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF), and Allah (SWT) and the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) loved him too, then why does he feel guilty during the last days of his life?*

*During the last days of his life, Abu Bakr makes the following wishes:*

إني لا آسى على شيء من الدنيا إلا على ثلاث فعلتھن وددت أني تركتھن ، وثلاث تركتھن وددت أني فعلتھن وثلاث وددت أني سألت عنھن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم.

فأما الثلاث اللاتي وددت أني تركتھن، فوددت أني لم أكشف بيت فاطمة عن شيء وإن كانوا قد غلقوه على الحرب، ووددت أني لم أكن حرقت الفجاءة السلمي وأنني كنت قتلتة سريحاً أو خلّيته نجيحاً ...

تاريخ الطبري، ج 2، ص 619، تاريخ الإسلام للذهبي، ج 3، ص 117، مجمع الزوائد، ج 5، ص 202، المعجم الكبير، ج 1، ص 62، كنز العمال، ج 6، ص 631، تاريخ دمشق، ج 30، ص 419، لسان الميزان، ج 4، ص 189 و...

*I have nothing against this world, except that I wish I hadn't done three things which I did, and I would had done three things which I did not do, and three things which I should had asked of Allah (SWT)'s Messenger (PBUH&HF)*

*And as for those three things which I wish I had not done; I wish I hadn't broke into the house of Fatima (as), even if they had closed it on (intention of) war, and I wish I had not burnt Al Fajaa'a, and that I had killed him easily, or that I had released him...*

*The History of Altabari, part 2, page 619;*

*Althahabi's History of Islam, part 3, page 117;  
Mujammas Alzawaa'id (The Compilation of Provisions), part 5, page 202;  
Almu'jam Alkabir (The Great Theasaurus), part 1, page 62;  
Kanz Al'ummaal (The Treasure of Workers), part 6, page 631, Hadith no. 14113;  
Taareekh Dimashq (History of Damascus), part 30, page 419;  
Lisaan Almeezan (The Scale's Tongue), part 4, page 189. etc...*

**These wishes of Abu Bakr during the last moments of his lifes are exactly what Allah (SWT) mentions in the Holy Quran, Allah (SWT) says:**

حَتَّىٰ إِذَا جَاءَ أَحَدَهُمُ الْمَوْتُ قَالَ رَبِّ ارْجِعُونِ . لَعَلِّي أَعْمَلُ صَالِحًا فِيمَا تَرَكْتُ كَلَّا إِنَّهَا كَلِمَةٌ هُوَ قَائِلُهَا وَمِنْ وَرَائِهِمْ بَرْزَخٌ إِلَىٰ يَوْمِ يُبْعَثُونَ . المؤمنون / 99 \_ 100 .

**Until when death overtakes one of them, he says: Send me back, my Lord, send me back; Haply I may do good in that which I have left. By no means! it is a (mere) word that he speaks; and before them is a barrier until the day they are raised.**

**23:99-100**

**Surly Allah (SWT) gave a lot of opportunities to Abu Bakr and the likes of him so they could do great things in this life, but they turned from good deeds and chose the wrong path, and when they see the promise of Allah (SWT) is true, they then ask Allah (SWT) and wish they could go back and not do the wrong things they did and follow the right path, but Allah (SWT) says in return to them (كَلَّا إِنَّهَا كَلِمَةٌ هُوَ قَائِلُهَا) "By no means! it is a (mere) word that he speaks" (23:100)**

## **5. The Shaitan that always tricked him**

**One of the facts that Abu Bakr admitted to is the point which shows there is a Shaitan which is always tricking him.**

**This is such a strong factor that there are no doubts in it and many books of Ahl Sunna have narrated it. Amongst them, AbdulRazaq San'ani (عبد الرزاق صنعاني) narrates from Abu Bakr:**

أما والله ما أنا بخيركم ، ولقد كنت لمقامي هذا كارها ، ولوددت لو أن فيكم من يكفيني ، فتظنون أنني أعمل فيكم سنة رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إذا لا أقوم لها ، إن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم كان يعصم بالوحي ، وكان معه ملك ، وإن لي شيطانا يعتريني ، فإذا غضبت فاجتنبوني ، لا أؤثر في أشعاركم ولا أبشاركم ، ألا فراعوني ! فإن استقمت فأعينوني ، . إن زغت فقوموني .

المصنف ، عبد الرزاق الصنعاني ، ج 11 ، ص 336 و الطبقات الكبرى ، محمد بن سعد ، ج 3 ، ص 212 و تاريخ الطبري ، الطبري ، ج 2 ، ص 460 و البداية والنهاية ، ابن كثير ، ج 6 ، ص 334 و تفسير أبي السعود ، أبي السعود ، ج 3 ، ص 308 و تفسير النسفي ، النسفي ، ج 2 ، ص 52 و تمهيد الأوائل وتلخيص الدلائل ، الباقلاني ، ص 492 و الكشف عن حقائق التنزيل و عيون الأقاويل ، الزمخشري ، ج 2 ، شرح ص 139 و كنز العمال ، المتقي الهندي ، ج 5 ، ص 590 و شرح نهج البلاغة ، ابن أبي الحديد ، ج 17 ، ص 156 و ... .

*By Allah im not the best among you, and i was reluctant in (taking) my position(as calipha), i wished that there was among you who can relief me (in taking my place), and you believe that i am acting upon the sunnah(way) of the prophet(PBUH&HF) when im not up to it, the prophet (PBUH&HF) decreed by revelation, and he had an angel with him, and i have a devil (closely) following me, so if i get angry, avoid me, i wouldn't trade away your poems nor feelings for me, therefore support me, and if i straighten up, help me (with your support), and if i lean (go astray) straighten me up.*

*Almunsif (The Justifier), Abdul Razzaaq Alsan'aani, part 11, page 336;  
Altabaqaat Alkubraa (The Great Layers), Muhammad Bin Saad, part 3, page 212;  
Taareekh Altabari (The History of Tabari), Altabari, part 2, page 460;  
Albidaaya wa Alnihaaya (The Beginning and the End), Ibn Katheer, part 6, page 334;  
Tafseer Abi Al Saud(Abi Al Saud's Interpretation), Abi Al Saud, part 3, page 308;  
Tafseer Alnasfi(Alnasfi's Interpretation), Alnasfi, part 2, page 52;  
Tamheed Al'awaa'il wa Takhlees Aldalaa'il, Albaaqlaani, page 492;  
Alkishaaf 'an Haqa'iq Altanzeel wa 'uyoon Al'aaqaaweel, Alzamakshari, part 2, the interpretation of page 139;  
Kanz Al'ummaal (Treasure of Workers), Almuttaqi Alhindi, part 5, page 590;  
Sharh Nahj Albalaagha (The Interpretation of 'The Peak of Eloquence'), Ibn Abi Alhadeed, part 17, page 156  
etc...*

**Could a man who always has a shaitan following him be loved by Allah (SWT) and his Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF)?**

**Would it be right to say Allah (SWT) gave us glad tidings for the arrival of such man?**

### **C) Stern toward disbelievers ( أَعَزَّةٌ عَلَى الْكَافِرِينَ )**

**History testifies that Abu Bakr was never "stern toward disbelievers", as there are no reports in history that Abu Bakr had ever defended the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF), never mind fighting the disbelievers, such as the disbelievers of Qurays or the Jews. In fact there has been very little situations where Abu Bakr, alongside his two companions, Umar and thman, hadn't flee from battles. The battles of Khaibar, Uhud and Hunain are the best examples of this.**

**Ibn Abi Hadid writes in his Shahr Nahjul Balagha, Volume 13, page 293:**

قال شيخنا أبو جعفر رحمه الله اما ثباته يوم أحد فأكثر المؤرخين وأرباب السير ينكرونه ، وجمهورهم يروى انه لم يبق مع النبي صلى الله عليه وآله الا على وطلحة والزبير ، وأبو دجانة ، وقد روى عن ابن عباس أنه قال ولهم خامس وهو عبد الله بن مسعود ، ومنهم من أثبت سادسا ، وهو المقداد بن عمرو ، وروى يحيى بن سلمة بن كهيل قال قلت لأبي كم ثبت مع رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله يوم أحد فقال اثنتان ، قلت من هما قال علي وأبو دجانة .

*Our teacher, Abu Ja'far, May Allah (SWT)'s blessings be upon him, said: the majority of historians and writes have denied his (Abu Bakr's) stand in the battle of Uhud, and the majority of them say there was no one left with Allah (SWT)'s Messenger (PBUH&HF) except Ali (as), Talha, Zubair and Abu Dajaanah. It has been narrated from Ibn Abbas that another man also remained (with the Prophet [s]) and he is AbdulAllah bin Mas'ood. Others also include another man and he is Miqdad bin A'mro. It has also been narrated from Yahia bin Salma bin Kuhail who said "I asked my father how many reminded with the Prophet (s) on the day of Uhud, and he replied: 2 men, Ali (as) and Abu Danjaanah.*

ابن أبي الحديد شرح نهج البلاغة ، ج 13 ، ص 293

*Ibn Abi Alhadeed, Sarh Nahj Albalaagha (The Interpretation of 'The peak of Eloquence'), part 13, page 293.*

*Al'eijee (الإيجي) in Almawaaqif (المواقف) writes:*

روي أنه صلى الله عليه وسلم بعث أبا بكر أولاً فرجع منهزماً وبعث عمر فرجع كذلك فغضب النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم لذلك فلما أصبح خرج إلى الناس ومعه راية فقال ( لأعطين . . ) إلى آخره .

المواقف ، الإيجي ، ج 3 ، ص 634 و شرح المواقف ، القاضي الجرجاني ، ج 8 ، ص 369 .

*Almawaaqif, Al'eijee, part 3, page 634 ;*

*Alqaadi Aljurjaani, Sharh Almawaaqif (Interpretation of Stances), part 8, page 369.*

*It has been narrated from the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) that He (s) sent Abu Bakr (for the battle of Khaibar), but he lost and returned, He (s) sent Umar and the same thing happened; so RasuAllah was angered by this. When He (s) came out in the morning, He (s) was carrying the flag and he said: I will give the flag to...*

*Also Ibn Abi alHadid narrates from his teacher, AbuJa'far Askafi:*

لم يرم ابوبكر بسهم قط و لاسل سيفاً و لا اراق دمأ

شرح نهج البلاغة ج 13:281 ط دار إحياء الكتب العربية بيروت – العثمانية للجاحظ ص 330 ط دار الكتب العربي مصر

*Sharh Nahj Albalaagha (Interpretation of The Peak of Eloquence), part 13:281, publisher: Daar 'Ihyaa' Alkutub Al'arabiyya – Beirut;*

*Aljaahith, Al'uthmaaniyya, page 330, publisher: Daar Alkutub Al'arabiy (Thr Foundation of the Arabic Book) - Egypt*

*Abu Bakr never threw an arrow, neither did he take any sword out, nor did he shed any bloods.*

*Therefore when Ibn Taymmia realizes that none of the 3 Khalifs were successful in any battles, nor did they kill any disbeliever during those battles, he tries to bring reasoning for this:*

والقتال يكون بالدعاء كما يكون باليد قال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم هل ترزقون وتتصرون إلا بضغائنكم بدعائهم وصلاتهم وإخلاصهم.

منهاج السنة ، ج 4 ، ص 482.

*Manaahij Alsunnah (The Sunnah Methods), part4, page 482.*

*Battles is at times by Dua (Prayer), just like it is at times by hand. The Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) said: isn't it that your sustenance given to you, and your victory granted because of the (physically) weak among you, with their supplications, prayers, and loyalty.*

*Maybe Abu Bakr had defeated the enemies by his Duas, and therefore we should attribute all the victories of the battles such as Badr, Khaibar, Khandaq, Hunain and etc to him?! After all, it was him who was sat somewhere away from the battle field and prayed for victory over the enemies!*

*Therefore Ibn Taymmia alters the meaning of "bravery" and says:*

إذا كانت الشجاعة المطلوبة من الأئمة شجاعة القلب، فلا ريب أن أبا بكر كان أشجع من عمر، وعمر أشجع من عثمان وعلي وطلحة والزبير، وكان يوم بدر مع النبي في العريش .  
منهاج السنة ، ج 8 ، ج 79 .

*Manaahij Alsunnah (The Sunnah Methods), part 8, page 79.*

*If the bravery of leaders is the bravery in their heart, then Abu Bakr was braver than Umar and Umar was braver than Uthman, Ali (as), Talha and Zubayr, and he (Abu Bakr), was sat in the tent with the Holy Prophet (PBUH&HF) in the battle of Badr!*

*In this cases bravery should have 2 parts:*

*The bravery which all Arabs understand to be bravery*

*The bravery which only Ibn Taymmia sees to be bravery, and that is the bravery in their hearts!*

*So our question to Ibn Taymmia is that if Abu Bakr was braver than everyone else (in heart) then why did he flee from the battles of Khaybar, Uhud and Hunain? Can "bravery" and "fleeing" from battles be put under the same category?*